

Systematic Literature Review: Indonesia Halal Tourism Priority Destinations

Dina Hariani

Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata Bogor, Department of Tourism, 16113 Bogor, Indonesia

Mohd Hafiz Hanafiah

Faculty of Hotel and Tourism Management, Universiti Teknologi MARA, 42300 Puncak Alam,
Selangor, Malaysia

Hendri Azwar

Faculty of Hotel and Tourism, Universitas Negeri Padang, 25131 Padang, Indonesia
Corresponding Author Email: bhi.dinahariani@gmail.com

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i5/17052> DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v13-i5/17052

Published Date: 05 May 2023

Abstract

As a nation with the largest Muslim population in the world, Indonesia is actively developing Halal tourism destinations since Halal tourism has become popular in the tourism world because of its great potential. In 2016 Indonesia began to actively promote Halal tourism and participate in the world's Halal tourism awards, Indonesia was also included in the top 10 OIC countries based on the crescent rating as a Halal tourist destination. The author is looking for research with the object of research in 10 Halal tourist destinations in Indonesia and also publications in 5 super priority destinations in Indonesia. Using a systematic literature method with the help of advanced search from Google Scholar, the author searched for journals with titles using the words Halal, Halal tourism, and research locations published between 2017 until 2022. From the research results, unfortunately, research on Halal tourism in priority destinations in Indonesia is still very minimal. Most of the existing research is published in local journals and not international or indexed publications.

Keywords: Halal Tourism, Indonesia, Destinations, Muslim, Systematic Literature

Introduction

International tourism began to rise in the middle of 2022, borders between countries have been opened, and PCR tests are not applied to tourists who have implemented vaccines. Countries began to receive foreign tourist visits for vacation. According to UNWTO (2022) since April 2022, there have been 8 countries that are not fully vaccinated - lifting of restrictions. Indonesia itself as of October 2022 is still included in the partially restrictive country category because it applies a tourist regulation that must show a full vaccine

certificate when arriving in Indonesia. Although there are still restrictions, the number of foreign tourists coming to Indonesia at the beginning of 2022 showed a significant increase compared to the previous year

Table 1

International Tourist Arrivals by Month (2022)

Month	Number
January	143,578
February	18,455
March	40,790
April	111,057
May	212,332
June	345,438
July	476,970

According to the table above, it is clearly that the number of foreign tourist arrival to Indonesia began to exceed 100 thousand people in April 2022 and the number continued to increase until July 2022 which reached 476,970 tourists. Seeing the increasing trend in the number of foreign tourists, the Indonesian Ministry of Tourism has begun to implement strategies to attract foreign tourists to Indonesia, one of which is by promoting the Five Super Priority Destinations of Indonesia. The five super-priority tourist destinations launched by the Indonesia Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (Kemenparekraf) include Borobudur, Lake Toba, Likupang, Mandalika, and Labuan Bajo. The Indonesian government has finally combined its Muslim-friendly Indonesia campaign with five super Indonesian tourist destinations by launching New Bali Attractions: Muslim Friendly Tourism Guide Book in 5 Favorite Destinations (Lake Toba - Borobudur - Mandalika - Labuan Bajo - Likupang), 2021 officially in September 2022.

According to Global Muslim Travel Index data from 2016 until 2019, Indonesia has increased its ranking every year since 2016 as the top 10 Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) destination country. In 2016, Indonesia was ranked fourth, ranked third in 2017, ranked second in 2018, and ranked first in 2019 with Malaysia as a Muslim-friendly tourism destination in the OIC country. Although the pandemic has devastated the tourism sector, in terms of Muslim-friendly facilities and services, the foundations that the destination has laid down for several years remain poised to be activated when travel reopens. Some destinations continue to drive stakeholder awareness, capacity building, and destination marketing to the Muslim outbound market even during the pandemic. Malaysia remains the top-ranked destination in GMTI 2021 in contrast to Indonesia, dropping to rank four.

