

## The Need for the Development of *Hikmah* Pedagogy Module to Preschool Students

Hafizhah Zulkifli<sup>1</sup>, Mahfuzah Mohammed Zabidi<sup>2</sup>, Nur Lailatul Syahira Raduan<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,3</sup>Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Malaysia, <sup>2</sup>Universiti Teknologi Mara

Email: hafizhah\_zulkifli@ukm.edu.my

To Link this Article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v12-i6/14069>

DOI:10.6007/IJARBS/v12-i6/14069

**Published Date:** 08 June 2022

### Abstract

This research seeks teacher's perspective by employing the ADDIE framework to develop preschool Hikmah pedagogy module, specifically analysis, development, design, application and evaluation stages. This study described the first stage of the ADDIE framework, which is the needs analysis stage. The needs analysis included seven school teachers, and a semi-structured interview was conducted. The completion of the interview discovered that there were four themes needed in the development of this Hikmah pedagogy module, particularly reading, oral questioning, stimulus material, storytelling and one problem face by teachers such as class control. Therefore, this study had implications for preschool children in improving higher order thinking skills and improving soft skills.

**Keywords:** Higher-Order Thinking Skills (HOTS), ADDIE Framework, Pedagogy, Hikmah Pedagogy, Preschool

### Introduction

A quality education system should be perceived from the most basic level, which is at the level of preschool education. According to Bakken, et al (2017), children from zero to seven years old, suffers a critical period to develop the basis for thinking, behaviour and even emotional well-being. It is at this stage that children improve communication, cognitive, social, and emotional skills (Bakken et al., 2017).

Preschool Education aimed to develop the potential of children aged four to six years in a comprehensive and integrated in terms of intellectual, spiritual, emotional and physical in a safe and enjoyable learning environment for children of that age (Ministry of Education, 2017). Furthermore, according to National Standard Preschool Curriculum (NSPC) 2017, preschool education intended to produce children who can face challenges, solve problems, have the desire to continue learning and can prepare for the next mainstream education. The application of 21st-century skills among preschool students can produce children who can compete globally. Among the application of 21st-century skills are the growth of Higher order

thinking skills (HOTs) and being able to solve a problem well (National Standard Preschool Curriculum, 2017).

The quality of teaching and learning in preschool education is assessed from the outcomes of preschool children through the approach used by preschool teachers. The progress of children is not only seen from the aspect of academic accomplishment but the knowledge and skills acquired by them while in preschool which can be practised when entering primary school and also in their daily lives. In the NSPC, weight was given to the use of approaches that support the development of a creative, critical and open-minded preschool community through activities that allow them to engage in the decision-making process and take responsibility for their learning.

Nonetheless, there are some issues that preschool teachers do not follow teaching according to student development. Nor (2006) said that, preschool teachers do not adopt a teaching approach according to 'Appropriate Development Practice' (ABP). Although there are preschool teachers who know the importance of ABP contained in the NSPC guide, they encounter problems to implement in teaching and learning. Preschool teachers were found to know how to use learning approaches through play, and the use of information technology but not according to student ABP. It can influence the teaching and learning process that is not appropriate for the age and development of students in preschool. Moreover, a study by Chee et al (2018) found that, the preschool teachers do not have extensive knowledge and understanding of curriculum content and technology of teaching. However, the preschool teachers have wide knowledge and understanding of pedagogy.

Additionally, there are constraints on the HOTs module on the learning of preschool children. As for the Hikmah pedagogy module such as, module for teaching Moral Education (Zulkifli et al., 2017), Mira novel (Hashim, 2009) and Sarah novel (Hashim, 2012), both novels for Islamic education. Although there are several modules in the Hikmah Pedagogy, the pedagogical module of Hikmah at the preschool level was not widely studied.

Additionally, although this Hikmah pedagogy module was conducted a lot until now, the validity and reliability study of the Hikmah pedagogy module received less consideration. These existing modules mostly applied the Hermeneutics method, and there was still very little research on the development of Hikmah pedagogical modules using analysis, development, design, implement and ADDIE evaluation.

