Vol 12, Issue 6, (2022) E-ISSN: 2222-6990

# Validity and Reliability of the Instrument in Measuring the Identity of Hindu Saivites through Beliefs and Religious Practices

Ros Izanie Ismail<sup>1</sup>, Jaffary Awang<sup>2</sup> and Indriaty Ismail<sup>3</sup>

1,2,3 Research Centre for Theology and Philosophy, Faculty of Islamic Studies, National University of Malaysia, 43600 Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia, <sup>1</sup>Department of Usul al-Din & Comparative Religion, Kulliyyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences, International Islamic University Malaysia, P.O. Box 10, 50728 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Email: izanieisma@gmail.com

**To Link this Article:** http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v12-i6/13916 DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v12-i6/13916

Published Date: 16 June 2022

### **Abstract**

Malaysia is a unique country that consists of various races with different religious and cultural backgrounds. In maintaining national harmony, knowing and understanding the cultures and religions of other races is important. As is well known, Hinduism is one of the minority religions practiced by Malaysians, particularly the Indian community. However, few people are aware that in Hinduism there are also several sects. This study is conducted to understand the identity of the Hindu religious sect that is practiced by the majority of the Malaysian Hindu community, namely Saivism, through beliefs and religious practices. Thus, an instrument for measuring the identity of Hindu Saivites through beliefs and religious practices has been developed. A pilot study was conducted involving 50 respondents consisting of Hindu Saivites in Klang Valley. The reliability value of Cronbach's alpha on the constructed instrument is 0.88. Such reliability value indicates that the constructed instrument may measure the beliefs and religious practices of the Hindu Saivites as well as their relationship to identity.

**Keywords:** Reliability, Validity, Hindu Saivites' Identity, Beliefs, Religious Practices.

### Introduction

Malaysia is made up of various races from different religious and cultural backgrounds. The religion in Malaysia consists of Islam which is the majority, recorded at 63.5%, followed by Buddhism at 18.7%, Christianity at 9.1%, Hindu at 6.1%, others at 0.9%, and unknown or no religion at 1.8% (Department of Statistics Malaysia, 2022). The diverse state of Malaysian people demands it society to know and understand the religions and cultures of other races in ensuring that national harmony can be sustained. Even though Malaysian society has been diverse for a long time and has been more apparent since independence, not everyone in Malaysia knows and understands the religion and culture of other races, particularly minority religions. Therefore, it is not surprising that there are sometimes racial conflicts over religious

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

matters, specifically when there are issues of insulting and disrespecting other religious communities.

This study focuses on the Hindu religion practiced by the majority of the Indian community. Even though the Malaysian community is aware of the presence of Hinduism in Malaysia, few may know that this religion also consists of several sects where there are some differences in terms of beliefs and religious practices. Although there have been earlier studies on Hinduism in Malaysia, from the researcher's observation, there is still a lack of specialization in the sects present within this religion. Thus, this study examines the sect that is the majority of Hindus in Malaysia, namely Saivism, by focusing on their identity through beliefs and religious practices. Thus, an instrument for measuring the identity of Hindu Saivites through beliefs and religious practices was developed. The main objective of this study is to examine the validity and reliability of the questionnaire in measuring the Hindu Saivites' identity through beliefs and religious practices.

### Methodology

This study applied a quantitative approach by using an instrument of questionnaire. The instrument for measuring the identity of the Hindu Saivites community through beliefs and religious practices was developed by the researcher. For the questionnaire, each construct and item developed to form the instrument are based on the theoretical and conceptual framework, previous literature as well as a reference to experts within the field of Saivism. The questionnaire consists of four sections, (A) demography; (B) beliefs of Saivism; (C) religious practices of Saivism; (D) Saivites' religious identity. The three constructs of beliefs of Saivism, religious practices of Saivism, and the Saivites' religious identity contain a total of 83 items. The measurement scale used in this questionnaire is a Likert scale where each item is measured with 5 scales namely (1) strongly disagree; (2) disagree; (3) neutral; (4) agree; (5) strongly agree.

### **Research Procedure**

The study went through several stages. The first stage was to develop a questionnaire instrument through a theoretical and conceptual framework, past studies, and also preinterviews with experts. After that, the questionnaire developed by the researcher went through a process of validity and reliability.

