Vol 14, Issue 10, (2024) E-ISSN: 2222-6990

Community Detection in Practice: A Review of Real-World Applications Across Six Themes

Siti Haryanti Hairol Anuar¹, Zuraida Abal Abas², Mohd Fariduddin Mukhtar³, Nor Hamizah Miswan⁴

¹Fakulti Teknologi Dan Kejuruteraan Elektronik Dan Komputer, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka (UTeM), Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, ²Fakulti Teknologi Maklumat Dan Komunikasi, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka (UTeM), Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, ³Fakulti Teknologi Dan Kejuruteraan Mekanikal, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka (UTeM), Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, ⁴Jabatan Sains Matematik, Fakulti Sains & Teknologi, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM), Bangi, Malaysia Corresponding Author Email: sitiharyanti@utem.edu.my

To Link this Article: http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/IJARBSS/v14-i10/23160 DOI:10.6007/IJARBSS/v14-i10/23160 Published Date: 11 October 2024

Abstract

Community detection in complex networks is widely used across fields, from sociology to biology. Despite its broad applications, there has been limited exploration of real-world experiments involving the use of datasets, algorithms, software, and openly shared code resources. This review addresses this gap by analyzing 88 publications from 2017 to 2023, focusing on the practical implementation of community detection methods. A thematic review (TR) process using ATLAS.ti 23 identifies six key themes: Healthcare, Social Networks, Telecommunications, Economics, Intelligence, and Natural Sciences. The review provides insights into the prevalent use of algorithms, notably the Louvain method, and evaluates their effectiveness across different domains. It also highlights challenges faced in real-world applications, such as scalability, accuracy, and domain-specific limitations. By offering a comprehensive overview of tools, techniques, and resources, this review aims to guide researchers and practitioners in understanding and applying community detection effectively in various real-world contexts.

Keywords: Application Domain, Community Detection, Network Structure, Thematic Review

Introduction

All the data in the real world can be modeled as a network. Networks consists of nodes as an object and edges as the interaction between the object in the communities. The formation of communities from networks is based on nodes that have something in common, such as connections or affiliations, same interests, and shared same material or contents. This network can be from any various systems or scenarios and effectively represent in network

data structure. The knowledge of network data structure is combination of graph theory and mathematics (Dey et al., 2022, Mukhtar et al., 2023). This is helpful to understand over the network in the systems as a great tool (White & Smyth, 2005). One of the important analyses in the network data structure is community detection. Community detection is a process to find relevant communities, modules, clusters, or groups with a high density inside edges and a low density of communities in networks. Most of real-world networks have complicated structures, and community detection can expose the current community structure and provide relevant information (Karatas & Sahin, 2018).

Generally, community detection can be divided into two: static and dynamic community detection. Static community detection methods can be categorized into four types: optimization, spectral, statistical inference, and dynamics (Chunaev, 2020; Fortunato, 2010; Gupta & Sharma, 2017; Javed et al., 2018; Lancichinetti & Fortunato, 2009; Meena et al., 2021; Naik et al., 2022; Su et al., 2024). First, optimization methods seek to discover the maximum or minimum of a quality function that estimates the quality of community structure. One of the most preferred quality functions is modularity (Hairol Anuar et al., 2024). Modularity only operates in undirected, static, non-overlapping networks. It also indicates the dendrogram line and algorithmic useful partitioned values finding. The NP-hard modularity maximization problem requires approximation methods or heuristics. Modularity may miss small and resolution-limited groups. On each run, they may discover distinct communities on the same network, causing instability. To overcome the drawbacks, researchers try to apply spectral methods. Spectral approaches leverage the eigen value spectrum of network matrix representations such adjacency, Laplacian, and modularity matrices (Fortunato & Hric, 2016). They project vertices into metric space using eigen vectors. In an m-dimensional Euclidean space with m eigen vectors, vertex i's coordinates are i-th entries. This is followed by k-means clustering to find communities. However, spectral methods are unreliable in sparse networks because eigenvalue separation is not sharp, and the calculations can be expensive.

For statistics-based methods, data are fit to generative network models using a traditional approach. The Stochastic Block Model (SBM) is the most prevalent network generative model. SBM maximizes the log-likelihood of network communities and requires knowledge of the number of communities in advance, which is often unknown in real-world networks. Another category involves dynamics-based methods. Community structures can be detected in networks using dynamic methods such as diffusion, random walk, and spin dynamics. Label propagation methods use diffusion, while random walk methods rely on the homophily assumption. Spin dynamics methods assign spin variables to network vertices to construct a spin model, and researchers then assign spin values using Hamiltonian distance with minimal values (Abbe et al., 2021; Chien et al., 2019; Yaqoob & Al-Sarray, 2020).

Meanwhile, the dynamic community detection methods can be categories into two: independent and dependent clustering (Elhishi et al., 2019). Independent clustering, also known as a two-stage clustering, is applying static community detection methods to dynamic cases yields this first approach. Then, divide the network's progression into numerous time steps and assign communities to each. Each snapshot detects communities separately and matches them with the ones from the previous stage based on similarity. The matched using a similarity metrics such as Jaccard, Sorensen, and Salton (Dakiche et al., 2019) & (Kadkhoda Mohammadmosaferi & Naderi, 2020). The advantage of this method is directly used to the

dataset without changes and the disadvantage is the result of dynamic community detection are not stable. Dependent clustering is another name for evolutionary clustering.

This eliminates the need to match communities and streamlines the community identification process by requiring the detection of communities at a particular time (present) based on those recognized at a previous period (prior) (Pereira et al., 2021). There are various methods, such as spectral clustering (Chi et al., 2007), non-negative matrix factorization (NMF) based, and multi-objective based (Folino & Pizzuti, 2014). This disadvantage is due to the high temporal complexity. While evolutionary clustering assumes smooth network evolution and incremental clustering uses global community discovery to find changed structures in each network time slice, reducing time complexity.

Literature Review

The idea to study the real-world or practical application in community detection started from the increasing publication of papers by multidisciplinary researchers. There were various application domains that use the community detection method to solve their problem. Depends on system problem modeled as networks, such as in the field of communication (Daher et al., 2020), wireless sensor (Lin & Wang, 2019), telecommunication (Saggese et al., 2020), transportation (Talib et al., 2020), intelligent computing (Abas et al., 2020), data mining (Jiang et al., 2019), healthcare (Damgacioglu et al., 2020), economics (Shrifan et al., 2021), ecommerce (Li et al., 2020), supply chain management (Xueshuo et al., 2021), market segmentation, manufacturing (Jiang et al., 2021), social networks (Zhang et al., 2021), nature (Heinz & Henkel, 2012), agriculture, and aquaculture (Alcácer & Cruz-Machado, 2019) and many more. This shows that the application from sociology to biology uses the method of community detection.

In addition, trending topic analysis and criminal detection also apply the concept of community detection. Most popular, community detection is used in recommendation systems for Netflix, YouTube, Tinder, and Amazon. User selections trigger relevant system suggestions. Additionally, bitcoin network may detect communities. Peer-to-peer networks underpin Bitcoin. Simply put, Bitcoin has no central server or authority. In one of the major Internet peer-to-peer (P2P) networks, Bitcoin users connect directly.

Another example of practical application using community detection is in AstraZeneca vaccine. The science-led biopharmaceutical company's unique medications are used by millions of patients worldwide. Community detection was used to identify communities and ideal intervention locations, uncovering patterns in patient itineraries. Furthermore, bank fraud is a federal crime that involves fraud of the ability of the bank to earn monetary profits. Financial fraud costs banks billions annually. Community detection and similarity helped most top 10 banks discover and recover money crime. 70% of credit card fraud was missed and synthetic identities were bigger challenge. Network analytics with queries and algorithms help to find \$10s of millions of frauds in first year of execution plan (Mark Needham, 2021). Another field is in education, community detection can be used to explore and investigate student's physical interaction in peer learning of higher education course (Abal Abas et al., 2022).

As far the authors are aware, few researchers make a summary about practical applications with the community detection method (Abas et al., 2020). One of researcher, Kataras and Sahin, 2018 proposed the taxonomy of community detection and the drawbacks and emphasizes the possible effects of possible improvements in criminal areas (Karatas & Sahin, 2018). Most of research done on social network analysis often focuses on the subject of community detection algorithm due to its connections with data mining and machine learning (Subbian et al., 2016).

Hence, this research review updates the existing review on community detection applications by examining seven years of recent publications through quantitative and qualitative findings. In this study, the focus is on practical applications of community detection rather than simulations or general benchmarks of social networks, such as karate, dolphin, football, LFR, and so on. The primary objective is to identify possible patterns of domains that can be used in community detection. Therefore, this paper aims to answer two key questions for further understanding.

RQ1: What are the current real-world application patterns and statistics in community detection to articles, geographical dispersal, and recommend-journal developed in the publication from 2017-2023?

RQ2: What are the themes that can be generated in the practical application of community detection involved from publication 2017-2023?

This paper is structured as follows: The next section provides a detailed method, examining existing studies on community detection, and identifying the bibliometric analysis of community detection research trends from 2016-2023. The methodology section outlines the research design, including the thematic review concept used to collect publication data. The results section presents the findings from the paper review, highlighting the quantitative and qualitative findings of the bibliometric analysis. Finally, the discussion and conclusion sections reflect on the real-world applications of these findings for community detection experiments.

Methodology

This study used ATLAS.ti 23 to implement the thematic review (TR) as shown in (Mnea & Zairul, 2023; Mohd Zairul, 2021; Samsudin et al., 2022; Shahruddin et al., 2020; Zairul, 2022; Zairul et al., 2020, 2023; Zairul & Zaremohzzabieh, 2023; Zakaria & Isa, 2022) where the mechanisms of using the theme analysis approach to complete literature reviews are explained. According to Clarke and Braun, 2013, thematic analysis involves reading extensively to find patterns and themes (Clarke & Braun, 2013). The TR was performed step-by-step to solve the research question on community detection practicability from 2017 to 2023.