It is hoped that this research could strengthen the thinking of HOTs among preschool children and present a module to be a guide for preschool teachers in implementing the teaching of Hikmah pedagogy.

This study intended to look at the need for appropriate modules to be used to implement the Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy approach for the teaching and learning of preschool children and to explore the problems encountered by preschool teachers.

### **Literature Review**

Hikmah Pedagogy is an educational program that focuses on thinking skills, and it was first introduced in Malaysia in 2002 (Hashim et al., 2018). Additionally, this Hikmah Pedagogy was

adapted from a thinking skills program pioneered by Matthew Lipman, Philosophy for Children (P4C). The word 'Hikmah' chosen for this program was based on the meaning of Hikmah itself which includes Hikmah, knowledge and foresight.

According to Hashim et al (2018), this Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy is a philosophical inquiry that strives to find truth and Hikmah. Moreover, this philosophical inquiry endeavoured to produce a generation that is critical thinking by using the element of philosophical inquiry as to the essential tool in education. In fact, it might work as a program that could transform the education system from teacher-centred and student-centred education into something that includes more components of the inquiry community. P4C, is the foundation of this Hikmah Pedagogy program to be realised to students to produce a generation that continually thinks critically and achieves meaning in everything they discover.

The objectives for the P4C program and the Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy are not much different but have a little addition to the Hikmah Pedagogy that is with the application of students' capacity to do *tadabbur* and understand the Qur'an and Sunnah more deeply and meaningfully for them. The content of this philosophy contains concepts such as justice, freedom of rights, respect found in the subjects taught in schools (Hashim, 2013). This P4C presents an approach to aspects that involve student activities, and students will be given the opportunity to voice their ideas (Hashim et al., 2018). According to Lipman (2017), every individual can think. This critical thinking skill is a dimension of thinking.

Preceding research declared that Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy influences students' critical thinking. Among the studies were accompanied by Othman (2005); Othman & Hashim (2015) who conducted a study on high school students that proved the treatment group was better in critical thinking than the control group. Further, there was an increase in higher-order thinking skills to form two secondary school students after going through the Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy for eight sessions (Juperi, 2010). Students were also found to be able to construct and articulate higher-order questions such as analysis, synthesis, and evaluation according to the bloom taxonomic hierarchy (Juperi, 2010).

Besides, a study by Preece (2011; 2013) declared that the application of Hikmah Pedagogy could enhance students' motivation to learn, assist them in language skills such as listening, reading and writing and improve thinking skills. Recently, there were studies of the implications of Hikmah Pedagogy to diverse subjects including the Malay language, English, Mathematics, History, Science and Islamic Education subjects manifesting an advancement in students' critical reasoning (Hashim et al., 2017; Hashim et al., 2018).

Additionally, the Hikmah Pedagogy was also used in several subjects in improving thinking skills. Among them are the subjects of English (Preece, 2011; 2013), English Literature (Othman, 2005; Othman & Hashim, 2015) Islamic Education (Juperi 2010; Hendon, 2016; Ab Wahab, 2015; Hamzah, 2015), the Malay language, History, Science and Mathematics (Hashim et al., 2017; Hashim et al., 2018). All of the above literature highlighted the study on HOTS at the secondary and primary school levels only. Nevertheless, the study on preschool children in strengthening HOTS was not extensively studied. Consequently, the study of preschool children using Hikmah pedagogy could fill in the gaps in the study of Hikmah pedagogy

**Methods**

This study used design and development research (DDR.). DDR study is divided into two types, specifically, type 1 and type 2. Type 1 is research on products and tools, while type 2 is a research study on design and development model. In this study, researchers used type 1, which is research on products and tools. Research on products and tools there are three categories namely, 1) Comprehensive DDR.; 2) Specific Instructional Design (I.D.) Phase and 3) Tools/product development and use. In the context of this study, the researcher uses a specific phase I.D.