### **Face and Content Validity**

Validity refers to the ability of an instrument to test or measure what is supposed to be measured (Lynn, 1986; Ghazali and Sufean, 2018). There are several important forms of validity used in the study, and this study used face and content validity. Face validity, as mentioned by Ananda (2009), refers to several experts in his field who have been appointed to ensure that the constructed items accurately represent the measured constructions, such as the accuracy of language use, the spelling of sentence phrases, and so on. This validity is necessary for verifying that the item is clear, that the questions are asked in a reasonable amount of time, and that the item measures what should be measured (Arasinah et al., 2012). Furthermore, it assists researchers in identifying the likelihood of questions being misunderstood or misinterpreted early on (Zainuddin, 2015).

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

The number of experts required for face validity is not specifically determined, and previous studies have employed three, six, seven, and twelve experts (Aldridge and Galos 2017; Evers et al., 2017; Norhisham et al., 2017; Nuradli, 2019). According to Lynn (1986), the minimum number of experts for validation is three. For the face validity of this questionnaire instrument, it involved three experts consisting of an honorary professor from the Institute of Ethnic Studies and two Saivism religious experts. Both of the religious experts in Saivism are committee members of Saivism-based religious organizations. The selection criteria for experts are based on their areas of expertise in the field of ethnic social studies and also the Hindu religion of Saivism. Item evaluation was made on each item in the questionnaire in terms of appropriateness of the format of the instrument, clarity of the meaning of each item, use of easy-to-understand language, appropriateness of font size, clarity of instructions given, clarity of instrument objectives, and clarity of indicators for scale. Table 1.0 below shows a list of experts for face validity.

Table 1.0
List of Face Validation Experts

No.	Experts	Area of Expertise	
1	Prof. A	Social, Ethnic Study	
2	Dr. B	Hindu Saivism	
3	Mrs. C	Hindu Saivism	

In addition to face validity, content validity was employed to see how representative the items in the instrument were, of all elements evaluated as well as those that corresponded to the subject of the field of research wanted to be studied (Ananda, 2009). When it comes to a sample of items, content validity is important since it determines if they provide a sufficient operational definition of a construct (Polit and Beck, 2006). As for the number of experts used for content validity, it differs among the researchers. Some past researchers employed eight experts (Zhu et al., 2015), 13 experts (Wesolowski et al., 2017), and 16 experts (Kim, 2011). According to Lynn (1986), the number of experts necessary for research is adequate at five to ten. On the other hand, Lawshe (1975) recommends at least four expert panels. For this study, four experts were involved in content validity in which three comparable experts for the face validity test, and another expert who is a lecturer at the Research Center for Theology and Philosophy and also serves as the Deputy Dean of Research and Innovation. Table 2.0 below shows the list of experts for content validity.

Table 2.0
List of Content Validation Experts

No.	Experts	Area of Expertise
1	Prof. A	Social, Ethnic Study
2	Dr. B	Hindu Saivism
3	Mrs. C	Hindu Saivism
4	Dr. D	Theology & Philosophy

### Reliability of the Instrument

The reliability of an instrument in research describes the extent to which the scores in each item obtained in the questionnaire instrument are consistent or stable when used repeatedly (Ghazali and Sufean, 2018). The reliability of an instrument, in quantitative studies especially for the use of questionnaires, is attained by testing a group of questions (questionnaire)

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

through a small-scale test known as a pilot test (Pratt, 1980). For this research, a pilot study was conducted involving the adherents of Saivism in the Klang Valley. The selection of a sample of respondents for the pilot study has met the same characteristics as the actual sample of the study. A total of 50 respondents who are followers of the religion of Saivism answered the questionnaire distributed through the online google form. The practice method of distributing the questionnaire online by applying google forms is used due to a pandemic situation of Covid-19 that occurs where it is difficult for researchers to face the respondents due to safety factors. As for the number of respondents, 50 people is adequate for the pilot study sample. As Johanson and Brooks (2010) suggested a minimum number of 30 people for a pilot study is enough for validity and reliability for an initial study, Mohd Yusri (2017) recommends that 30 to 50 respondents are suitable and ideal for the pilot study. To obtain the reliability of the questionnaire instrument, the data obtained from the pilot study were analyzed using Statistical Package for the Social Sciences software (SPSS). Generally, the reliability of a questionnaire instrument is measured by obtaining the value of Cronbach's alpha coefficient when the measurement scale for the questionnaire item has several options such as the Likert scale (Bolarinwa, 2015).