It is necessary to find the patterns which exist within the application in community detection domains of network structures. This TR included three stages: identification, screening, and data extraction and reporting. Figure 1 depicts this TR's stages and activities. In the stage of identification, a variety of criteria were used in identifying the selections of articles which would be used. These were: 1) find articles published between the years of 2017 and 2023, 2)

Have at least keyword (s) 'community detection OR community discovery OR community identification', AND 'in', 3) Focusing on the practical application domain used only.

The article that uses the 'general' benchmark networks such as synthetic networks and realworld networks such as Zachary, football, high school, primary school, Facebook and so on were excluded from this process of TR. This is because we want to see the reality of practical applications used in the knowledge of community detection algorithms and we must find patterns and establish categories to comprehend the trends of practical community detection based on article searching. It is worth noting that published works on the subject have been found predominantly within the last 7 years. This subject matter clearly still occupies an exploratory arena and has a great deal of current relevance.

Next, stage two is article screening. The well-known databases used are Web of Science (https://www.webofscience.com/) and Scopus (https://www.scopus.com/) to answer the research questions and discover relevant studies. Both databases filtered 'type of documents', English language, research article only, and the keywords search must appear in the title. We strategized searching keywords of community detection only based on title search because a lot of articles were found, and we need to select the relevant and quality articles. The exclusion criteria are filtered by removing the conference or proceeding articles, book chapters and review article. Also, we removed all the articles that were not related to and were out of range for the year. Then, the articles were then submitted within Mendeley, which was used to efficiently check each article against the previously determined inclusion and exclusion criteria. All the metadata will be checked one by one. The total from Web of Science database is 302 articles, and from the Scopus database are 506 articles. The total articles for both findings are 808 articles. However, after checking for the overlapped (duplicates) articles and the article not eligible according to inclusion and exclusion, the articles left only 88.

Afterward, the third stage is data extraction and reporting. ATLAS.ti 23 was used to analyze the article and find themes in 88 articles. The identifying data for the articles was compiled, which included items such as: title, year of publication, author's name, country of publication, main subject, keywords, and the name of the periodical where it is found. Figure 2 shows the appearance of metadata generated from 88 documents in ATLAS.ti 23.

The selected papers are grouped into quantitative and qualitative findings to collect and synthesize data to answer research questions. The quantitative findings of the paper will answer research question 1 and display the data from a numerical point of view, while the qualitative findings will answer research question 2 and cover the various themes which are being applied within community detection algorithms and real practical application as shown within the articles reviewed. The techniques of community detection, software language used, and link of code/data provided will also be highlighted in this paper for the readers' ease of understanding in the result of discussion. Each article will be categorized with suitable domains based on the dataset used.



Figure 1: Stages of conducting this thematic review

<u>ی</u>	9.60.1	TR Comr	nunity Detecti	ion (WOS & Scopus) 2017-2023 - /	ATLAS.ti	i i		Manage Do	ocuments										٥	×
	Home	Search & Code	a Analyze	Import & Exp		Help	Docu	ments	Search & i	ilter T	ools \	/iew							😨 Feedbac	k & Hel	lp ⑦ 🗸
A Docur	dd New ments • Entities • New	Edit Comment Project	Navigator	Documents Codes Project Explorer wigator	Documents C	Quotation	Codes Me	emos Netw	orks Links												
Exp	lore		* ×	Document M	anager $ \times$																
Sea	irch		Q	Search Document	Groups	Q	Search Doc	iments													Q
	💮 TR Community	Detection (WC	S & Scopus)	Document Group		~	ID A	Namo												N.	ledia Tune
	Documents	s (88)		Vear:2023	9	(20)	D 1	Aganito	et al (2022	- Parallel I	Vatwork An	alusis and (ommunitie	s Detection	(PANC) Pine	line for the	Analysis a	and Visualizat	tion of COVID-1	~ Te	evt
	⊿ 🧼 Codes (13)			Vear:2022		(21)		Abmadi	an et al. (2022	22) - Health	w Food Rev	ommendat	tion Using a	Time-Aware	(FAIVC) Fipe	v Detection	Annroach	and Paliabil	ity Measuremen	+ DI	DE
	👂 🛅 🛛 Coun	try { 88 - 0 }		Vear-2021		(13)		Akbar ar	ad Saritha (2021) - Oua	intum insni	ed commu	inity detectiv	on for analy	sis of biodiv	ersity chan	ne driven l	hy land-use	conversion and	a pr	DE
	4 🛅 🖲 RQ : \	What are the cu	rrent trends c	Vear::2020		(12)	D A	AL-Mukk	nu sanua (Shameny (2)	019) - Com	munity det	ection of no	litical blogs	network ba	ersity crian	ge unven i	bute graph d	lustering model.		DE
	Þ 🗋 😐 (1) Healthcare {	29 - 0)	Vear-2019		(13)	D 5	AL Share	a et al. (20)	19) - Tensor	Rased Terr	moral and I	Multilaver C	ommunity P	etection for	Studving F	Brain Dyna	mics during	Resting State fM	RI Te	ovt
	Þ 🗋 🖲 (2) Social Networ	k { 17 - 0 }	Vear:2018		(7)		Alcavde	et al. (2018	- Analysis	of research	topics and	l scientific co	ollaborations	in renewah	le enerav i	isina comr	munity deter	tion~	PI	DE
	Þ 🗋 单 (3) Economics {	13 - 0)	Vear:2017		(2)		Alduaiii	et al. (2018)	- Influence	Propagati	on Model fo	or Clique-Ba	sed Commu	inity Detect	ion in Socia	I Networks	<~		PI	DF
	Þ 📄 😐 (4) Telecommuni	cation { 15 -	Year:2016		(0)	D 8	Basanta	et al. (2023	- Commu	nity detection	on in empir	rical kinase r	networks ide	ntifies new	potential m	embers of	f signalling p	athways~	PI	DF
	Þ 🗋 单 (5) Intelligent { 9	- 0 }	Year:2015		(0)	D 9	Belliet	al. (2020) - 1	he rhythm	of the crov	d: Propertie	es of evolut	ionary comn	nunity deter	tion algorit	thms for m	nobile edge s	election~	P	DF
	Þ 📄 单 (6) Nature { 5 - 0)}	Vear-2014		(0)	D 10 Bhar et al. (2022) - Application of a maximal-clique based community detection algorithm to gut microbiome data reveals driver microbes d.,									d PI	DE				
	Þ 📄 O Year F	Publication (88	8 - 0 }	Vear:2013		(0)	D 11	Bi et al.	(2021) - Dv	namically Tr	ransient So	tial Commu	inity Detecti	ion for Mobi	ile Social Ne	tworks				P	DF
	🚫 🗆 Code	provided { 11	-0}	Vear:2012		(0)	D 12	C lin et	al. (2018) -	A Commun	nity Detection	n Annroac	h to Cleanin	a Extremely	Large Face	Database~				P	DE
	🔷 🔍 Comr	munity Detectio	in {55 - 0}	Vear-2011		(0)	D 13	C Wand	and F War	a (2022) - 1	GIS-automa	ted delines	ation of hos	nital service	areas in Flo	rida: from [artmouth	method to r	etwork commu	~ PI	DE
6	🚫 🗆 Comr	munity Discover	ry {2-0}	Vear:2010		(0)	D 14	Cao et a	(2019) - S	ocial Relativ	onshins and	Temp-Sna	itial Rehavio	irs Based Co	mmunity Di	scovery to I	Improve Ci	uber Security	Practices	Те	ovt
	O Contr	ribution { 4 - 0)	Vear:2009		(0)	D 15	Ceron e	t al. (2020)	Communit	ty Detection	in Very Hi	inh-Resolutio	on Meteorol	logical Netu	orke	impiore of	your security	Fractices	Dr	DE
	🔷 🗆 Datas	et {3-0}		D Voor:2007		(0)	D 16	Chattori	on and Can	ogu (2022)	Commun	tu detection	n in Eastain	Parr vinur a	region reetw	reinomar a	nd role of	turoring kins	re in etiological	DI	DE
	🌕 🔿 defin	ition CD { 2 - 0	} ~	Vear:2005		(0)	D 17	Chen 7k	ee and sarij	2023) - Mul	ti view met	ro station o	rluctering ba	end on pace	enger flows	: a function	al data od	land network	community det		ovt
	🔷 🔿 Dyna	mic Community	Detection {	Vear:2003		(0)	D 18	Chessa	at al (2023)	- Compley	networks fi		ity detection	n of backeth	all players~	a function		iged network	community det	P	DE
	🔷 O Frame	ework { 25 - 0 }		Vear:2002		(0)	D 19	Choudh	unv et al. (2)	1221 . A Sou	cial Networ	Analysis A	approach to	COVID, 19 C	ommunity I	Detection T	echniques			pr	DE
	🔷 🗆 Geph	ii {1-0}		Vear:1995		(0)		choudh	ury et ut. (2	722) · A 301	cial recivor	C Allorysis A	approach to	cono no c	community i	perection is	eciniques		-		
	🔺 🧼 🗆 Meth	od {92-0}		RM-Librancov	ourefi2017	(0)													Diagram Pre	view C	Comment
	🔶 О ВС	GLL / Louvain {	15 - 0 }	RM-Librancy	ml to atlasti	(0)	Code Dist	ribution a	cross Doc	uments											
	0 ci	lique Percolatio	n Method (CF	RM-Library	vang2020	(0)									Sc	ic 1					tio.
	🍥 o ci	liXO (1-0)		RM-Library	alib2020	(0)								stry	pue	am			e fo		niza
	🍥 O Ci	ombo {1-0}		RM-Library:N	Av Collection	(36)								npu	set	Cei		rers	ang	vor	nyn
	000	onclude (1 - 0)	BM-Library	neng2019	(0)								1 t	Virlir	lical		play	ę.	Vetv	ano
Com	ment		[7] (B)	RM-Library:	ang2020	(0)						20	21	odsu	4 ue	polog	.9	llec	rsity	cal	de
com	inche			RM-Library:	ang(2020)	(0)	5		14	11 0	14	2		Tran	erice	hae	tral	keth	dive	logi	uio
	Select an item	to show its con	ment	RM-Library:f	s	(0)	2 10	201	201	202	202	202	202	Air	1 W	1 VIC	1 N	Bas	1 8	Bio	1 Bito
	Senescient Netti	in allow its coll	01.001.00	RM-Library:fr	edpc	(0)	1							<u> </u>		<u></u>	-		1711		
88 do	cuments																				

Figure 2: Metadata generated in ATLAS.ti 23.