Indonesian Halal Tourism Acceleration and Development Team (IMTI, 2019) has identified ten provinces in Indonesia for Halal tourism development. There are three provinces located on the island of Sumatra, namely Aceh, West Sumatra, Riau and Riau Islands. There are five provinces on the island of Java, namely West Java, Yogyakarta, DKI Jakarta, Central Java, and East Java. On the island of Sulawesi, there is only one, namely South Sulawesi, which is centered in Makassar and its surroundings.

Indonesia has a wide area of destinations that attracts researchers to conduct research on potential destinations. Halal research itself is booming so many researchers are conducting research in Indonesia. The author finds out how many researchers were conducting research in Indonesia based on the top ten destinations announced by the government compared to

the five super-priority destinations developed by the government. The Indonesian government itself uses the term Muslim-friendly for its guidebooks so that later it will also be seen whether researchers who research areas in Indonesia use Muslim-friendly terms or Halal terms in their research.

Literature Review

Islamic tourism is a potential sector globally, especially for countries with religious tourism products and services. Currently, many studies agree that Islamic tourism has emerged as a crucial sector in tourism marketing activities (Han et al., 2019; Al-Ansi & Han, 2019; Jeaheng et al., 2019; Oktadiana et al., 2016; Vargas-Sanchez & Moral-Moral, 2019). Most of these studies highlighted Islamic tourism includes the consideration of the Islamic law (*Sharia*), the target markets (Muslims or non-Muslims), destinations (Muslim or non-Muslim countries), the products and services offered (*Halal* food or facilities). Below is the general definition of Islamic tourism, *Sharia* tourism, *Halal* tourism, and MFT:

- i. "Islamic Tourism is defined as any activity, event, and experience undertaken in a state of travel according to Islam" (Han et al., 2019).
- ii. "*Sharia* Tourism is defined as any activity, event and experience undertaken in a state of travel that follows *Sharia* law" (Al-Ansi & Han, 2019).
- iii. "*Halal* tourism offers tour packages and destinations designed to cater to Muslim *Halal* considerations and address Muslim *Halal* needs" (Chookaew et al., 2015).
- iv. "Muslim-friendly tourism is defined as a type of tourism that adheres to the values of Islam" (Hanafiah et al., 2021).

However, several studies contended that *Halal*, Islamic, Muslim-friendly, and *Sharia*-compliant tourism are considered similar concepts (Han et al., 2019; Stephenson, 2014). Besides, there is no basic agreement on the term used. Terms such as 'Islamic tourism', '*Halal* tourism' and '*Sharia* tourism' were used interchangeably, but they are notable differences as mentioned above.

Methodological Approach

It can be mentioned that there are several styles to reveal detailed information in a field. Classification, as one of these styles, contributes to the field by relating the topics that are trespassed, under- worked or no worked and in this way provides experimenters with ideas on which topics they should concentrate on (Parente, 1998). In this context, this study, which aims to contribute to the field by furnishing comprehensive frame and classification of studies on "Halal Tourism", is an important study.

The academic review is subjected to content analysis for classification purposes. Content analysis is one of the most popular methods of qualitative research (Elo and Kyngäs, 2007; Lacy et al., 2015). The method focuses on explaining the verbal or written code on the problem selected by the researcher in non-numeric data (McTavish and Pirro, 1990) as well as careful, detailed, systematic examination and explanation of a particular material in an effort to identify paragraphs, sentences, words, and so on as part of a text (Camprubí and Coromina, 2016; Unerman, 2000). Researchers can use either manual or automated types of content analysis for their qualitative studies (Camprubí and Coromina, 2016; Trilling and Jonkman, 2018). This research uses manual content analysis although it is more difficult and more time consuming (Tixier et al., 2016).

As stated by Buchanan et al (1999), researchers are independent to determine their frames in their studies, choose their questions and to search after answers to them. This study to classify “Halal” studies in Halal tourism destinations in Indonesia which are published between 2017 until 2022 in various journals. This study was prepared with the motivation to fill this gap and guiding the researchers who want to study on “Halal” especially in Indonesia for further studies.

