

Grammarians' Critique of Qur'anic Qira'at

Mohamed Fathy Mohamed Abdelgelil

Faculty of Islamic Contemporary Studies, Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin (UniSZA),
Terengganu

Email: mfathy@unisza.edu.my

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v10-i11/8199>

DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v10-i11/8199

Published Date: 19 November 2020

Abstract

The Qur'anic Qira'at were subjected to some criticism from some grammarians, but some may think that scholars, especially the greatest reciters, did not defend this critical Qur'anic Qira'at. Herein lies the problem of the research, which aims to trace the positions in which some scholars have triumphed over the Qur'anic Qira'at, and to know the extent of the methodology they followed in responding to these critics, including grammarians and others, as well as seeking to find out why the grammarians criticized these Qira'at. The research followed the analytical method to track the points that were criticized by the grammarians and the places where scholars of the Qira'at triumphed over. Some results emerged from it that grammarians who met up with Qira'at with critics and they did it so based on their violation of the rules they had set themselves, and the grammarians were not aware of all the grammatical rules and eloquent of the literary pure Arabic language. Therefore, they weakened some of the Qira'at, and everyone who criticized any of the Qira'at was responded by many scholars, and the Qira'at that the ten reciters read, and which people are reading today, were recited by the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace.

Keywords: Grammarians, Qira'at, Grammar, Response, Criticism.

Introduction

Quranic Qira'at - as a teaching material - is one of the sciences that have become popular among the scientific departments and Islamic universities (Abdelgelil et al., 2018). Researchers and authors are now authoring and publishing with the aim of bringing them closer to students. This short article is one of the articles that share previous researchers with the same purpose (Abdelgelil et al., 2018).

The Holy Qur'an, with its ten Qira'at, but with all its Surahs and verses, criticism about it intolerable and it is not permissible. It is the complete comprehensive book for all aspects of life, past, present and future (Abdelgelil et al., 2019).

The Triumph of the Quran Reciters For the Quranic Qira'at

Some grammarians criticized and insulted some Qira'at readers based on a Qira'at that was not liked by their linguistic group and did not follow the grammatical rules from their point of view. Perhaps what caused them to do so was their belief that the people of grammar are ambidexterity in the reading of the Holy Qur'an with their Qira'at having the readers among themselves. The evidence for that is what came from al-Zamakhshari - may Allah have mercy on him - that when interpreting the Almighty's saying, "فَيَغْفِرُ لِمَن يَشَاءُ وَيُعَذِّبُ مَن يَشَاءُ", He forgives whomever He wills, and punishes whomever He wills. (Qur'an, al-Baqarah, 2: 284) He mentioned that there were those who read it by combining the Raa with the Lam in this verse: (فَيَغْفِرُ لِمَن). He meant by this the reading of Imam Abu Amr Al-Basri (Abdelgelil et al., 2019). Then he commented on this reading and said, "The combination of Raa (الراء) with Lam (اللام) is wrong and blander, and his narrator on the authority of Abi Amr is mistaken twice, because he composes and attributes to the most knowledgeable person in Arabic what is announced with great ignorance. About these narrations, there is a lack of cautiousness and reservation of the narrators, and the reason for this is the lack of knowledge and awareness. Nobody can be determine precisely like that except grammarians (Abdelgelil et al., 2019).

However, the viewer is well known that many of scholars of Qira'at were those who were famous for their great command on grammar and linguistics, and they were the imam of the people of their time in these sciences. Moreover, some of those who were famous for recitation were on high level than grammarians. There is no evidence for this from the text contained by Imam Abu Hayyan al-Andalusi, the famous grammatical interpreter, who quoted a text on the authority of Ibn Atiyah and matched up him on it. and that is that Ibn Atiya al-Andalusi, the grammatical commentator, transmitted a text on the authority of Ibn Jinni, and he preferred it on a text transmitted from Abu Amr al-Dani, the famous reciter, and that When interpreting the words of the Almighty: "The night of the day shall be clouded" (Qur'an, al-A'raf 7: 54).