Finding

The results are presented in two different subsections. First, the quantitative results are shown in frequencies, and then the qualitative results are the establishes theme elicited and analyzed.

Quantitative Findings

The quantitative results are related to the analysis of the word cloud found within the 88 primary articles. The words with the highest frequency within these articles are community, network, nodes, and detection, respectively as shown in Figure 3.



Figure 3: Word cloud generated from 88 articles

Based on our knowledge, there are a few reviews that focus on the practical application domain in community detection. One of the review is in (Karatas & Sahin, 2018). The review has a short overview of the basics of community detection information, including community structure, static and dynamic community detection. We note that many researchers are only partially aware of the relevant studies; this sometimes causes repetition approach. Furthermore, this article up-grades the review from Karatas and Sahin on the application area in community detection with quantitative and qualitative results. The year of publication, research location, and theme subject were used to interpret study trends, which qualitatively resemble community detection patterns.

Figure 4 shows 88 articles by publishing year from the search technique and criteria. The trends of publication papers in community detection increased significantly over the years. In year 2023 reached 20 articles due to the review being undertaken until August 2023. It could be due to global data creation, capture, copying, and consumption.



Figure 4: Number of articles by year published

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

The result of the keywords searching shows that many practical applications apply community detection algorithms to solve certain problems, and we summarized with forming a theme for making valuable information. At the earlier stage of searching, there were found that a few thousand results. However, after focusing on the document title by filtering the keywords, the results significantly drop and more focus on the research objective. This review can be a guide for the beginner researcher that wants to explore in the future about community analytics. They can save time reading or summarizing content interested in the databases by referring to the low and high application areas utilizing community detection. Previous research discussed the usefulness of community detection in real networks based on domains rather than chronological order. However, the quantity that proves the community detection's future practical applicability was not addressed in network structure.

This section elaborates the quantitatively as shown in Table 1, IEEE Access has the most published in community detection articles with eight, followed by Applied Soft Computing with three, Expert Systems with Application with three, and the other journals with two and one article, respectively.

	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	Totals
IEEE Access	-	1	5	2	-	-	-	8
Applied Soft Computing	-	-	-	-	1	-	2	3
Expert Systems with					1		С	2
Applications	-	-	-	-	T	-	Z	3
IEEE Transactions on Neural								
Systems and Rehabilitation	-	-	-	1	-	-	1	2
Engineering								
International Journal of					1		1	2
Communication Systems	-	-	-	-	T	-	T	2
International Journal of								
Computational Intelligence	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	2
Systems								
International Journal of								
Environmental Research and	-	-	-	1	-	1	-	2
Public Health								
Social Network Analysis and					1		1	2
Mining	-	-	-	-	T	-	T	Z
Sustainability (Switzerland)	-	1	-	-	-	1	-	2
Sustainable Cities and Society	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	2
Scientific Report	-	-	-	-	1	-	1	2
Annals of Operations Research	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1
Applied Sciences	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	1
Applied Sciences (Switzerland)	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	1

Table 1

Periodical	versus	vear of	publications

Table 2 shows the country distribution of studies, which is very interesting that China produced the most research articles employed the community detection algorithm in real practical application. Proven by Figure 5, the highest publications in China every year, start

from 2018 until today. The practical application in community detection research trends for network structure are reflected in our real problem trends in general. Many researchers prefer to solve problems in healthcare research by employing community detection, as shown in Figure 6. This is because medical data is growing due to digital technology that collects patients' heart rate, respiration rate, temperature, blood pressure and so on. The increment also includes diagnostic information from some disease pattern by dataset of blood tests, genetic tests, culture, and other lab data.

Table 2

Country and	d number	of publice	ations
country and	mannoer		10115

Country	No. of Articles	Reference	Country	No. of Article s	Referen ce	
China	39	 (Zhu et al., 2023) (D. Jin et al., 2020) (Q. Li et al., 2019) (Y. Zhang et al., 2020) (Zhuo et al., 2022) (Liu et al., 2022) (Bi et al., 2021) (Gu et al., 2019) (Cao et al., 2019) (S. Li et al., 2023) (C. Zhang et al., 2023) (Z. Akbar et al., 2021) (Y. Zhang et al., 2019) (Z. Jiang et al., 2020) (Xueshuo et al., 2021) (S. X. Wu et al., 2021) (J. Wang et al., 2022) (J. Wu et al., 2021) (Lu & Dong, 2023) (T. Wang et al., 2023) (Yan & Yang, 2023) (Z. Han et al., 2018) (Zu et al., 2021) (C. Zhang et al., 2023) (Guo et al., 2019) (Huang et al., 2018) (Zhao et al., 2023) (Ding et al., 2022) (W. Wu et al., 2019) (H. Yang & Le, 2021) (X. Han et al., 2022) (W. Wu et al., 2022) (C. Jin et al., 2018) (Qi & Cao, 2023) (Xue et al., 2019b) (J. Li et al., 2018) (S. Zhang et al., 2022) (Xie et al., 2022) (C. Wang & Wang, 2022) 	Germany	1	(Bhar et al., 2022)	
USA	11	(Kramer et al., 2020) (Al- sharoa et al., 2019) (Mueller et al., 2021) (Karaaslanli et al., 2023) (Rahiminejad et al., 2019) (Kabir et al., 2019) (Torene et al., 2022) (Singhal	Greece	1	(Karyotis et al., 2018)	
		et al., 2020) (J. Wang & Paschalidis, 2017) (Desai et al.,				

		2023) (Peeples & J. Bischoff, 2023)			
Italy	8	(Agapito et al., 2022) (Milano & Cannataro, 2020) (Moscato & Sperlì, 2022) (Nicolini et al., 2017a) (Chessa et al., 2023) (Grassi et al., 2021) (Belli et al., 2020) (De Luca et al., 2023)	Brazil	1	(Ceron et al. <i>,</i> 2020)
India	6	(Choudhary et al., 2023) (Chatterjee & Sanjeev, 2023) (Nallusamy & Easwarakumar, 2023) (Kannan et al., 2022) (Reddy et al., 2021) (S. Akbar & Saritha, 2021)	Indonesia	1	(Irsyad & Rakhma wati, 2019)
Iran	4	(Ahmadian et al., 2022) (Malekshahi Rad et al., 2023) (Moradi et al., 2021) (Haghbayan et al., 2021)	Iraq	1	(Al- Mukhtar & Al- shamery , 2019)
Spain	2	(Alcayde et al., 2018) (Cotelo et al., 2020)	Korea	1	(Essaid & Ju, 2022)
Taiwan	1	(Sangaiah et al., 2023)	Mexico	1	(Montes -Orozco et al., 2023)
UK	3	(Basanta et al., 2023) (Grant & Ahnert, 2019) (S. Javed et al., 2020)	Portugal	1	(Fernan des et al., 2019b)
Australia	1	(Alduaiji et al., 2018)	South Korea	1	(JH. Park & Kwon, 2022)
Egypt	1	(Gaber et al., 2023)	Switzerland	1	(Evans et al., 2022)
Finland	1	(Rostami et al., 2023)	Turkey	1	(Doluca & Oğuz, 2021)

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024



Figure 5: Number of publications versus country

Therefore, the healthcare domain potential of big data is evident and proven by 32% publications. This motivates network analytics researchers to use community detection as data scientists that have the power to anticipate epidemics, prevent diseases, improve health, and reduce fatalities. Social networks are the second most popular subject for practical application in community detection among researchers with 22% publication, and the percentage of publications was followed by 15% is economics, 14% is telecommunications, 11% is an intelligence, and 7% is nature. Overall, this part answers RQ1.



Figure 6: Six themes of the research and publication years

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

Qualitative Findings

This section answers research question 2 qualitatively by focusing on data extraction topics in the final articles. Summarization of selected articles were identified themes of concern to researcher using a keyword title of community detection. Six themes have been generated, namely Theme 1 (Healthcare), Theme 2 (Social Network), Theme 3 (Telecommunication), Theme 4 (Economics), Theme 5 (Intelligent), and Theme 6 (Nature). An explanation of each theme will be provided below.



Figure 7: Overall network to answer Research Question 2

Theme 1: Healthcare

Data science has gained popularity for solving medical and engineering problems. One of the methods to analysis the data science is community analytics, and this study focuses on community detection in network structure. Community detection is unique and can be applied to global concerns and address numerous challenges. We reviewed each article selected based on area problem and categorized it into six SubThemes listed below. Table 4 shows the most articles use hierarchical community detection in the healthcare field. Hierarchical community detection is also known as a dendrogram method. It is divided by divisive and agglomerative method. However, agglomerative method is a fast, accurate algorithm and suitable to apply for massive dataset (Anuar et al., 2021). The prevalent community detection algorithm used in the real-word network especially in healthcare field, is Louvain algorithm. This was proven by these qualitative findings.

Community detection can track new medical innovations through informal networks in healthcare. Artificial intelligence helps diagnose and predict big sample accuracy. This raising awareness to help health care providers make disease outbreak decisions (Choudhury et al., 2022). Chaoudry et al. proposed employ K-means clustering to examine the patterns of node participation and interaction of user participation of COVID-19 patients to their behavior in Tambaram, India (Choudhary et al., 2023). Two articles used Italian COVID-19 dataset and the study employed the Walktrap community detection to extract communities of hospitalized with symptoms, intensive care, total hospitalized, home isolation, total currently positive, new currently positive, discharged, deceased, total cases and swabs network. This study use graph analytics representation to highlight COVID-19 diffusion similarity among regions (Agapito et al., 2022)-(Milano & Cannataro, 2020). An article examining the microbiome dataset during Influenza A Virus found that the infected group recovered quickly after the second infection. The microbial interaction network applied clique based algorithm to analyze

gut microbiome data from fecal samples collected from both healthy pigs and pigs infected with the IAV at various time points (Bhar et al., 2022). Hence, the beneficial is the healthcare field can find out the gut microbiome and its proteins may help design new antiviral drugs for disease of influenza A.