This study utilised the ADDIE framework in the development of Hikmah Pedagogy module for preschool children. This ADDIE framework had seven phases, specifically (1) Analyse, (2) Design, (3) Development, (4) Implementation, (5).

At the analysis stage, the researcher identified the problems, targets and needs of module development. A needs analysis was conducted using a qualitative method that is using a semi-structured interview method on seven preschool teachers of the Ministry of Education Malaysia (MOE) from different schools. Sample selection techniques were done purposefully by selecting informants from homogeneous groups but can provide a variety of information. The informants were selected based on the criteria of teachers who implement NSPC and had academic qualifications at the degree level in the field of preschool education.

Then at the design stage, the researcher considered the determination of the appropriate learning theory. The learning theories involved were constructivism theory, cognitive theory and behaviourism theory. These theories were applied to plan teaching and learning that was expected to have a positive impact on students.

At the development stage, the findings of the needs' study were considered to strengthen the development of the Hikmah Pedagogy module apart from the use of a literature review. The development of this module contained daily lesson plans, novels or short story texts and reinforcement activities. It would make it more straightforward for teachers to teach and implement the Hikmah Pedagogy module to preschool children.

After that, the module was given to experts for content verification using the adaptation of the questionnaire. Then a pilot study was attended to see the usability of the module.

After that, during the implementation stage, the researchers refined the findings of the pilot study before implementing it on the actual study. Then, the researcher implemented the Hikmah Pedagogy module on three kindergartens, at the evaluation stage, the researcher evaluated the usability of the Hikmah Pedagogy module for preschool children by taking observation data and interview data and documents to be analysed using thematic analysis methods and content analysis.

**Study Sample**

This study was conducted on seven preschool teachers of the Ministry of Education Malaysia. Researchers picked seven preschool teachers from the Ministry of Education Malaysia because they teach using the National Standard Preschool Curriculum and had at least three years of experience teaching preschool children.

### **Data Collection Methods**

Data were collected in a semi-structured interview on seven kindergarten teachers. In an attempt to get questions that could provide better information, the transcript of the interview was pioneered before the actual interview was administered. The researcher selected an informant who had the same characteristics as the actual study sample to be interviewed to see the suitability of the question. Based on the pilot study, there were two simplified and improved questions. Improved questions were used in the actual study. Once the interview process and data collection in the actual study were done, the researcher completed the transcript and returned the transcript to the informant for review. After the transcript was checked, the informant signs the interview confirmation form to confirm the interview information. Confirmed interview transcripts were analysed using an index. The process of indexing the transcript was done by labelling its code on each study informant. Interview data were categorised, subcategorised and analysed using coding methods to produce themes.

### **Data Analysis**

Data analysis procedure for this study adopted a thematic analysis for qualitative data research. Thematic analysis is a method for identifying, analysing, and reporting patterns (theme) within data (Braun & Clark, 2006) this research, the analysis of interviews and journals followed the six steps of thematic analysis by Braun and Clark (2006), containing of (1) familiarising data, (2) generating initial codes, (3) searching for themes, (4) reviewing themes, (5) defining and naming themes, and (6) producing the report.

### **Credibility and Consistency**

For credibility assurance, this study applied member checks, a prolonged period in the field, and peer examination. Meanwhile, the consistency of this research employed expert confirmation by Cohen's kappa and audit trail.

### **Results**

Based on the analysis of interviews conducted on preschool teachers to explore the need for preschool teaching and the problems encountered, there were four themes such as (i) Reading, (ii) Oral Questioning, (iii) Stimulus Materials, (iv) Story Telling, and one theme for problems statement such as (v) Class Control. The researcher used acronym such as Discourse Unit (DU) and Informant (I) to show the interview data by the informants.