The determined journals are variation in publisher because Indonesia researchers published on local journal that might be missed in Scopus data bases. These databases were favored because of the study location for Halal researches was the top ten Halal destinations proposed by the Indonesian government and the latest five super priority Halal destinations proposed by the Indonesian government. In this context, current study included journals that contain the words “Halal”, “Halal Tourism”, “Muslim friendly” and the destinations area such as “Lombok”, “Aceh”, “Jakarta”, “Yogyakarta” and others in their titles. The author uses the Halal tourism keyword because researchers in Indonesia use the term of Halal tourism instead of Muslim-friendly. While the Indonesian government uses the term Muslim-friendly in their guidebook. From the results of this study, it will be seen that the term of Halal tourism is written more in Indonesian research than the term Muslim-friendly used by the government. To be more specific, the author does not look for articles with "Indonesia" and "Halal" keyword in title because there are too many studies that appear, reaching 1120 studies for the period 2017 to 2022. In this direction, in accordance with the purpose of the study, the papers were classified into study locations based on the ten provinces for Halal tourism development and Indonesia also the latest five super priority Muslim-friendly destinations in Indonesia.

Findings

According to IMTI (2019), Indonesia has ten priority provinces in Indonesia for Halal tourism development namely Aceh, West Sumatra, Riau and Riau Islands, West Java, Yogyakarta, DKI Jakarta, Central Java, East Java, and South Sulawesi, which is centered in Makassar and its surroundings.

Table 2

Publications related to 10 Halal Indonesia Selected Region 2017-2022

No	Destination	Keywords	Area	Keywords	Halal	Halal Tourism	Muslim friendly	
		Halal	Halal Tourism	Muslim friendly				
1	West Nusa Tenggara	5	5	0	Lombok	31	17	0
2	Aceh	17	10	0	Sabang	1	1	0
3	Riau & Riau Island	0	0	0				
4	Jakarta	7	3	0				
5	West Sumatera	4	2	0	Padang	2	2	0
6	West Java	2	2	0	Bandung	5	2	0
7	Yogyakarta	2	0	0				
8	Central Java	0	0	0	Semarang	0	0	0
9	East Java	3	3	0	Malang	7	1	0
10	South Sulawesi	1	1	0	Makasar	0	0	0

From the advance search results for publications with the keyword ten Halal tourist destinations in the research title from 2017-2022, it was found that publications in Lombok

Indonesia were mostly found with a total of 31 studies that contained the words Halal and Lombok in the title of their publications, while the specific included the word Halal tourism were 17 research titles. The majority are research journals published in Indonesia using either English or Indonesian, as well as several proceeding articles. Lombok is located in the West Nusa Tenggara, when the author searching for publications with the keywords Halal and West Nusa Tenggara 5 publications appeared. All of these publications also use the keyword Halal Tourism. This publication uses English and consists of journal articles published in Indonesia as well as proceeding articles.

The second largest research location is in Aceh, which is a province located at the western tip of Indonesia. Research with titles that use the words Aceh and Halal there are 17 studies and 10 studies using the words Aceh and Halal Tourism. Sabang is a popular destination in Aceh, but only 1 study discusses Halal in Sabang. The next destination that has become the object of research is Jakarta. Jakarta is the capital city of Indonesia and is the main entry point for foreign tourists coming to Indonesia. A total of 7 studies used the words Halal and Jakarta in their titles, while the specific ones used the words Halal Tourism were only 3 publications.

From the advanced data search, there are very few studies that discuss 10 Halal tourist destinations in Indonesia. Most of the published research is published in local Indonesian journals, not in indexed international publications. The term Muslim-friendly was also not found in the study which used 10 priority destinations for Halal tourism in Indonesia. The author also finds out about research on five super priority destinations announced by the Indonesian government.