### **Results**

The results of the reliability test using Cronbach's alpha internal consistency method are shown in the tables below.

Table 3.0

Cronbach's Alpha for Construct of Beliefs of Saivism

	Scale	Scale		Cronbach's
	Mean if	Variance if	Corrected	Alpha if
	Item	Item	Item-Total	Item
Item	Deleted	Deleted	Correlation	Deleted
I believe that there are three realities, namely, <i>Pati</i> (Lord of Siva), <i>pasu</i> (soul) and <i>pasa</i> (the bondages which become the hindrance to the soul).	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that these three realities are regarded as real.	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that these three realities eternally exist without a beginning and ending.	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that <i>Pati</i> is independent with inherent and complete knowledge.	193.56	106.864	121	.763
I believe that <i>pasu</i> is dependent on <i>Pati</i> , and it has limited knowledge and has to be given (taught to acquire) the knowledge.	193.56	102.129	.263	.751
I believe that <i>pasa</i> is inanimate, having no knowledge and feeling.	193.80	100.245	.203	.753
I believe that <i>Pati</i> is unaffected by the imperfection of <i>pasu</i> because He is independent and perfect.		101.961	.160	.755

I believe that Siva is the highest supreme God.	193.50	106.296	077	.761
I believe that God Siva is the source of life and all existence.	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that God Siva is the creator, preserver, and destroyer of all that exists.	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that God is one and His inherent form cannot be completely conveyed by words.	193.54	103.804	.225	.753
I believe that God manifests Himself in various forms (rupa).	193.50	104.990	.088	.756
I believe that the form of the statue of God in Saivism is a symbol that carries a deep meaning about the manifestation of God.	193.48	105.234	.087	.756
I believe that the various manifestations of God as Devi, Ganesha, Shanmuga, and others help to depict the various attributes of God.	193.84	97.443	.372	.744
To emphasize the fact that all forms are the manifestations of the one and only one God, terms of relationship like wife, son, and mother are used.	193.90	100.296	.229	.752
believe in God Ganesha/Vinayagar, son of Siva-Shakti, to whom I must first supplicate before beginning worship.		92.507	.325	.749
believe in God Ganesha/Vinayagar, son of Siva-Shakti, to whom I must first supplicate before beginning any task.		93.141	.312	.750
believe in Karttikeya/Murugan, son of Siva-Shakti, who as well as his vel of grace removes the internal and external challenges.	195.44	89.435	.431	.739
believe in Karttikeya/Murugan, son of <i>Siva-Shakti</i> , who as well as his vel of grace dissolves the bondage of ignorance.	195.52	86.581	.542	.729
believe that the <i>pasu</i> (soul) is constantly nindered by the impurities of <i>pasa</i> .	193.60	101.714	.327	.749
believe that the mission of <i>pasu</i> (soul) in this life is to become free from <i>pasa</i> by God's grace and be blessed to be in the permanent blissful state of a non-dual relationship with God.	193.68	101.732	.206	.752
believe God and soul are different entities, though both are eternal; God is one; souls are plural.	193.56	102.088	.249	.751

	99.185	.280	.749
193.50	102.541	.377	.750
193.46	104.090	.393	.753
	101.884	.398	.748
	104.085	.084	.757
193.54	102.417	.229	.752
193.46	104.172	.373	.753
193.46	104.172	.373	.753
	102.036	.291	.750
193.60	102.286	.275	.751
	102.622	.432	.749
	102.662	.325	.750
	103.030	.346	.751
193.58	106.004	052	.761
	193.46  193.56  193.54  193.46  193.62  193.60  193.50  193.54	193.50       102.541         193.46       104.090         193.56       101.884         193.58       104.085         193.54       102.417         193.46       104.172         193.62       102.036         193.60       102.286         193.50       102.622         193.54       102.662         193.52       103.030	193.50       102.541       .377         193.46       104.090       .393         193.56       101.884       .398         193.58       104.085       .084         193.54       102.417       .229         193.46       104.172       .373         193.46       104.172       .373         193.62       102.036       .291         193.60       102.286       .275         193.50       102.622       .432         193.54       102.662       .325         193.52       103.030       .346