On the other hand, Chatterjee and Sanjeev, 2023 used Louvain to find communities based on functional similarity characterization in Epstein-Barr virus (EBV)-associated carcinomas network (Chatterjee & Sanjeev, 2023). Another example is tissue phenotyping in colorectal cancer histology images, the evident carried out that the dataset like Gastric cancer (GC), Nasopharyngeal cancer (NPC), Hodgkin's lymphoma (HL), and Burkitt's lymphoma (BL) were found in the disease-gene network (S. Javed et al., 2020). From the communities show that the carcinomas infected by EBV are associated with tyrosine-protein kinase (ABL1) as it was observed through over-representation analysis. ABL1 plays a vital role in 3 out of 9 biological processes. Recently, Cyscape as visualization tools was employed for protein interaction network analysis, disease gene prediction, and drug discovery. Singhal et al., 2020 created CDAPS (Community Detection APplication and Service) and deployed as an app in the Cytoscape platform for network analysis of biological structure (Singhal et al., 2020).

Another finding that stands out from the results reported earlier is in recommendation system subthemes. Community detection based on user graph connections proposes an accurate recommender system. Sangaiah et al., 2023 used Johnson and Louvain community detection to find a set of nodes in the recommendation system about e-healthcare services (Sangaiah et al., 2023). Another best practical application is the meal recommendation systems include a user's diet, recipes, and inclination for healthy eating. Moscato and Sperlì, 2022 evaluated eating habits and physical activities to identify groups with similar lifestyles for improving system performance and the experiment used label propagation algorithm (LPA) as a community detection process (Moscato & Sperlì, 2022). This is linked to a similar case in Rostami et al., 2023 that applied a well-known community detection named as Laplacian. The model recommends healthy foods to the target user based on user preferences and food health factors (Rostami et al., 2023).

In recent years, brain networks as one of the practical applications also have challenged identifying community structures. Neuroimaging analysis most often uses modularity maximization to segment static brain networks into non-overlapping, strongly interconnected modules by maximizing an objective function of modularity. Zhu, Liu and Chong, 2023 examined the block term decomposition (BTD) based on tensor approach applied to epilepsy electroencephalography (EEG) data to analyze and quantify electrophysiological brain network topological dynamics during natural music listening (Zhu et al., 2023). Meanwhile, Mueller et al.,2021 used a heavily sampled female with 30 days of continuous brain imaging and venipuncture measurements to evaluate resting-state community structure across the menstrual cycle using dynamic community identification algorithms (GenLouvain) (Mueller et al., 2021). Also, another evidence can be shown in Jin et al., 2020, where the Louvain was implemented to functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) connectivity (Jin et al., 2020).

From the observation of the protein network, it also can be applied with community detection. Rahiminejad, Maurya and Subramaniam, 2019 proved that Louvain technique detects known core pathways faster than spinglass, CONCLUDE, combo, fast greedy, and

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

leading eigen for yeast and human protein-protein interaction (PPI) networks (Rahiminejad et al., 2019). Other researcher said that cancer biology and kinase signalling treatments have improved due to the effects of kinase pathways and overactivation on carcinogenesis by using community detection (Basanta et al., 2023). At first, community detection methods locate kinase sub-communities that reflect individual signalling pathways, then empirical kinase-kinase activity markers are utilised to form networks from these subcommunities. It will assist in finding cancer treatments without the most researched mesoscale structure.

One further practical application in community detection is to explore incompatibility of traditional Chinese medicine (TCM) [96]. TCM has been an integral part of Chinese society for hundreds of years, providing both a theoretical and practical framework for addressing medical issues. The TCM includes acupuncture, medicinal wine, formula, and diet (Zhou et al., 2020). The most common use community detection is medical formula, which contains numerous Chinese herbs and the TCM's use label importance-based label propagation algorithm (LILPA).

According to animal scientists, family units were crucial to animal social behavior, which led to the growth of many animal societies (Evans et al., 2022). Evans, Lindholm and König, 2022 shows through social network analysis, researcher can track female mice roles in social groups over time and generations. This understanding led them to study the factors that affect female mice's first litters in their natal group, signaling they will breed there. The evolutionary history and relationships of species in biological networks are studied by phylogenetics. Ding et al., 2022 using Phylogenetic Planted Partition Model (PPPM) dynamic community identification identified these associations (Liu et al., 2022). Please refer Table 3 for more information about the practical application in community detection.

	Auth	Dataset	Commun	Soft	Link code	
Ν	or		ity	war	provided / Link	
0	(Year		detection	e	dataset	SubTh
)		used	use		eme
				d		
	Agap		PANC	-	-	
	ito,		(Parallel			
	Mila	Italian COVID-19 Data	Network			
	no		Analysis			
	and		and			
1	Cann		Commun			
	ataro		ities			
	(202		Detectio			
	2)		n)			
	Mila		Walktrap	R	https://github.co	Diseas
	no		F	_	m/pcmdpc/COV	e
2	and	Italian COVID-19 Data			ID-19	Netwo
	Cann					rk
	ataro					

Table 3

Author (Year).	Dataset and	Community	Detection	Method	for Healthcare	Theme

	(202					
	0)			_		
3	Chou dhur y <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 2)	Indian COVID-19 Data	K-means	R	-	
4	Bhar <i>et al.</i> (202 2)	Microbiome data during Influenza A Virus	Maximal -Clique based MCCD- WN	C and R	https://github.co m/AniBhar84/M CCD-WN	
5	Chatt erjee and Sanje ev (202 3)	Disease-gene network linked to Epstein-Barr virus (EBV) using the DisGeNET (v7.0) data	Louvain	-	-	
6	Javed <i>et al.</i> (202 0)	Tissue phenotyping in colorectal cancer histology images	K-Means	-	-	
7	Sang aiah <i>et al.</i> (202 3)	Digitalization e-Healthcare Services	Johnson and Louvain	-	-	
8	Mosc ato and Sperl ì (202 2)	eHealth Data (User, Food, Exercise) -MyFitnessPal users	ACLCut based on conducta nce	Neo 4j Mic roso ft Azu re	-	Reco mmen dation Syste m
9	Rosta mi <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 3)	Healthy and Time-ware Food Recommender System	LPA	-	www.allrecipes. com and www.food.com	
1 0	Ahm adian <i>et al</i> .	Healthy and Time-ware Food Recommender System	Laplacia n	-	www.allrecipes. com/	

	(202 2)					
1 1	Kram er <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 0b)	REasons for Geographic and Racial Differences in Stroke (REGARDS) dataset	 K Nearest Neighbor s (KNN) L ouvain L eiden N BR-Clust clusterin g 	-	_	
1 2	Al- Shar oa, Al- Khas sawe neh and Aviy ente (201 9)	Brain network from Bangor Resting State Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging (rs-fMRI) dataset	K-Means	-	-	
1 3	Zhu, Liu and Cong (202 3)	Brain Functional Networks during Music Listening	Tensor method	MA TL AB	-	Brain Netwo rk
1 4	Muel ler <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 1)	Functional brain networks across a female menstrual cycle	Modulari ty maximiz ation- GenLouv ain	MA TL AB	-	
1 5	Nallu samy and Easw araku mar (202 3)	COBRE dataset-Schizophrenia disorder patient from Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging (fMRI)	Louvain	-	-	

1 6	Nicol ini, Bordi er and Bifon e (201 7)	Brain network-fMRI Connectivity	 L ouvain A symptoti cal Surprise optimize d with PACO I nfomap 	C+ + in MA TL AB, Oct ave, Pyt hon.	https://github.co m/carlonicolini/l frwmx	
1 7	Jin, Li and Xu 2020 (b)	Brain network-fMRI Connectivity	Louvain	-	http://www.nitrc .org/ projects/nyu trt/	
1 8	Kara aslan li <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 3)	Epilepsy electroencephalography (EEG) data	Modulari ty maximiz ation	Pyt hon	https://github.co m/SPLab- aviyente/MLMo dularityForEEG	
19	Li <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (201 9)	Herb network-Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM)	ANti- communi ty detection algorith m based on the Degree and the RaTio (ANDER TION)	С		Medic ine Netwo rk
2 0	Zhan g <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 0)	Chronic glomerulonephritis (CGN) data and core herbs in TCM	LILPA	-	https://github.co m/yunzhangww w/TCM- literature-corpus	
2 1	Rahi minej ad, Maur ya and Subr aman iam	Yeast and human protein-protein interaction (PPI) network	 L ouvain S pinglass C ONCLU DE C ombo 	R	https://thebiogri d.org/	

2	(201 9) Zhuo		 F ast Greedy L eading Eigen Graph 	-	-	Protei n
2	<i>et al.</i> (202 2)	Non-coding RNA (ncRNA)–Protein Interactions (NPI)	Neural Network (GNN)			Netwo rk
2 3	Basa nta <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (202 3)	Kinase network	Modulari ty maximiz ation	Pyt hon	https://github. com/celiaccb/Ki nasesCommunit yDetection	
2 4	Dolu ca and Oğuz (202 1)	Yeast and human protein-protein interac-tion (PPI) network	 C PM C OPRA N eighbour hood- Inflated Seed Expansio n (NISE) 	-	-	
2 5	Grant , Ahne rt and Estra da (201 8)	Protein Data Bank	Infomap	Mo ngo DB data bas e	-	
2 6	K. Kabir <i>et al.</i> (201 9)	Template-Free Protein structure prediction	 L ouvain G reedy Modulari ty Maximiz ation (GMM). 	Pyt hon	-	
2 7	Evan s, Lind holm and Köni g	Female house mice preferentially breed	Louvain	_	-	Biolog ical Netwo rk

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

	(202					
	2)					
	Liu		DCD	-	-	
	et al.		Phylogen			
	(202		etic			
2	2)	Phylogenetic Evolution	Planted			
8			Partition			
0			Model,			
			PPPM			