Table 3

Publications related to 5 Super Priority Indonesia Selected Region 2017-2022

No	Destination	Halal	Halal Tourism	Muslim Friendly	Provinces	Halal	Halal Tourism	Muslim Friendly
1	Danau Toba	0	0	0	North Sumatra	1	0	0
2	Borobudur	0	0	0	Central Java	0	0	0
3	Mandalika	0	0	0	West Nusa Tenggara	5	5	0
4	Labuan Bajo	0	0	0	East Nusa Tenggara	0	0	0
5	Likupang	0	0	0	North Sulawesi	0	0	0

The Indonesian government has issued a Muslim-friendly tourist guide book in Indonesia's super priority destinations, which consist of Lake Toba in North Sumatra, Borobudur in Central Java, Mandalika in West Nusa Tenggara, Labuan Bajo in East Nusa Tenggara, and Likupang in North Sulawesi.



Figure 1: Indonesia 5 Super Priority Destinations

This guidebook for Muslim-friendly travel in five super priority destinations has been made since 2021 and socialized in September 2022. This guidebook was created by The National Islamic Economy and Finance Committee (National Islamic Economic and Finance Committee or KNEKS). KNEKS has a scope for developing the Halal product industry, including the Muslim-Friendly Tourism industry sector. KNEKS plays a role in increasing, accelerating, and strengthening the growth of the industry and Halal products, in order to meet the needs of domestic and international consumers by developing the industry and products to be able to compete in the global Halal market. The COVID-19 pandemic caused a significant impact on the tourism sector, including the tourism industry. Therefore, the recovery within the tourism industry requires active involvement of various parties. There is an urgent need to collaborate with industry players, stakeholders, and policy makers to produce a strategic and targeted policy to attract tourists, both domestic and international, once the COVID-19 pandemic is over. The creator of the guidebook, "Attractiveness of New Bali: Guide for Muslim Friendly Tourism in 5 Favorite Destinations" hopes that the guidebook can become a reference for Muslim tourists, both domestic and international, to choose Indonesia as their favorite destination.

From the results of the author's search, there is no research on Halal in this super priority destination at all. The research found only in the province of West Nusa Tenggara, which is a province of Lombok, which has entered the category of ten provinces for Halal tourism development in Indonesia. There is only 1 study with the keyword Halal in North Sumatra and this study discusses the Halal industry in the food sector.

According to the content analysis, one of the most important findings of this study is that the number of studies on Halal tourism is very limited in ten Halal tourism destinations in Indonesia especially in the top five super priorities of Muslim friendly tourism in Indonesia.

Conclusion

This study focuses on research in priority destinations announced by the Indonesian government. From the online database from 2017 to 2022, there are 41 journals with titles

that use the word Halal and provinces that are included in the category of 10 priority destinations for Halal development and 46 titles that include the word Halal and areas that include Halal development destinations.

Research with Halal themes is mostly found in Lombok and followed by Aceh. Meanwhile, research on the 5 super priority destinations in Indonesia is still limited, only 5 and even in the province of Nusa Tenggara not in Mandalika which is a priority tourist destination. The results of this study are also in line with previous research which states that studies on Halal topics are not enough (Baran, 2020) and researchers should increase work on Halal in general, which contributes to the enrichment of Halal literature. Research in Indonesia is still very minimal and concentrated in Lombok, which is already known for its Halal tourism development, even though there are still other Halal tourist destinations that are prioritize by the government. The term Muslim friendly was also not used by Indonesian researchers. In order to be more in line with the Indonesian government, it might be better if the research on Halal tourism in Indonesia uses the term Muslim-friendly tourism instead of Halal tourism. This study has several limitations. First, this research involves journals contained in the online database using selected keywords, both publications published in local Indonesian journals and indexed journals. Second, journals that use Indonesian may not be detected at all because the keywords used use English words for provinces. However, from the results of this study, it can be concluded that research on Halal tourism in Indonesia priority destinations for Halal or Muslim-friendly tourism promoted by the government is still very minimal so that research in these areas needs to be improved in the future. The results of this study are expected to encourage researchers in Indonesia to conduct research in priority destinations for Halal tourism in Indonesia because there is still much that can be explored in these destinations.