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

I believe that the temple is the best place to worship God.	194.18	97.253	.307	.748
I believe that temple enables us to feel the existence of God.	193.94	95.282	.486	.738
I believe the <i>Panchakshara Mantra</i> , " <i>Namasivâya</i> " to be Saivism's most important mantra.		105.274	.063	.756
I believe that each syllable of "Namasivâya" has a distinct meaning.	193.42	105.718	.000	.756
I believe that Na denotes the Lord's concealing grace, Ma denotes the <i>mala</i> , Si is for Siva, Vâ is His revealing grace, and Ya is the soul.	193.50	102.337	.474	.749
I believe that the five syllables (Na, Ma, Si, Vâ, Ya) represent the five elements.	194.06	96.139	.283	.750
I believe that Na is earth, Ma is water, Si is fire, Vâ is air, Ya is ether or akasa.	194.16	93.851	.377	.743

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.756	43

Table 3.0 shows the result that Cronbach's alpha for the highest item if deleted in the construct of beliefs of Saivism is 0.763 on the item 'I believe that Pati is independent with inherent and complete knowledge'. However, the researcher retained the item since it is important to know the level of belief of Saivism adherents towards the nature of God which is the essence of their religion. After all, it does not give too much effect to the value of Cronbach's alpha if it is not discarded, for which the overall value of Cronbach's alpha for the construct of beliefs of Saivism is 0.756.

Table 4.0

Cronbach's Alpha for Construct of Religious Practices of Saivism

		Scale		Cronbach's
	Scale Mean	Variance if	Corrected	Alpha if
	if Item	Item	Item-Total	Item
ltem	Deleted	Deleted	Correlation	Deleted
I perform daily worship (puja) at home.	95.92	161.055	.405	.827
I perform daily worship (puja) at the temple.	98.12	149.128	.550	.818
I worship the Sivalinga.	95.92	158.075	.386	.826
I worship the icon/picture of God Siva.	96.20	158.122	.276	.830
I worship the icon/picture of God Ganesha/Vinayagar.	97.74	143.502	.525	.819
I worship the icon/picture of God Karttikeya/Murugan.	97.64	144.480	.492	.821

167.896 154.255 167.780 164.368 152.418	.060 .335 .085 .219	.833 .828 .833 .831
5 167.780 5 164.368 0 152.418	.085	.833
5 164.368 0 152.418	.219	
) 152.418		.831
	.300	
3 142.363		.832
	.559	.817
160.896	.290	.829
147.871	.637	.815
139.429	.600	.814
156.817	.368	.826
142.602	.589	.815
167.235	.166	.832
159.953	.346	.827
3 167.283	.184	.832
167.276	.160	.832
160.833	.378	.827
158.204	.346	.827
156.165	.389	.825
161.078	.336	.828
	147.871 139.429 156.817 142.602 167.235 159.953 167.283 167.276 160.833 158.204 156.165	147.871 .637 139.429 .600 156.817 .368 142.602 .589 167.235 .166 159.953 .346 167.283 .184 167.276 .160 160.833 .378 158.204 .346

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.832	25

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

Table 4.0 demonstrates the Cronbach's alpha for the construct of religious practices of Saivism that recorded the highest value for the item if deleted is 0.833 which is on the item 'I chant the mantra of "Namasivaya"' and 'I wear sacred ash (*Tiruniiru*) on my forehead'. Both of these items are maintained because this mantra is important in the religion of Saivism and the practice of wearing sacred ash on the forehead is a very significant practice among the followers of Saivism. Moreover, Cronbach's alpha has a high value of 0.832 and does not alter significantly if the two items are dropped.