#### **Theme 1: Reading**

Informants declared that at the beginning of their teaching, teachers do reading activities that have an appreciation of the basic knowledge of religion. For example, informants 1 and 3 mentioned that:

"So, early in the morning, we have started (the class) by reading, reading *iqra*, individually, face to face". (DUI130)

"... early in the morning I told the students to read it first, follow the fixed schedule and read the *iqra* during its designated day, and read the exemplary storybook accordingly. ...." (DUI235)

Informant 2, 4 and 7 also stated that in the early morning, the students read the book in English and the Malay language and *Iqra* in the afternoon.

*"In this class, in the morning, when the parents send the kids to our kindergarten... I will ask them to open and read quietly first, then come to me and to read aloud" (DUI245)*

*"I asked my class to read the book that contains the Malay syllabus first. Then they could play" (DU1436)*

*"I requested the kid who speaks a lot first to read the English book and followed by the rest" (DUI740)*

### **Theme 2: Oral Questioning**

Four informants adopted the method of oral questioning by raising questions to improve thinking skills. Nevertheless, both practised different methods. Informant 1 used questioning techniques first to students to make it easier for students to issue the next question.

*"...examples of questions they can ask, and then they will think for themselves what other questions they can ask for that topic." (DUI147)*

However, in contrast to the informant 6 method, teachers used learning materials to make it easier for students to ask questions.

*"... like, questions that we provide, we ask these children, mmm, for example, there are materials of pots, soil, trees in the box provided. We asked these children, "why are there pots, soil and trees in this box?". What is the purpose? "What are we going to do today?" (DUI650)*

Informants 3 and 4 asserted that they used the question and answer session after revising the lesson.

*"After revising the hadith, I would conduct a question and answer session, with the students, managed a question and answer session, question and answer with the students about the hadith, the hadith" (DUI359)*

*"Usually, I asked questions to the students, but when I do so, and a child does not understand, I explain again. Then, I asked the questions again to students" (DUI454)"*

There are also several informants used picture to ask questions. For examples as follows:

*"I would prefer to use pictures to ask questions, so that they had better understand and the students have fun" (DUI5133)*

*"I use picture for difficult topics. From there the students asked a lot of questions and create thinking" (DUI3140)*

### **Theme 3: Stimulus Materials**

When being asked about other needs that teachers often need to improve students' level of thinking skills, most teachers stated that the provision of structured teaching aids could provide powerful teaching and learning.

Among the activities performed are such as video shows as done by informants 1, 2 and 3. For example:

*"Okay, first we would show the students an example, an example about a video, later the students would watch it, then the teacher would ask a question so, they would think..." (DUI167)*

*"... Applied the video approach, because it is familiar to students, things that they watch every day, it is video right, so that thing attracted their interest to think" (DUI380)*

*"... The use of video for the teaching of Sirah is suitable for use because through video cartoons the stories of the prophet Muhammad and his companions would appear more interesting to students" (DU1268)*

However, informant 5 made a different approach by using stimulus material in the classroom. For example, informants 3 and 5 utilised materials in the forms of flashcards and kits for their students.

*"I usually used Flash Cards to teach hija'iyah letters, to teach reading, so that children could think as well" (DU1582)*

*"If for science (subject), it has its kits, every student would get box, that box had a kit that helped (them to) think "(DUI589)*

*"In addition to using the video that I mentioned earlier, to encourage children to think is to question and answer with them through the materials provided by the teachers earlier" (DUI390)*

#### **Theme 4: Storytelling**

The best approach to improving children's thinking skills, according to informants 6 and 5 was to use storytelling methods. For example, as said by informants 6 and 5:

*"... The method that could be used is the storytelling method. The teacher first told the story in a tone of voice that was suitable for body movements, which could attract the interest of this student." (DUI698)*

*"... Based on the story we told them, would make them think, 'why is this?' and 'why is that? ..." (DUI6103)*

*"... Usually, I liked to tell stories, stories, stories, stories, then, especially if they did not understand that time when I was telling them about pillars of Islam" (DUI593)*