Table 4

Author (Year), Dataset and Community Detection Method for Social Network Theme

		Dataset	Communi	Softw	Link code provided / Link	SubThe
Ν	Author		ty	are	dataset	me
о.	(Year)		detection	used		
			used			
	Al-Mukhtar	Twittor-	Structure-	Pytho	-	
	and Al-	Political	Attribute	n		
	Shamery	wob-blogs	Similarity			
1	(2019)	web-blogs	(SASClust			
			er)			
	Alduaiji,		Temporal	-	-	
	Datta and Li	Twitter,	interactio			Online
	(2018)	Facebook,	ns biased			Social
		and	(TIB)			Network
		Amazon	Clique-			(Twitter)
2			based			
			overlappi			
			ng			
	Cotelo <i>et al.</i>	Twitter	Spectral	-	-	
	(2020)	written in	Biclusteri			
		Spanish of	ng			
3		political				
		domain				
	Irsyad and	Twitter	Louvain	-	-	
	Rakhmawat	about				
	i (2020)	Indonesia				
		n				
		presidenti				
4		al election				
		process				
	Torene <i>et</i>	Twitter	Louvain	-	-	
5	al. (2022)	and Parler				
6	Kannan,	Online	Hybrid	-	-	
	Mannathaz	social	honey			
	hathu and	networks	badger			

Raghavan (2022)optimizati on-based African vulture algorithm (HHBA)optimizati on-based African vulture algorithm (HHBA)Bi et al. (2021)Mobile phone from setts Institute of Technolog y Trace DataGu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile setts Institute of Technolog y Trace DataAttributes and node interestsGu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social InstituteAttributes and node interestsGu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social Internet y of Things (SIOT)Modularit y maximizat ionCao et al. (2019)Social ips, temp- spatial distributio and n, and l pattern characteriNon- r r r adtore1 Mohasefi and Mohasefi and (2021)Mouling in mobile social retworksAdaptive r r ormunit y detection1 Mahdipour (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive r r r ormunit y detection1 1 (2022)Park and security titeligenc cLouvain Neo4jNeo4j r2Park and security detectionCommunit y detectionNeo4j r-Communit r							
(2022)on-based African wulture algorithm (HHBA)Bi et al. (2021)Mobile phone transient records from y (DTSC)on-based algorithm (HHBA)Bi et al. (2021)Mobile phone transient records from y (DTSC)on-based algorithm (HHBA)Gu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social networksAttributes and node interests-Gu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social interestsAttributes and node interests-Ralekshahi (2023)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio sition n, and behaviora lMon- regetive matrix decompo sition-Moradi, Mohasefi and mahilopur (2021)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio sition n, and distributio y detectionNon- relationsh ips, temp- matrix decompo distributio y detection-Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive recommunit y detection-Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive recommunit y detection-Park and (2022) intelligenc c e (CSI)Louvain recommunit yNeo4j recommunit recommunit y-1 (2022) intelligenc e tCommunit y2e e (CSI)Communit recommunit y1 (2022)c intelligenc e e (CSI)C c reco		Raghavan		optimizati			
African vulture algorithm (HHBA)African vulture algorithm (HHBA)African vulture algorithm (HHBA)Bi et al. (2021)Mobile phone transient records from setts Institute of Technolog (2019)Dynamic transient y (DTSC)7Gu, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social networksAttributes and node interests8Gu, Liu and (2019)Mobile Social interestsAttributes and node interests9Gu, Liu and (2019)NetworksModularit interests9Malekshahi (StoT)Social interestsModularit interests1Cao et al. (2019)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and heaviora l paterNon- negative matrix decompo sition1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection1Moradi, mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection1Moradi, mobile social networksLouvainNeo4j-2e (CSi) detectionLouvainNeo4j-		(2022)		on-based			
Bi et al. (2021) Mobile phone records from social from communit Dynamic ransient social from communit - - Bi et al. (2021) Mobile phone from cords Dynamic transient social from communit - - Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes and node interests - - Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social Networks Modularit ion - - Makshahi Rad et al. (2019) Social Networks Modularit ion - - Gao et al. (2019) Social networks Non- negative ion - - Makshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social netreet of Things ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora I pattern characteri stics. Non- negative matrix decompo distributio stiion - - Moradi, Mohasefi 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - Park and Kwon security 1 (2022) Courity intelligenc e Louvain Neo4j Neo4j -				African			
algorithm (HHBA) - - Bi et al. (2021) Mobile phone from vecords from setts Institute of Technolog y Trace Data Dynamic communit womssetu y (DTSC) - - Gu, Liu and (2019) Mobile y Trace Data Attributes interests - - Gu, Liu and (2019) Mobile Networks Attributes interests - - Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social of Things isp, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora Mon- regative istion n, and 1 - - Moradi, Mohasefi 1 Mohasefi 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Non- communit ecompo sticion n, and 1 - - Moradi, Mohasefi 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection networks - - Park and Kwon security 1 Coyler (C02) Louvain Neo4j Neo4j - -				vulture			
Bi et al. Mobile phone records from social from social from motive setts Institute of Technolog y Trace Data Dynamic transient social communit y (DTSC) setts Institute of Technolog y Trace Data - - 7 Gu, Liu and (2019) Mobile Networks Attributes interests - - 8 Gu, Liu and (2019) Mobile Networks Attributes interests - - 9 Ga et al. (2019) Social Interest ion Modularit - - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social Interest istics. Non- negative matrix decompo distributio n, and NMFF) - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Park and Kwon security intelligenc Adaptive communit y detection - - -				algorithm			
Bi et al. Mobile phone transient records social communit Massachu setts Institute of Technolog y Trace Data - - Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social and node (2019) Attributes interests - - Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social of Things (SloT) Modularit y y - - Malekshahi Rad et al. (2019) Social negative interests Non- relationsh negative spatial decompo distributio sition n, and behaviora - - Moradi, Mohasefi and Mahipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Non- relationsh isp, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition n, and (NMF) - - Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection networks - - Park and Kwon security Cyber e (CSI) Louvain Neo4j - -				(HHBA)			
(2021)phone records social from social from y (DTSC)transient social communit y (DTSC)7Nassachu y (DTSC)M7Y Trace DataNe6u, Liu and Wang (2019)Mobile Social networksAttributes interests-8Gu, Liu and Vang (2019)Mobile Social Internet of Things (SIOT)Modularit maximizat ion9Cao et al. (2019)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio sition n, and behaviora l 1Non- negative interest1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksNon- relationsh ips, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition n, and (INMF)1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection9Park and (CSI)Covain communit y detection1(2022) intelligenc e (2021)Covain e colaNeo4j e-		Bi et al.	Mobile	Dynamic	-	-	
7 records social from Massachu y (DTSC) M 7 Utiu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes and node Networks - - 8 Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes interests - - 8 Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social Internet of Things (SIOT) Modularit waximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social Internet of Things (SIOT) Non- negative matrix decompo sition n, and (INMF) - - 1 Dehaviora I pattern characteri stics. Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc e Louvain Neo4j - -		(2021)	phone	transient			
7 From communit Massachu y (DTSC) setts Institute of Technolog y Trace Data M 7 Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes and node interests - - 8 Malekshahi (2023) Social of Things (SloT) Modularit maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social networks Non- maximizat ion - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social no Non- maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social networks Non- matrix decompo sition - - 1 behaviora l pattern characteri social networks Non- matrix decompo sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and social networks Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Mahipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 2 Cyber Kwon Louvain Neo4j - -			records	social			
7 Massachu y (DISC) M 9 Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes interests - - 8 Malekshahi (2019) Social Networks Modularit interests - - 9 Malekshahi (2023) Social of Things Modularit maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social Internet (SIOT) Non- negative matrix - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition n, and I pattern characteri stics. Non- negative matrix - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 9 Park and Kwon security Louvain intelligenc e (CSI) Neo4j - -			from	communit			
7 Setts Institute of Ne 7 Technolog y Trace Ne 8 Social Attributes - - 8 Social and node - - 9 Malekshahi Social Modularit - - 9 Malekshahi Social Modularit - - 9 Cao et al. Social Non- - - 1 Cao et al. Social Non- - - 1 Cao et al. Social Non- - - 1 Moradi, Routing in negative - - 1 Moradi, Routing in Adaptive - - 1 Mahasefi and - - - 1 Mahaipour attributos - - - 1 Moradi, Routing in Adaptive - - 1 Mahaipour attributos - - - 1 Mahaipour attributos - - - 1 Mahaipour attributos - - - 1 Mahoipour </td <td></td> <td></td> <td>Massachu</td> <td>y (DISC)</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Mahila</td>			Massachu	y (DISC)			Mahila
7 Institute of Technolog y Trace Data Attributes and node (2019) - - - 8 Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social interests Attributes and node interests - - 8 Malekshahi Rad <i>et al.</i> (2023) Social of Things (SIOT) Modularit interests - - 9 Cao <i>et al.</i> (2019) Social relationsh relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora I pattern (2021) Non- relationsh iss, temp- spatial distributio sition n, and I pattern (2021) - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 (2022) intelligenc 2 Louvain Neo4j - -			Setts				
7 Technolog y Trace Data - - Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes and node interests - - 8 Malekshahi (2023) Social of Things (SloT) Modularit y maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial 0 Non- relationsh ips, temp- spatial 1 - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial 1 Non- negative matrix decompo distributio sition n, and pehaviora - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc e Louvain Neo4j - -			of				SOCIAI
7 VTrace Data Attributes and node (2019) - - 8 Gu, Liu and Wang (2019) Mobile Social Networks Attributes and node interests - - 8 Malekshahi Rad <i>et al.</i> Social Internet (2023) Modularit of Things (SloT) - - 9 Cao <i>et al.</i> Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora I pattern characteri stics. Non- negative matrix decompo sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 9 Moradi, Mohasefi and Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Mahdipour (2021) Cyber kwon security intelligenc e Louvain Neo4j -			UI				Network
7 Data Data Gu, Liu and Wobile Attributes - Wang (2019) Social Networks and node interests - 8 Malekshahi Rad et al. Internet (2023) Modularit of Things (SIOT) - - 9 Cao et al. (SIOT) Social negative maximizat ion - - 1 Cao et al. (SIOT) Social negative matrix decompo spatial distributio sition n, and behaviora l pattern characteri stics. NMF) - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi networks Routing in networks Adaptive communit y detection networks - 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in networks Adaptive communit y detection networks - - 1 (2022) intelligenc e (CSI) intelligenc e (CSI) Louvain Neo4j -	7		v Trace				
Gu, Liu and Wang Mobile Social Attributes and node interests - - 8 Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social Internet of Things (SIOT) Modularit y maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social Internet of Things (SIOT) Mon- negative matrix decompo distributio sition - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio sition Non- negative matrix decompo sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc e Couvain Neo4j - -	<i>'</i>		y nace Data				
Soc, Eta ind Monote Attributes Wang (2019) Social Networks and node interests 8 Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social Internet of Things (SIOT) Modularit y maximizat ion - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora l pattern characteri stics. Non- negative matrix decompo sition - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Non- negative istion - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc 2 Louvain Neo4j -		Gu Liu and	Mohile	Attributes	_		
Native Jordin Horizon 8 Networks internets Malekshahi Social Modularit - Rad et al. Internet of Things (SloT) Modularit ion - - 9 Cao et al. Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora 0 Non- regative matrix decompo sition - - 1 Noradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Non- regative matrix - - 1 Moradi, Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc Louvain Neo4j - - 2 e (CSI) intelligenc E C Networks		Wang	Social	and node			
8 New Year New Year New Year 8 Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social of Things (SloT) Modularit y maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio distributio sition Non- negative matrix decompo distributio sition - - 1 0 Noradi, Mohasefi and Noting in mobile social networks Noting in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc 2 Louvain Neo4j - -		(2019)	Networks	interests			
Malekshahi Rad et al. (2023) Social Internet of Things (SloT) Modularit y maximizat ion - - 9 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition Non- relationsh negative ips, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Non- relationsh matrix sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Adaptive social networks - - - - 1 Adaptive social networks - - - - 1 (2021) Cyber security Louvain Neo4j - - 1 (2022) intelligenc intelligenc C I C Ne	8	(2020)					
Rad et al. (2023)Internet of Things (SIOT)y maximizat ion9Cao et al. (2019)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio distributio n, and 0Non- negative matrix decompo sition (NMF)-1 0Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Non- relationsh ips, temp- spatial decompo distributio sition n, and l pattern characteri stics.Non- negative matrix decompo sition (NMF)1 1 1 1 1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-1 2Park and Kwon (2022)Cyber intelligenc e e (CSI)Louvain Neo4j-2e (CSI)Cyber intelligencLouvain e intelligencNeo4j-		Malekshahi	Social	Modularit	-	-	
9(2023)of Things (SIOT)maximizat ion9Cao et al. (2019)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora l pattern characteri stics.Non- - - negative matrix decompo sition (NMF)- -		Rad <i>et al.</i>	Internet	у			
9 (SIoT) ion - - 1 Cao et al. (2019) Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and behaviora 0 Non- regative matrix decompo sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Non- matrix decompo sition - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - 1 Park and Kwon Cyber security intelligenc Louvain Neo4j - 2 e (CSI) Intelligenc Intelligenc CC		(2023)	of Things	maximizat			
Cao et al. (2019)Social relationsh ips, temp- spatial distributio distributio sition n, and 0Non- negative matrix decompo sition (NMF)-1	9		(SIoT)	ion			
Cao et al.SocialNon(2019)relationshnegativenegativeips, temp-spatialdecompodistributiositionn,n,and(NMF)1behavioraipattern0ipatterncharacteri1patterncharacteristics.Adaptive-1Adaptive-1Adaptive-1andnetworks1Mahdipournetworks2e(CSI)2e(CSI)det cintelligencat acintelligenc1(2022)intelligenc2e(CSI)at acintelligenc1(2022)intelligencintelligencat acintelligenc2intelligenc3intelligenc4intelligenc4intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc2intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1intelligenc1in							
(2019)relationshnegativeips, temp- spatialmatrix decompodistributiositionn, and behaviora(NMF)1pattern characteri stics1pattern characteri stics1Moradi, MohasefiRouting in mobile social networksAdaptive y detection-1Adaptive social networks2Park and KwonCyber securityLouvainNeo4j1(2022) intelligenc deteColor otherO		Cao et al.	Social	Non-	-	-	
1ips, temp- spatial distributio n, and l pattern characteri stics.matrix decompo sition n, and l pattern characteri stics.1Moradi, Mohasefi and 1Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection- c communit y detection1Park and Kwon security 2Cyber intelligenc e e (CSI)Louvain Neo4j- c CO CO Ne		(2019)	relationsh	negative			
1spatial distributiodecompo sition1n, and behaviora(NMF)0I pattern characteri stics1pattern characteri stics1Moradi, Mohasefi and 1Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-1Park and Kwon securityCyber securityLouvainNeo4j1(2022) intelligenc e detection-C2e(CSI) e-C			ips, temp-	matrix			
1distributiosition1n, and(NMF)behavioraI pattern1patterncharacteristics.Moradi,Routing inMohasefiRouting inandsocial1Mahdipour(2021)networksPark andCyberLouvainNeo4j1(2022)1(2022)1(2022)1(2021)			spatial	decompo			
1n, and (NMF)1behaviora0I pattern characteri stics.1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection1Moradi, Mohasefi and (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-2Park and Kwon security intelligenc e (CSI)Louvain e louvainNeo4j-1(2022) intelligenc e detectCO louvainNeo4j-			distributio	sition			
1 behaviora behaviora 0 I pattern characteri 1 pattern characteri 1 stics. Adaptive - 1 Mohasefi Routing in Adaptive - 1 and social y detection 1 Mahdipour retworks V detection 1 Park and Cyber Louvain Neo4j - 2 e (CSI) Neo4j - O			n, and	(NMF)			
0 I pattern characteri stics. Adaptive - - - 1 Moradi, Mohasefi and 1 Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - - 1 Mahdipour (2021) Routing in mobile social networks Adaptive communit y detection - - Park and Kwon Cyber security Louvain Neo4j - - 1 (2022) intelligenc e (CSI) Neo4j - Cover Neo4j	1		behaviora				
Characteri stics.Characteri stics.Moradi, Mohasefi and 1Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-1Mahdipour (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-Park Kwon (2022)Cyber security intelligenc e e (CSI)Louvain eNeo4j-1(2022) intelligenc e detectCC	0		I pattern				
Stics.Adaptive communit y detection-1Moradi, Mohasefi and 1Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-1Mahdipour (2021)Routing in mobile social networksAdaptive communit y detection-Park Kwon (2022)Covain intelligenc e e (CSI)Neo4j-1(2022) intelligenc e detectionCovain Neo4jNeo4j			characteri				
Moradi, Mohasefi Routing in mobile Adaptive - - 1 And Communit - - 1 Mahdipour (2021) social networks y detection Park and Cyber Louvain Neo4j 1 (2022) intelligenc O 2 e (CSI) Image: CSI			STICS.	A .ll			
Monaseri and 1mobile social networkscommunit y detection1Mahdipour (2021)mobile social networksy detectionPark KwonCyber securityLouvainNeo4j1(2022)intelligenc e detectionC Neo4j		Mahaaafi	Routing in	Adaptive	-	-	
1 and Mahdipour (2021) social networks y detection Park and Kwon Cyber Louvain 1 (2022) intelligenc 2 e (CSI)	1	IVIONaseti	mobile	communit			
Imanupour (2021) networks detection Park and Cyber Louvain Neo4j Kwon security 1 (2022) intelligenc 2 e detection	1	dnu	social	y dotoction			
Park and Cyber Louvain Neo4j Kwon security 1 (2022) e (CSI)			networks	detection			
Kwon security 1 (2022) e (CSI)		(2021) Park and	Cyber	Louvain	Neodi	_	
1 (2022) intelligenc C 2 e (CSI) Ne		Kwon	security	LUUVAIII	11004j	-	
2 e (CSI)	1	(2022)	intelligenc				Cyber
	2	(2022)	e (CSI)				Network
	-		data				