Table 5.0

Cronbach's Alpha for Construct of The Saivites' Religious Identity

	Scale	Scale		Cronbach's
	Mean if	Variance if	Corrected	Alpha i
	Item	Item	Item-Total	Item
Item	Deleted	Deleted	Correlation	Deleted
I am a follower of Saivism.	63.16	34.015	.582	.712
I am committed to following all the teachings in Saivism.	63.22	33.644	.494	.710
have a clear understanding of the religion of Saivism that I follow.	63.24	33.778	.450	.712
know about texts of Saiva Agamas/ Siddhantagamas.	63.48	31.887	.428	.705
know about texts of Saivism including Firumurai and Saiva Siddhanta.	63.42	32.208	.381	.710
I read and study the texts of Saiva Agamas/ Siddhantagamas.	63.44	31.762	.429	.705
I read and study the texts of Saiva Siddhanta and Tirumurai.	63.36	31.011	.530	.695
Religious texts are important for me to learn and understand my religion.	63.16	34.586	.553	.716
I follow strictly the texts of Saiva Agamas and Saiva Siddhanta pertaining to beliefs and ritual practices.		34.392	.261	.722
Language is important in understanding the religious text that I read and study.	63.24	34.798	.159	.729
The Tamil language is a spiritual language and it is sacred.	63.14	35.674	.248	.727
The Tamil language is a language revealed by God.	63.28	36.042	011	.743
The process of Islamization in Malaysia bosed a challenge in maintaining the dentity of my religion.	64.92	26.238	.495	.696
The challenges from the Islamization process need to be addressed so that my religious identity can be preserved.		27.721	.363	.725

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

The position of my religion as a minority religion in Malaysia complicates the process of strengthening my religious identity.		27.647	.437	.705
Cronbach's Alpha	N	of Items		

15

As for the construct of Saivite's religious identity, table 5.0 displays the highest value of Cronbach's alpha if the item deleted is 0.743 on the item 'The Tamil language is a language revealed by God'. This item is retained because the Tamil language is very important for the identity of Saivism believers especially those of Tamil nationality and this item has been suggested by Saivism religious experts to be included in the questionnaire instrument. Cronbach's alpha for all items in this construct of Saivite's religious identity is 0.729.

Table 6.0

.729

Result	for	overall	value	of	Cronbach's	Alpha	of	the	instrument
Instrument					Cronbach's alpha				
Beliefs of Saivism					0.76				
Religious Practices of Saivism					0.83				
The Saivite's Religious Identity					0.73				
Overall value of Cronbach's alpha					0.88				

Table 6.0 demonstrates the Cronbach's alpha values for the entire items that include the construct of beliefs of Saivism, religious practices of Saivism, and the Saivite's religious identity. The overall Cronbach's alpha value is 0.88. This value indicates that all items have good reliability, and many researchers admit that values above 0.8 usually indicate very high reliability to be accepted especially for questionnaire items (Aiken, 1980; Cohen et al., 1960; Zaidatun and Salleh, 2003).

### Discussion

This study was conducted to test the validity and reliability of the instrument for measuring the identity of Hindu Saivites through beliefs and religious practices in Malaysia. The expert validation and pilot test were conducted to test the validity and reliability of the instrument and the results showed that the instrument constructed can be accepted to be used in further research. The results showed Cronbach's alpha for the construct of beliefs of Saivism is 0.76, religious practices of Saivism is 0.83, the Saivite's religious identity is 0.73 and the value for the whole item is 0.88. As suggested by DeVellis (2017), the accepted Cronbach's alpha value is from 0.70 to 0.95. Meanwhile, there are other scholars such as Sekaran (1992) and Mohd Majid (2004) who think that a value of 0.60 is sufficient to maintain the consistency of the items. Therefore, the instrument that has been developed by the researcher is acceptable because it exceeds the value of 0.60. Furthermore, the value for the whole item is good which is 0.88. As mentioned before, a value that is above 0.8 shows very high reliability as agreed by (Aiken, 1980; Cohen et al., 1960; Zaidatun and Salleh, 2003). So, this instrument can be applied in real studies.

Vol. 12, No. 6, 2022, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2022

### Conclusion

This study found that the instrument constructed is valid and reliable for use in the actual study based on the overall value of Cronbach's alpha which recorded a highly reliable score. Furthermore, the results indicate that the three constructs in this instrument, namely, beliefs of Saivism, religious practices of Saivism, and the Saivite's religious identity, are acceptable, and all items are retained. Hence the instrument is valid and reliable in measuring the identity of Hindu Saivites through beliefs and religious practices. The results also indicate that the instrument developed can be used among the Hindu Saivites population in Malaysia. For further research, future researchers may improve the study's results by performing another analysis such as exploratory factor analysis in evaluating construct validity since this study only involved face and content validity.