Ibn Atiyah - may Allah have mercy on him - said: "Hamid recites (يَغْشَى) with fatha on (الياء) and (الشين) and (الليل) in the state of Nasab and the word (النهار) in the state of Rafa`. Abu al-Fath said so. Abu Amr al-Dani read (الليل) in the state of Rafa`. Al-Qadi Abu Muhammad said; And Abu Al-Fath is the most correct and accurate (al-Qhadhi, 2015). This last sentence did not make Imam Abu Hayyan al-Andalusi agree as made him to track the words of Ibn Atiyah. Imam Abu Hayyan al-Andalusi said (This is what he said that Abu Al-Fath words proved) not true as Abu Amr al-Dani hold the proximate rank in the Qira'at and its knowledge and firm control on narrative authority. Moreover, his specialization in this field is so great that none of among greatest reciters, as well as the grammarians who are having neither an authority of narration nor the reciters narrate on behalf of their authority in Qira'at. This is with excessive religiosity and piety, steadfastness in transmission, non-daring and abundance of script from Arabic. I have seen his both books, book on a word (كَلًّا) and a book on (إِدْغَامُ أَبُو عَمْرٍو الْكَبِيرِ) This indicates his awareness and knowledge of what the imams of grammarians or reciters hardly see, to all his classifications and authorships, may Allah have mercy on him. Then he began to support the opinion of Abu Amr Dani as he said, "what Abu Amr Dani copied from Humaid is possible in terms of meaning. Because it is matching and compatible to the Qira'at of the group. As the word (الليل) in their reading is in the case of subject meaning wise even though it is in the state of Nasab then because of (هَمَزَةُ النَّقْلِ) or weakening might declare it an object. Moreover, it is not permissible for it to be a second object in terms of meaning because the two words in the state of Nasab (مَفْعُول) are exceeded and transited by the verb, and one of them is a

subject in terms of the meaning, so it is necessary that it be the first between two words." (Al-Zamakshari, 1988).

This is an acknowledgement and confession by an honorable imam of grammar and Tafsir and a submission to bringing forward one of the reciters to the grammarians on a grammatical issue. Rather, he responds to an interpreter like him, who is in fact his sheikh and professor, but he did not agree with him regarding to bringing forward a grammarian to an imam reciter like Abu Amr al-Dani - may Allah have mercy on them all.

In addition, the similar situation have happened to some of the authors of the Qur'anic sciences and the Arabic language to speak against the Qira'at readers about something indicative of weakness, underestimation and attenuation. Among which is what Imam Abu Shama mentioned - may Allah have mercy on him - He said, "It should not be deceived by every reading that is attributed to one of these seven imams, and it is called authenticated. That is how it was revealed, unless it entered into that standard, at that time the transition of it is not unique to others, and that does not relate to transition it from them. Rather, if it is quoted from other readers, that does not take it out of the authentication. They depend on gathering those descriptions and qualities. Their Qira'at what is transmitted from them, and beside it whatever is transmitted from others, they refer it to the seven Qira'at. He mentioned a sentence of some of the seven frequent Qira'at (recitations) which was not according to the grammar rules. After he said, "All of this is based on the lack of control of the narrators in it, even if transition is correct in it to from the rest of the seven Qira'at for which reciting was permissible, according to what is permissible in Arabic, whether it is fluent or less then it" (Ibn-Atiyyah, 2002).

The matter that angered Imam Ibn al-Jazari - may Allah have mercy on him - and provoked his scholarly opinion, and made him track these words and respond to it and triumph for those imams, who read the Qur'an as they heard it. He - may Allah have mercy on him - said: "So, my brother, look at these invalid and degraded words that came out without contemplation, and which are contradictory elsewhere in these little words ... And we - Allah bears witness - that we do not intend to overthrow Imam Abu Shama, since the horse may stumble, and we are not ignorant of his worth. Rather, the truth more deserves to be followed, but we intend to warn against this misstep so that he warns of it against those who have no knowledge of the sayings of the people and the one who does not know the conditions of the imams. As for his saying, "From what is attributed to them and includes denial of the people of the language, etc.", it is not appropriate to likewise make what he mentioned to be denounced by the people of language and linguists and the syntax that all scholar's dependence and reliance lies in them as their reference and inference.