1 3	S. Li <i>et al.</i> (2023)	BotFinder	Louvain	-	https://security.bytedanc e.com/fe/ai- challenge#/sec- project?id=2&active=1	
1	Alcayde <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (2018)	Scopus Database - Publicatio n about Renewab e Energy and scientific	Modularit y maximizat ion	Gephi	-	Collabor ation Network
1 5	Zhang <i>et al.</i> (2023)	Collaborat ion network for statisticia ns	Edge Cross- Validation (ECV)	-	_	
1 6	Akbar, Liu and Latif (2021)	Social applicatio ns network from business perspectiv e	Modularit y maximizat ion	-	_	
1 7	Yunlei Zhang <i>et al.</i> (2019)	Online forum Reddit and academic cooperati on network DBLP	Dynamic topical communit y detection (DTCD)	Pytho n	-	
1 8	Jiang <i>et al.</i> (2020)	Football Matches of 2018 FIFA World Cup	Bottom- up communit y detection mechanis m (BPCD) trajectory -based	-	-	Sport Network
1 9	Chessa <i>et</i> <i>al.</i> (2023)	Basketball plavers	Louvain	-	-	

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

Theme 2: Social Network

Social networks now influence people's opinions, decisions, and lifestyles. Therefore, with the rapid growth of social network data, more reliable for community detection are needed. Research challenge in network science is finding and prioritizing key nodes (Mukhtar, Abal Abas, et al., 2023). In Table 4 show the patterns in Theme 2 with five SubThemes.

Facebook, Twitter, and LinkedIn are significant social networks that use community detection. Political web-blogs based on Twitter dataset were analyzed using temporal interactions biassed (TIB) clique-based overlaps to determine their interactions, density, subjects, and size-activity connection over time (Alduaiji et al., 2018). Cotelo et al., 2020 illustrated the overall twitter written in Spanish about political using spectral biclustering (Cotelo et al., 2020).

Twitter lets users send short messages to interested parties. Twitter is also a vast laboratory of information and connections that can be used to analyze opinions on any topic and test sociological ideas (Cotelo et al., 2020). In the results, some communities support traditional Spanish parties. It is also vital to remember that a community tied to a social movement that led to the birth of a new political party may be able to forecast the future. Knowledge of user relationships improves social recommendations. Other researchers, Zhang et al. integrated node interaction transience and social links to examine how social features affect behavior patterns [41]. Bi et al., 2021 proved that the contact model was based on actual and social contact, and the similarity formula was used to detect community based on DTSC (Bi et al., 2021).