*... I would tell them first, what is Hajj, where does one goes for the Hajj, after telling the story, then (I will) ask (them).., "If one wants to go for the Hajj, the place is far away, then what is the transport needed?". something like that" (DUI5100)*

#### **Theme 5: Class Control**

Difficulties faced by teachers in preschool throughout activities happens when there are too many students who need to be controlled. For instance, informant 7 stated that:

*"...when (we) did activities with a lot of them. Okay, when there were so many of them, it seemed like they were out of control. because of the noise, it would be difficult to give them instructions, so it took a little time, to calm the children down "(DUI7108)*

*Additionally, when children are too active in the classroom, it makes it difficult for a teacher to control the situation. Informant 1 stated that:*

*"... Most of the students with a lot of opinion, views, those who talk a lot are kinaesthetic children, who like to move, who are agile, who are active in the classroom, it is difficult for me to control the class, (they) scream" (DUI1103)*

**Discussions**

It can be concluded that there were four themes on the need for the development of Hikmah pedagogy module among preschool children namely reading themes, oral questioning, available teaching aids and storytelling and one theme that was class control on problems faced by preschool teachers. Based on the first theme of the finding, the researchers discovered that reading activities constituted a significant activity before the child learned other things when in kindergarten regardless of whether it was reading from a religious, Malay language or English perspectives.

Reading is quintessential for every child to understand the surroundings and allow them to speak. A study by Gorard et al (2015) shows that P4C had a positive impact on achievement especially for reading and mathematics and P4C also had a concrete influence in terms of confidence in speaking, listening skills and self-esteem. A study in the Hikmah Pedagogy by Hashim et al (2018) showed an increase in reading fluency for subjects in Malay language and English.

The second theme was verbal questioning. The use of oral or written questioning had a high impact on the teaching and learning process implemented. It was because question and answer activities that used questioning were applied for decades. In the Qur'an, many verses could be quoted how Allah S.W.T used the method of questioning before explaining something. Among the verses is in surah al-Qadar verse 5, which means "*Do you know what the night of al-Qadar is?*". The question followed by the explanation of the exact answer stated in the Qur'an is the method followed by the Prophet Muhammad, in providing education to Muslims, primarily the companions who studied with him. For example, the Prophet Muhammad question and answer with the Angel Gabriel A.S. about the Pillars of Faith, the Pillars of Islam, and Compassion. The questioning method is part of every compulsory teaching and learning activity between teachers and students. The Prophet Muhammad also often engaged in a question and answer with his companions if there was confusion in an issue (Darusalam, 2001).

Hikmah pedagogy also helps improve thinking skills when using oral questions. Studies show an enhancement in questioning skills where students were able to produce questions from lower-order thinking questions (LOTs) to HOTS according to Hierarchy of Bloom's Taxonomy (Zulkifli & Hashim, 2019).

Additionally, the third theme finding was available teaching aids for HOTS such as the use of existing videos and kits. Children are more attracted to stimulus materials such as videos, exciting pictures to produce effective learning. According to Abd. Ghani & Nor (2014) found that exposure to stimulus material at an early stage can have an impact on the optimal development of children's minds. Multimedia stimulus materials help children improve their level of skills, such as language ability.

In the Hikmah pedagogy, teaching aids or stimulus are the first elements that allow students to think. Stimulus material in the Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy is not necessarily referring to the text of short stories or novels, but can also be video stimuli, posters and pictures that allow children to think. The characteristics of story text stimulus material in Hikmah pedagogy were (1) have dialogue, (2) minimum two characters (3) Contain an issue, problem and



concept (4) Unreasonable situations are also created (5) Have pure values (6) Conceptual confusion so that readers try to give different and meaningful interpretations (7) have inquiry questions (Hashim, 2013).