In addition, who can deny Qira'at which are frequent or spread and circulated on the authority of the Messenger of Allah - may Allah bless him and grant him peace - except for people who have no regard for them, who have no knowledge of the Qira'at or the effects. Moreover, they immobilized and became inactive on what they learned through the analogy. In addition, they thought they have covered and achieved the command on all languages of the Arabs, the most eloquent among them. Even if someone was told, something from the Qur'an in a grammar other than the way that Allah revealed that corresponds to an apparent analogy with him. No one has read that so surely he interrupted his authenticity, just as if he was asked about a frequent Qira'at that its analogy was unknown, he would deny it and cut off its exceptions, irregularities and anomalies, so that some of them have interrupted what the Almighty said, "مَالِكٌ لَا تَأْمَنَّا", Why do you not trust us with Joseph? (Qur'an, Yusuf, 12:11) That the compulsion on which the Companions - May Allah be pleased with them - and the Muslims

unanimously agreed upon is a tune, and that it is not permissible among the Arabs because the verb which is "تأمن" is in the state of Rafa`. Therefore, there is no reason for its stillness (سكون) until it is inserted in the (النون) that follows it. So look, my brother, to the lack of shyness of these people from Allah Almighty to declare primary and original source what they knew from the analogy and the Great Qur'an the secondary. With the exception of the scholars who are emulated among the imams of the language and the syntax of that, but they refer to every letter and word as mentioned before and the like so. They exaggerate in directing it and exaggerate in denying it to those who deny it... Then Ibn al-Jazari - may Allah have mercy on him - quoted a text on this issue from Imam al-Shirazi. In it, he said that the religious imams reject saying that a recitation is weak from the frequent Qira'at. This is because the Qira'at that the expert reciters read, are proven on the authority of the Prophet - may Allah bless him and grant him peace. whoever rejected that he has rejected the Prophet - may Allah bless him and grant him peace - and disliked what the Prophet - may Allah bless him and grant him peace - read, and this is a forbidden spot in which imams do not follow the imam of language and grammar (Ibn-Hayyan, 2000).

In addition, Imam al-Qurtubi - may Allah have mercy on him - reported on the authority of al-Farsi that Abu al-Abbas al-Mubarrad said, "واتقوا الله " والذي تسألون به والأرحام", And be mindful of Allah—in Whose Name you appeal to one another—and 'honor' family ties. (Qur'an, An-Nisa no.1) hat is reciting of Hamzah - I would have put on my shoes and gone." Then Al-Qurtubi quotes a number of grammarians 'objections to this reading, and he followed all those objections by direction, refutation, answering and correction (Abu-Shamah, 1975).

The grammarians blamed the (Qira'at) reciters, which angered Imam Ibn Hazm al-zahiri - may Allah have mercy on him - so he said in the defense of the reciters and the Qira'at, and disguised the grammarians who criticized and put objections on the reciters, "And He is the Most Exalted, the Creator of the People and of the Language. He is most deserve to possess of the changes in them and he is most deserve to bring down their names, upon whoever, as he wants. There will be no wonder if someone finds something in the linguistic creativity of famous Arab intellectuals. Such as Imru' al-Qais, Zuhayr bin Abi Sulma, Jarir ibn Atiyah, Abu Malika Jarwal bin Aws bin Malik al-Absi known as Al-Hatee'a, Tirimmâh, bedouin Asadi bin Salami, Tamimi. In addition, other experts of Arabic language from all around the Arabs (who do not take care of cleanliness and hygiene) a word in poetry or prose, he makes it into the language and becomes perfectly certain about it and does not object to it. Then if he finds the words of Allah Almighty the Creator of languages and their speakers, that he does not turn to pay attention to it and does not make it a proof or evidence. In addition, he starts to take no notice of it and tries to divert it from its positions and turn in referring it to something else from what Allah had inflicted on it.

If something was found in the words of Messenger of Allah, may Allah's prayers and peace be upon him, he would do something similar to that. Swear to Allah, Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Abdul-Muttalib bin Hashem was before Allah Almighty honored him with prophet hood and the days of his youth in Mecca (without a doubt in the mind of each person who has normal brain to think with) Muhammad - peace be upon him – having more knowledge of Arabic language among his people. It is more appropriate for what he said and pronounced as an evidence and proof comparing to all different tribes of Arab world such as Khandaf, Qays, Rabi, Iyad, Tamim, Quda'a and Himyar. So how, after having been chosen out by Allah for the forewarning and selected to mediate between him (Allah) and his creation and Allah

has brought the words through his tongue that Allah Himself guaranteed the protection of his words and what he came up with (Ibn-Jazari, 1999; Anastasiou et al., 2013).

Conclusion

After we circled around some valuable quotes that raise the status of the Qira'at readers who obtained the Qira'at for us, the article reached some conclusions, which are:

1. Grammarians who criticized some of the Qira'at, but did so based on their violation of the rules that they set themselves.
2. The grammarians were not aware of all the grammatical rules and eloquent of the Arabic language, so they weakened some of the Qira'at.
3. Whoever criticized any of the Qira'at, many scholars have responded to it.
4. The recitations which the ten reciters read and which people read today, were read by the Prophet, may Allah bless him and grant him peace.