Park and Kwon, 2022 works the relation of cyber security intelligence (CSI) user list, phrase list, tweets written by the users in CSI and List and news articles were analyzed using community detection to detect cyberattack (J.-H. Park & Kwon, 2022). Further research by S. Li et al., 2022, used Louvain in BotFinder to detect social bots. The study defined BotFinder and examined eight million records of users. Such dataset is used to extract social bot traits using machine learning and graph approaches. To produce account node vectors and apply unsupervised approach, they used Louvain to diffuse labels to improve graph performance (S. Li et al., 2023). Another researcher applies community detection in collaboration network. Alcayde et al. study the issue renewable energy as a research topic and scientific collaboration. This approach automatically retrieves bibliographic data from scientific papers using the Scopus Database API Interface and analyses it utilizing modularity community recognition algorithms and graph visualization in Gephi. The findings indicate that renewable energy research fields and collaboration network structures can be identified.

We also found there are certain problems in the sport network which applied the use of community detection. This is proved by Chessa et al., 2023 for the 2020–2021 National Basketball Association (NBA) regular season. (Chessa et al., 2023). Basketball players can use statistical analysis to make short- and long-term decisions using the presented strategy. Complex networks can detect NBA players in communities, according to the investigation.

Theme 3: Telecommunication

A significant challenge associated with telecommunication theme in the community detection is the mobile network. The increased availability of mobile devices with rich sensors and short-

range communication interfaces has enabled participatory and opportunistic Mobile CrowdSensing (MCS) (Capponi et al., 2019). This work focuses on crowd or co-location trace rhythm. Co-location traces report the identifier of devices in proximity with a timestamp. In Table 5 show the authors, dataset and community detection have been used.

Some researchers have focused on network-wide traffic control strategies including perimeter control and route directing in metropolitan networks, based on macroscopic fundamental diagram (MFD) theory, to reduce or delay congestion. Congestion hotspots are discovered using community detection theory (Guo et al., 2019). Based on Haghbayan, Geroliminis and Akbarzadeh, 2021, day-to-day traffic congestion in big urban networks can vary (Haghbayan et al., 2021). A cost-effective method using Infomap community detection was utilized to get communities near roadways to consider cluster homogeneity, contiguity, and compactness in a shorter computing time. This method's principal taxi system divides cities into homogenous, connected regions.

Another public transport is the rail transit route network. Ding et al., 2023 employed Louvain to assess and optimize rail network structure (Ding et al., 2022). China Railway data has fully adopted online ticketing, initiating e-commerce. Users can check the passenger train timetable, ticket price, remaining tickets, and more on the website. For years, Louvain measured train network community numbers. Amazingly, infrastructure or transport-related networks can be an aviation network. Wu et al., 2019 find community structures in airport and airline networks (W. Wu et al., 2019). Alot of the work that has already been done in this area is helpful for developing our modelling approach. Network community detection based on airport distance is less reliable than route-traffic-based community detection. Because it analyses how airlines handle travellers switching routes. Airlines' hubs are communities' core airports, can be classified more clearly. This simplifies airport relationships research. This community discovery uses low-order node and edge connectivity patterns and a traffic-driven weighted network indicator.

In advanced, a high-order connection is frequently a sub-network, a graph within a larger graph whose vertex and edge sets are subsets of the node and edge sets, respectively. A clique is a full network subgraph. It is a basic graph theory topic and network topology class. Yang and Le, 2021 proposed a clique-based community to address the highly interrelated regions of a weighted network (H. Yang & Le, 2021).

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

Table 5

Author (Year	r), Dataset and Communit	y Detection Method	for Telecommunication	Theme

		Dataset	Communi	Softwa	Link code	SubTh
Ν			ty	re	provided /	eme
о.	Author (Year)		detection	used	Link dataset	
			used			
	Belli <i>et al.</i>	ParticinAct	• iL	-	-	
	(2020)	Data- Mobile	CD			
		CrowdSensing	• in			Mobile
1		project	fomap			Netwo
			• TI			rк
			LES			
	Gaber,		• B	-	-	
2	Abdelbaki and	Nobile network-	ase			
2	Arata (2023)	Radio Access	stations			
		Network (RAN)	(BSS)			
	Zhang Zhong	Origin	Euroction			
	and Tsung	Destination (O-	al	-	-	
	(2023)	D) Path Flow	factorizat			
3	(2023)	Data in Hong	ion			
		Kong and	1011			
		Singapore				
	Guo et al.	Urban road	Fuzzy C-	-	-	
4	(2019)	network-Jinan	Means			
	. ,	City in China				
	Haghbayan,	Urban road	Infomap	-	-	
	Geroliminis	network-				
5	and	Shenzhen, China				
	Akbarzadeh	and San				
	(2021)	Francisco, USA				Public
	Huang <i>et al.</i>	Taxi System	Combo	-	-	Transp
-	(2018)	urban in	algorithm			Ort
6		Shanghai and	Walktrap			netwo
	Zhao at al	венник	Informan	Dubtor	https://apa	ΪŇ
7	211d0 et ul.	Taxi trajectories	ппотпар	Pynton	nttps://ope	
<i>'</i>	(2023)	in New York City			nowwork us/	
	Ding et al	Evolution of the	Louvain	Genhi	-	
	(2022)	China Rail				
8	()	Transit Route				
		Network				
		(CRTRN)				
9	Wu et al.	American	Clauset-	-	https://www.	
	(2019)	Airlines and	Newman-		oag.com and	
		Southwest	Moore		https://www.	
		Airlines	(CNM)		light-	

					stats.com on American Airlines (AAL) and Southwest Airlines (SWA	
1 0	Yang and Le (2021)	Air Transport Industry- Top 10 airline groups by passengers carried in 2019, including American Airlines Group, Delta Air Lines, Southwest Airlines, United Airlines, Ryanair, China Southern Airlines, Lufthansa Group, China Eastern Airlines, International Airlines Group (IAG) and Air China Group	Clique Percolati on Method (CPM)	-	https://ww w.oag.com/	
1 1	Han <i>et al.</i> (2022)	Power Grid- Electrical power systems (IEEE-39 bus and 118-bus test systems)	Di-Ag Dynamic commnit Y detection	-	-	Power Grid Netwo rk
1 2	Yang <i>et al.</i> (2022)	Power Grid Partition for Voltage Control	Balanced -depth- based	-	-	
1 3	Zu <i>et al.</i> (2021)	Service Function Chain online placement and migration problem in the cloud datacenter.	Louvain- Online two- stage heuristic (OTSH)	MATLA B	-	

Theme 4: Economics

In economic analysis, it's very important to understand how communities in a network are put together (Mukhtar, Abas, Rasib, Anuar, Zaki, Abidin, et al., 2023). Communities are

distinct from nodes and the network. These traits can impact network events. The reviewed list of economics' article is in Table 6. Since it combines cryptography, e-money, and blockchain, it has garnered the most bitcoin interest. Bitcoin is the most popular blockchain cryptocurrency and application (Xueshuo et al., 2021). Bitcoin's job is to share the ledger's record of balances among the actors. Peer-to-peer (P2P) computers that run the Bitcoin protocol build a flat, decentralised mesh network on top of the Internet. Nodes deliver and consume services in P2P networks.

Wu et al., 2021 examined community detection in blockchain networks (Wu et al., 2021). The researcher uses bitcoin and ethereum networks to demonstrate how spectral clustering community discovery has multiple applications. They modified community detection for the bitcoin network and applied it to the transaction social network to cluster like users. They created a smart contract-based bipartite social graph for Ethereum.

It is impossible to create a marketing strategy for each customer due to budgetary and logistical constraints, thus it is vital to group them and follow the same consumption habits. Traditionally, the corporation has focused exclusively on its optimization instead of its network. Co-marketing refers to strategic collaborations or partnerships. In recent years, retail and petroleum chains in Portugal have collaborated to retain customers and expand market share. Such partnerships exist in Portugal, such as the combined marketing between food retail chains Continente and Pingo Doce, and fuel brands Galp and BP (Fernandes et al., 2019b).

Certain consumers have related product needs. In 2021, Wu et al.'s findings on co-purchased product associations and their limitations, including redundancy of the extracted association rules, the potential to miss novel and interesting associations hidden in shopping behaviours, and neglect of several important influential factors. This study finds product communities using CFinder, COPRA, and Demon.

Outsourcing industrial production creates more complex business collaboration relationships, which overlap and blurs supply chain network enterprise communities. Assembler and supplier sequencing orders must be better understood to coordinate supply chain partner participation due to network complexity. For supply chain network architecture, Lu and Dong, 2023 developed a gravitation-based hierarchical community detection algorithm (GHSCA) (Lu & Dong, 2023).

T. Wang et al., 2023 pulled historical prices from 762 Chinese A-share market stock prices using AkShare, an open-source financial technology (T. Wang et al., 2023). Similar stock prices interact. KG and GCN combinations were suggested to improve stock price forecast accuracy. The data implant community detection using a GCN leverages modularity as the loss of stock clustering and reverse error transfer to improve clustering outcomes. Finally, a multivariate time series prediction model receives similar stock price data from the k-means clustering method to help understand the target stock's fluctuation trend and anticipate its stock price trend.

Additional observation in mechanical engineering field which applied the knowledge of Fast Newman (FN) community detection. Module partitioning of mechanical computer-aided

design (CAD) assembly model based on FN. FN, a quick and hierarchical approach for network community structure detection, can be used to locate modular structures in mechanical CAD assembly models by discovering communities in correlation connections networks for assembled parts.