### References

- Aiken, L. R. (1980). Content validity and reliability of single items or questionnaires. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 40, 955-959.
- Ananda, K. P. (2009). *Penyelidikan dan SPSS (PASW)*. Petaling Jaya: Pearson Malaysia Sdn Bhd. Arasinah, K., AB., Rahim, B., Ramlah, H., & Soaib, A. (2012). Kesahan dan kebolehpercayaan instrumen kompetensi rekaan fesyen pakaian (RFP). *Jurnal Pendidikan Malaysia* 37(2), 11-19.
- Bolarinwa, O. (2015). Principles and methods of validity and reliability testing of questionnaires used in social and health science researches. *Nigerian Postgraduate Medical*https://doi.org/10.4103/1117-1936.173959
- Cohen, R. J. (1960). A coefficient of agreement for nominal scales. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 20, 37-46.
- Department of Statistics Malaysia. (2022). Launching of Report on the Key Findings Population and Housing Census of Malaysia 2020. Retrieved from DOSM: https://www.dosm.gov.my/v1/index.php?r=column/cthemeByCat&cat=117&bul\_id=a kliVWdla2g3Y2VubTVSMkxmYXp1UT09&menu\_id=L0pheU43NWJwRWVSZklWdzQ4Tl hUUT09
- DeVellis, R. F. (2017). *Scale development: theory and applications* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage publications, Inc.
- Evers, A. T., Verboon, P., & Klaeijsen, A. (2017). The development and validation of a scale measuring teacher autonomous behaviour. *British Educational Research Journal*, 43(4), 805–821. https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3291
- Ghazali, D., & Sufean, H. (2018). *Metodologi Penyelidikan dalam Pendidikan: Amalan dan Analisis Kajian*. Kuala Lumpur: Penerbit Universiti Malaya.
- Johanson, G. A., & Brooks, G. P. (2010). Initial scale development: sample size for pilot studies. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 70(3), 394–400.
- Kim, J. (2011). Developing an instrument to measure social presence in distance higher education. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 42(5), 763–777. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2010.01107.x
- Lynn, M. R. (1986). Determination and quantification of content validity. *Nursing Research*, 35(6), 382-385.
- Majid, M. K. (2004). *Kaedah Penyelidikan Pendidikan*. Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka.

- Yusri, M. I. (2017). Sembang Santai Penyelidikan. Terengganu: Bandar Ilmu.
- Norhisham, A. R., Syed, S. S., & Mohammad, N. B. (2017). Construction, validity and reliability of pre-university students stress inventory. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(11), 509-521.
- Nuradli, R. S. M. D., Shumaila, Y., & Hanifah, A. H. (2019). Religiosity scale development. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-11-2016-0087
- Polit, D. F., & Beck, C. T. (2006). The content validity index: are you sure you know what's being reported? Critique and recommendations. *Research in Nursing & Health*, 29, 489-497.
- Pratt, D. (1980). *Curriculum Design and Development. International Edition*. USA: Harcourt Brace Jovonarich.
- Sekaran, U. (1992). *Research methods for business: A skill building approach* (2nd ed.). New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Wesolowski, B. C., Amend, R. M., Barnstead, T. S., Edwards, A. S., Everhart, M., R., Goins, Q. Williams, J. D. (2017). The development of a secondary-level solo wind instrument performance rubric using multifaceted Rasch partial credit measurement model. Journal of Research *in Music Education*, 65(1), 95–119. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429417694873
- Zaidatun, T., & Salleh, M. A. (2003). *Analisis Data Berkomputer: Spss 11.5 for Windows*. Kuala Lumpur: Venton Publishing (M) Sdn. Bhd.
- Zainudin, A. (2015). Postgraduate research proposal: a step-by-step guide in writing proposal for postgraduate students (1st ed.). Bangi: MPWS Rich Publication Sdn Bhd.
- Zhu, J., Hu, Y., Liu, Q., & Cox, M. F. (2015). Validation of an instrument for chinese Engineering students' epistemological development: application of Perry's Theory. *International Journal of Chinese Education*, 4(2), 135–161. https://doi.org/10.1163/22125868-12340050