Acknowledgement

Special thanks go to the Research Management, Innovation and Commercialization Centre (CREIM), Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin.

References

- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Al-Janayni, M. U., Baru, R., Hamzah, M. S., Razali, M. A. T. M., & Ismail, F. Z. (2018). Tawjih Al-Qira'at Based on Inscription, Language, and Unusual Modes of Recitation According to Ibn Zanjalah. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(10), 362–370.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Daud, N. B., Omar, N. B., Ismail, F. Z. B., & Wahab, A. H. B. A. (2018). Taujeeh Al-Qira'at Using Qur'an, Hadith and Poetry according to Ibn Zanjalah. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(10), 371–379.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Musolin, M. H., Serour, R. O. H., Abdullah, M. S., & Noor, M. N. M. (2018). Law and Moral Values in the Holy Quran. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(11), 445–451.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Wahid, N. A., Yusof, F., Yunus, A. M., Hasan, A. F. (2018) The Administrative and Political Work of Women in the Light of the Verses of the Holy Quran, *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology (IJCIET)* 9(11), 2018, pp. 2732–2738.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Hassan, A. F., Musolin, M. H., Omar, N., Aziz, N. S. (2019). The Role of Muslim Women in Islamic Propagation and Educational Performances in Light of the Noble Qur'an, *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology (IJCIET)* 10(2), 2019, pp. 1116–1120.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Yusof, N. H., Rashid, R., Razali, M. A., Ismail, F. Z. (2019). The Efforts of the Scholars of Hadith to Enrich the Science of Recitation Modes, *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology* 10(2), 2019, pp. 1912–1916.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Hassan, A., Yusof, N. H., Idris, M. F. H., Hasan, A. F., and Ramadan, A. A. (2020). Defending the Quran in the Study of Tawjeeh Al-Qira'at, *International Journal of Management*, 11(10), pp. 101-104.
- Abdelgelil, M. F. M., Razali, M. A., Hassan, A., Hasan, A. F., Idris, M. F. H., and Masoud, A. S. (2020). Quranic Inimitability in Quranic Qiraat, *International Journal of Management*, 11(10), 2020, pp. 117-121.

- Anastasiou, A., Valkanos, E., Simos, G., Montgomery, A., & Karamitropoulos, L. (2013). Measuring Elementary School Principals' and Vice-Principals' Competence: Adjustment and Evaluation of Kelly Glodt's Instrument in Greece. *Multilingual Academic Journal of Education and Social Sciences*, 1(1), 50–69.
- Al-Qhadhi, A. A. M. (2015). "Al-Budur Al-Zahirah Fi Al-Qiraat". *Bairout: Dar Al-Kitab Al-Arabi*. P. 60.
- Al-Zamakhshari, M. A. A. (1988). "Al-Kashaf An Haqaik Khawamidh Al-Tanzil". *Bairout: Dar Al-Kitab Al-Arabi*. Vol. 1, P. 330.
- Ibn-Atiyyah, A. G. A. (2002). "Al-Muharrar Al-Wajiz Fi Tafsir Al-Kitab Al-Aziz". *Bairout: Dar Al-Kutub Al-Arabiyyah*. Vol. 2, P. 409.
- Ibu-Hayyan, M. Y. A. (2000). "Al-Bahr Al-Muhit Fi Al-Tafsir". *Bairout: Dar Al-Fikr*. Vol. 5, Pp. 66-67.
- Abu-Shamah, A. I. (1975). "Al-Murshid Al-Wajiz Ila Ulum Tata'allaq Bikitab Al-Aziz". *Bairout: Dar Sadir*. Vol. 1, Pp. 174-176.
- Ibn-Jazari, M. M. M. (1999). "Munjid Al-Muqr'in Wa Murshid Al-Thalibin". *Bairout: Dar Al-Kitab Al-Arabi*. Pp. 76- 78.
- Al-Qurtubi, M. A. (1964). "Al Jami Liahkam Al-Quran". *Cairo: Dar Al-Kutub Al-Mesriyyah*. Vil. 5, P. 3.
- Ibn-Hazm, A. A. (N. D). *Al-Fasl Fi Al-Milal Wa Al-Ahwa' Wa Al-Nihal*". *Cairo: Maktabah Al-Khanji*. Vol. 3, Pp. 107-108.