References

- Al-Ansi, A., & Han, H. (2019). Role of Halal-friendly destination performances, value, satisfaction, and trust in generating destination image and loyalty. *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management*, 13, 51–60. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2019.05.007>
- Baran, T. (2020). A literature review and classification of the studies on “Halal” in Islamic business journals (2010-2018). *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 12(5), 1012–1024. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jima-10-2019-0206>
- Buchanan, M., Iyer, R., and Karl, C. A. (1999). *The Case Study in Business Research*. Global Research Business.
- Camprubi, R. and Coromina, L. (2016). *Content Analysis in Tourism Research*. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, Vol. 18, pp. 134-140.
- Chookaew, S., Chanin, O., Charatarawat, J., Sriprasert, P., & Nimpaya, S. (2015). Increasing Halal Tourism Potential at Andaman Gulf in Thailand for Muslim Country. *Journal of Economics, Business and Management*, 3(7), 739–741. <https://doi.org/10.7763/joebm.2015.v3.277>
- Elo, S., and Kyngas, H. (2007). The Qualitative Content Analysis Process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, Vol. 62 No. 1, pp. 107-115
- Global Muslim Travel Index (2021). [Press release]. <https://www.crescentrating.com/reports/global-muslim-travel-index-2021.html>
- Global and regional tourism performance. (2022). UNWTO.ORG. <https://www.unwto.org/tourism-data/global-and-regional-tourism-performance>

- Hanafiah, M. H., Maek, A. A. A. A., & Zahari, M. S. M. (2021). Muslim Tourist Behaviour and Intention to Revisit non-Muslim Countries: The Role of Muslim-Friendly Tourism (MFT) Attributes. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*: Vol. 9: Iss.1, Article 14. <https://doi.org/10.21427/ps19-n143>.
- Han, H., Al-Ansi, A., Olya, H. G., & Kim, W. (2019). Exploring Halal-friendly destination attributes in South Korea: Perceptions and behaviors of Muslim travelers toward a non-Muslim destination. *Tourism Management*, 71, 151–164. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2018.10.010>
- Indonesia Muslim Travel Index. (2019). Crescent Rating. Retrieved January 5, 2020, from <https://www.crescentrating.com/reports/indonesia-muslim-travel-index-2019.html>
- Jeaheng, Y., Al-Ansi, A., & Han, H. (2019). Halal-friendly hotels: impact of Halal-friendly attributes on guest purchase behaviors in the Thailand hotel industry. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 36(6), 729–746. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10548408.2019.1631940>
- Lacy, S., Watson, B. R., Riffe, D., and Lovejoy, J. (2015). Issues and Best Practices in Content Analysis. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, Vol. 92 No. 4, pp. 791-811.
- McTavish, D. G., and Pirro, E. B. (1990). Contextual Content Analysis. *Quality and Quantity*, Vol. 24 No. 3, pp. 245-265.
- Oktadiana, H., Pearce, P. L., & Chon, K. (2016). Muslim travellers' needs: What don't we know? *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 20, 124–130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2016.08.004>.
- Parente, D. H. (1998). Across The Manufacturing-Marketing Interface Classification of Significant Research. *International Journal of Operations and Production Management*, Vol. 18 No. 12, pp. 1205-1222.
- Stephenson, M. L. (2014). Deciphering 'Islamic hospitality': Developments, challenges and opportunities. *Tourism Management*, 40, 155–164. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2013.05.002>
- Tixier, A. J. P., Hollowell, M. R., Rajagopalan, B., and Bowman, D. (2016). Automated Content Analysis for Construction Safety: A Natural Language Processing System to Extract Precursors and Outcomes from Unstructured Injury Reports. *Automation in Construction*, Vol. 62, pp. 45-56.
- Trilling, D., and Jonkman, J. G. (2018). Scaling Up Content Analysis. *Communication Methods and Measures*, Vol. 12 Nos 2/3, pp. 158-174.
- Unerman, J. (2000). Methodological Issues – Reflections on Quantification in Corporate Social Reporting Content Analysis. *Accounting, Auditing and Accountability Journal*, Vol. 13 No. 5, pp. 667-681.
- Vargas-Sanchez, A., & Moral-Moral, M. (2019). Halal tourism: literature review and experts' view. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(3), 549–569. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jima-04-2017-0039>