The fourth theme of the findings of this study was storytelling. Storytelling helps children feel joy and happy to learn. Storytelling technique can develop in children and may increase the control and memory of the Malay words, provided that these techniques must be repeated often (Jamil et al., 2011). Teachers also need to be creative in presenting this storytelling technique either through puppets, real or digital materials (Abdul Malek et al., 2019).

This storytelling technique is synonymous with the teacher who tells a story about something such as the teacher telling a story with the appropriate tone of voice as well as using body movements that can attract students to listen and pay attention. Through this storytelling, children can think better and allow the existence of questions for them to think better through the storytelling being told. However, it is slightly different from the Hikmah Pedagogy whereby in the Hikmah Pedagogy, it is the student who needs to read the story with the correct intonation and occurs in turn. This can allow children to tell stories and cultivate their self-confidence in the classroom.

Besides, the fifth theme was Class Control. Preschool teachers often say they find it difficult to control a noisy classroom. It is because teaching and learning cannot be done if the classroom is noisy. Abdul Rahman and Noor (2018), in their study, stated that if many activities are carried out in the classroom, then teachers find it difficult to control the classroom.

### **Conclusion**

Ergo, it can be concluded that the need for Hikmah pedagogical module was to improve HOTS among preschool children. It should focus on reading among children, oral questioning to stimulate thinking, appropriate stimulus materials preparation and storytelling to create an exciting atmosphere in the classroom. These requirements were in line with Hikmah pedagogy because Hikmah pedagogy also emphasises reading, questioning and discussion among students.

Therefore, this study had implications for preschool children in improving KBAT, improving soft skills such as interpersonal skills and communication skills. This Hikmah Pedagogy application was very relevant for use to children because its student-centred activities encourage children to express their views and ideas freely and prudently through the rules provided by using beneficial stimulus materials.

This Hikmah pedagogical module could increase children's level of self-confidence through activities carried out in the classroom with a fun learning environment with friends. Among the dominant activities in this Hikmah pedagogy was in groups to create an inquisitive group. This group activity involved each individual in submitting their ideas with prudent rules that each idea submitted should be accepted in the right way and accept the views of other friends well. It would cause the child not to be clumsy to communicate and not ashamed to present

the views that are locked in their minds. Discursively, the skills could be polished properly and efficiently.

Similarly, the development of Hikmah Pedagogy module in Islamic Education afforded facilities for teachers to perform student-centred activities by creating a learning environment that is inquiry-based and made it easier for teachers to refer to activities using stimulus materials. Furthermore, questioning techniques were also provided to make it more manageable for teachers to provide meaningful learning pursuits to children.

### **Acknowledgement**

This research was supported by the Faculty of Education, The National University of Malaysia, code GGPM-2020-007).

### **References**

- Ab Wahab, M. K. (2015). Enhancing critical thinking skills, self-confidence and meaningful learning experience in Islamic education using the hikmah pedagogy of philosophical inquiry. Master project paper. Gombak: International University Malaysia.
- Abd. Ghani, R., & Nor, M. M. (2014). Pelaksanaan Kurikulum Standard Prasekolah Kebangsaan oleh Guru Prasekolah. *Jurnal Peradaban*, 1 (7): 40-68.
- Abdul Malek, A., Abdul Rahman, M.N., Darus, R., & Mansor, M.A. (2019). Pendekatan bercerita berasaskan kurikulum berkepelbagaian budaya untuk pembelajaran literasi awal kanak-kanak. *Jurnal Kurikulum & Pengajaran Asia Pasifik*, 7(3), 28-34.
- Abdul Rahman, M. N., Nor, W. M. W. N. B. (2018). Pelaksanaan Kurikulum Standard Prasekolah Kebangsaan Semakan 2017: Retrospeksi guru. *Jurnal Kepimpinan Pendidikan*. 5(3), 59-71.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 71-101.
- Bakken, L., Brown, N., & Downing. B. (2017). Early Childhood Education: The Long-Term Benefits, *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 31(2), 255-269.
- Chee, J., Noor, M., Othman, A. J., & Abdul Rahman, M. N. (2018). Isu pengetahuan kandungan, pedagogi dan teknologi dalam kalangan guru prasekolah. *Jurnal Kurikulum & Pengajaran Asia Pasifik*, 6(1), 7-21.
- Darusalam, G. (2001). *Pedagogi Pendidikan Islam*. Gombak: Utusan Publication & Distribution Sdn Bhd.
- Gorard, S., Siddiqui, N., & See, B. H. (2015). Philosophy for Children: Evaluation report and executive summary. *Education Endowment Foundation*. Durham University.
- Hamzah, L. M. (2015). Using philosophical inquiry methods to enhance student's inquiry skills in teaching Akidah among form 2 students. Master project paper. Gombak: International Islamic University Malaysia.
- Hashim, R. (2009). *Mira's New school*. Gombak: Saba Islamic Media.
- Hashim, R. (2012). *Sarah: the budding thinker*. Gombak: Centre for Philosophical Inquiry in Education. IIUM.
- Hashim, R. (2013). *Pedagogi Hikmah dan Pengajaran kemahiran Berfikir di sekolah*. Centre for Philosophical Inquiry in Education. IIUM.
- Hashim, R., Hussein, S., Yusof, W. M., Khalid, M., Kamaluddin, R., & Zulkifli, H. (2017). *Laporan kajian rintis program pedagogi hikmah di sekolah terpilih daerah Gombak*. Gombak: International Islamic University Malaysia.

- Hashim, R., Yusof, W. M., Hussien, S., Khalid, M., & Kamalludeen, R. (2018). Aplikasi Pedagogi Hikmah bagi Pengajaran Bahasa Malaysia dan Bahasa Inggeris Abad ke-21, *Jurnal Pendidikan Malaysia*, 43(2), 37-47.
- Juperi, A. J. (2010). Philosophical Inquiry in Islamic Education and Its Effect in the Development of Questioning Skills among Secondary School Students. Master Dissertation. Gombak, International Islamic University Malaysia.
- Lipman, M. (2017). The Institute for the Advancement of Philosophy for Children (IAPC) program. In Naji, S., & Hashim, R., (Eds.), *History, theory and practice of philosophy for children: international perspectives* (pp. 3-11). London: Routledge.
- Nor, M. (2006). Realiti trend dan isu dalam Pendidikan awal kanak-kanak. *Masalah Pendidikan*, 1, 81-90.
- Ministry of Education. (2017). Buku Penerangan Kurikulum Standard Prasekolah Kebangsaan (Semakan 2017).
- National Standard Preschool Curriculum. (2017). Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia
- Othman, M., & Hashim R. (2012). Critical Thinking & Reading Skills: A Comparative Study of the Reader Response & the Philosophy for Children Approaches, *Thinking: The Journal of Philosophy for Children*, 18(2), 26-34
- Othman, M. (2005). Critical Thinking and Reading Skills: A Comparative Study of the Reader Response and Philosophy for Children program approaches. PhD thesis. Gombak: International Islamic University Malaysia.
- Preece, A. S. (2013). Make it Mean! Using a Community of Inquiry' to improve language skills in the E.S.L. classroom. *IJUM journal of educational studies*. IIUM Press. 1(1), 25-54.
- Preece, A. S. (2011). *Developing E.L.T. materials for muslim learners: A qualitative study*. Gombak: International Islamic University Malaysia.
- Zulkifli, H., & Hashim, R. (2019). The Development of questioning skills through Hikmah (Hikmah) Pedagogy. *Creative Education*. 10(12), 2593-2605.  
<https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2019.1012187>.
- Zulkifli, H., Razak, K. A., & Mahmood, M. R. (2018). The Usage of ADDIE Model in the Development of a Philosophical Inquiry Approach in Moral Education Module for Secondary School Students. *Creative Education*, 9, 2111-2124.  
<https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2018.914153>