Table 6

Author	(Year)	Dataset and	Community	v Detection	Method	for Econon	nic Theme
Author	reurj	, Dulusel unu	communit	Delection	Wiethou	ווטוו בנטווטוו	IIC IIICIIIC

		Dataset	Com	Soft	Link code provided / Link dataset
			muni	war	
Ν	Autho		tv	е	
0	r		detec	use	
	(Year)		tion	d	
•	(reary		used	ŭ	
	Essaid		K-	-	_
1	and lu	Bitcoin Transaction Network	Moon		
1	(2022)	(Cryptocurrency)	Ivicali		
	(2022)		5		
	xuesn		AWA	-	-
	uo et	Bitcoin de-anonymization	Р		
	al.	,			
2	(2021)				
	S. X.		Spect	-	http://vo.elte.hu/bitcoin
	Wu et	Blockchain Social Network	ral		
	al.	blockenam social Network	clust		
3	(2021)		ering		
	Ferna		LART	-	-
	ndes				
	et al.	Co-marketing multilayer network			
4	(2019)				
	Grassi		CPM)	-	-
5	et al	International Trade Network-Wold	C:,		
5	(2021)	Trade Dataset			
	(2021)		Louv		
	J.	John hausing Dauta. The same of	LOUV	-	-
	wang	Jobs-housing Route: The case of	ain		
	et al.	Beijing			
6	(2022)				
	Wu et	Construction of a Co-demanded	 CFind 	-	Alimama
7	al.	Product Network	er		(https://tianchi.aliyun.com/dataset/da
	(2021)	i loddet Network	 COPR 		taDetail?dataId=649).
			А		
			• Dem		
			on		
	Lu and	Smart phone battery production for	GHSC	Pyth	-
8	Dong	structuring the supply chain	А	on	
	(2023)	network			
	Monte		• Robu	-	-
	S-		st		
	Orozc		colori		
	o et		ng		
	al		nrohl		
	(2022)	Employment in Mexico during	probl		
	(2025)	COVID-19 Pandemic			
			(KCP)		
9			• verte		
			х		
			cover		
1			probl		

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

			em		
			(VCP)		
1	Т.	Largo scalo Stock Price Prodiction	• K-	Java	https://github.com/Gjl12321/KG_GCN
0	Wang	Large-scale Stock Frice Frediction	mean	and	_Stock_Price_Trend_Prediction_Syste
	et al.		s	Pyth	m
	(2023)		• GCN	on	
	Yan		Spect	-	-
1	and	Now York Stock Market	ral		
1	Yang	New YORK SLOCK Market	clust		
	(2023)		ering		
	Han et		FFN	MA	-
1	al.	CAD assembly		TLA	
2	(2018)			В	

Theme 5: Intelligent

Building massive face datasets from Internet photographs is easy now. Video, text, and image data are growing every second. In real problem is time consuming to process the large images in database. Table 7 shows the real-world application used (dataset used) in community detection was reviewed in the intelligent theme. Jin et al. 2018 proposed to eliminate mislabeled photos using facenet community detection and deep convolutional neural network (CNN) model (Jin et al., 2018).

Open-source software (OSS) ecosystem understanding can be gained through community detection. OSS involves voluntary cooperation amongst scattered developers using open-source platforms like GitHub. In the last 20 years, millions of software developers have used the git control version system to keep track of their projects and make it easy to share their work. GitHub is a prominent version control system that offers free online git repositories (De Luca et al., 2023).

Sensor networks will be larger and more diverse in future smart cities, collecting data from multiple services and constructing more complex topologies. During the Internet of Things (IoT) era, huge, distributed sensor networks will generate large amounts of different types of data, which will increase the need for efficient and effective processing. A novel data clustering framework for massive sensory data from IoT applications was proposed by Karyotis et al., 2018 (Karyotis et al., 2018). It's important to accurately detect and analyze the community structure in large internet protocol (IP) networks to optimize and secure them. CDSCB community detection based on similarity of behavior in IP networks was employed by Zhang et al., 2022 (Zhang et al., 2022).

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

Table 7

Author (Year), Dataset and Community Detection Method for Intelligent Theme.

_					
		Dataset	Commu	Soft	Link code provided / Link dataset
Ν			nity	war	
0	Author		detecti	е	
	(Year)		on used	use	
	()			d	
	lin et		Eaconet	Dyth	https://github.com/davidsandberg/facenet
	~/		racenet	i ytii	https://github.com/uaviusaliuberg/lacenet
	ui.	Original MSCeleb-1M image		on	
	(2018)	dataset		and	
1				Gep	
				hi	
	De		К-	Pyth	-
	Luca		Means	on	
	et al			in	
	2023)	Repository Mining - Github		 Goo	
	2023)	Dataset			
2				gie	
2				Cola	
				b	
	Qi and		 Canopy 	-	-
	Cao		• Meta-		
	(2023)		path		
	. ,		based		
		Open-Source Software	for		
		Encourter Cithub Datasat	Ilataraa		
		Ecosystem-Github Dataset	Heterog		
			eneous		
			commu		
3			nity		
			detecti		
			on		
			(MFTH		
	Poddy		Machin	_	
	Kelli		wiachin	-	
	KOIII		e .		
	and	Malware detection	learning		
	Balakri				
4	shnan				
	(2021)				
	Singha		 CliXO 	Java	https://github.com/cytoscape/cy-
5	l et al.	Bioinformatic in Cytoscape	BGLL /		community-detection
	(2020)	App.			https://github.com/cytoscape/communityd
	(2020)		Informe		atection_rest_server
			• infoma		
			р		
			 OSLOM 		
	Wang		Modula	-	-
	and	Botnet traffic captured in	rity		
	Pascha	the Czech Technical	maximi		
6	lidis	University	zation		
	(2017)	ereioity			
	Xuo at		Incrom	Duth	https://github.com/Chuppyu/Yup/Incroment
	AUE EL		antel	ryun	al CroupSposifie Decomposed or Sustant
	ui.	Cold Start Recommendation	ental	on	al_Groupspecific_kecommender_system
	(2019)	System	commu		
7		-,	nity		
			detecti		
			on		

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

	Li et		 Dynami 	MA	-
	al.		С	TLA	
	(2018)		trustwo	В	
			rthiness		
			overlap		
			ping		
			commu		
		Mobile Internet of Things	nity		
		(IoT)	detecti		
			on		
			scheme		
			(D2-		
			TOC)		
			based		
			on		
			improv		
8			ed		
			random		
			walks		
			and		
			 Seeds 		
			expansi		
			on		
			algorith		
	Kanat		ms		
	karyot		Girvan-		https://github.com/netmode/CREDIT_FIEST
			newma		A-IO1_OC1_experiment
	ui. (2018)	FIESTA-IoT federation and	Algorith	В	
	(2010)	SmartSantandor Data			
0		Sinal (Santander Data	Huporb		
9			olic		
			embed		
	7hang		CDSCB	_	
1	et al	Internet Protocol (IP)			
0	(2022)	networks			

Theme 6: Nature

Next-generation studies should use graph theory-based community, centrality, path, and connectivity analytics to understand network structure (Hairol Anuar et al., 2024)-(Delmas et al., 2019). Recent complex network research focused on community detection in human and animal species interaction networks to understand many social phenomena (Bialek et al., 2012; Gao, 2021; Lijcklama à Nijeholt, 2020; Liu & Qiu, 2019; Ou et al., 2007; W. Zhang et al., 2019). In other kind of nature such as biodiversity, meteorological and archeological also get more attention in network analysis, refer Table 8 below.

Ceron et al., 2020 demonstrates the use of a (geo)graph approach to assess the system's community structure using radar-derived rainfall data (Ceron et al., 2020). The results suggest an influence of both digital elevation model (altimetry) and land use/land cover on the community structures. In 2023, Desai et al. employed digital elevation models (DEM) and Interferometric synthetic aperture radar (InSAR) slope and displacement snapshots for geographic information (Desai et al., 2023). Using these two data kinds, a multilayer network estimated rheology. The study tests if the community detection algorithm identified Mud

Creek's geometry and location. After achieving success, community persistence was analysed over time to create a metric that predicts failure.

The Louvain community discovery algorithm was used to the reverse slope, slope of Xiaodongcao, China. Based on reservoir water level change, Xie et al., 2022 partitioned slope deformation. The slope displacement cloud map and three ArcGIS geological geometric characteristic factor zoning maps were layered on the deformation characteristic zoning result. An open-source software called ArcGIS divides the bank slope's geological properties by elevation, slope, and aspect.

Table 8

		Dataset	Com	Sof	Link code provided /
	Auth		muni	twa	Link dataset
N	or		ty	re	
0	(Year		detec	use	
•)		tion	a	
			used		
	Акра		IVIOD	-	[https:// bigca tsind
	r and	Diadius with shares for the descent has a data at and	ularit		la. com/ tiger-
	Sarit	Biodiversity change for Landscape based dataset and	y 		census- 2018/
4	na (2024	Number of liger	maxi		
1	(2021		mizat		
)		ion		
	Cero		waik	-	-
2	n et	Meteorological Networks-Radar-Derived Rainfall at	trap		
2	al. (2020	Serrana Region of Rio de Janeiro State, Brazil			
	(2020				
_)				
3	Desai	Geophysical Satellite Data- Interferometric synthetic	GenL	-	-
	et al.	aperture radar (InSAR) in a region near the 2017 Mud	ouvai		
	(2022	Creek, California landslide	n		
)				
	Xie et		Louv	Arc	-
	al.	Reservoir Water Level in Xiaodongcao slope	ain	GIS	
4	(2022				
)				
	Peepl		Louv	R	-
	es		ain		
	and J.	Archaeological Ceramic Network Data in the U.S.			
	Bisch	Southwest/Mexican Northwest from the cyberSW project			
5	ott	online database			
	(2023				
)			010	
	Wang		• ScLo	GIS	nttps://faculty.lsu.e
	and	GIS-automated delineation of hospital service areas in Florida	uvain		du/tahui/news/202
6	Wang		• ScLei		1/book-gis-hsa- by-
	(2022		den		crc.php
1)				

						_	
Author	(Year),	Dataset an	d Communit	y Detection	Method	for Nature	Theme

In Peeples and Bischoff, 2023, the archaeologist used a huge settlement and material culture database from the U.S. Southwest/Mexican Northwest (ca. 1000–1450 CE) separated into short temporal intervals to explore material cultural similarity networks (Peeples & J. Bischoff,

2023). The work defines and evaluates key scales using Louvain community detection. Critical scales are geographic/spatial scales linked with sudden network connection changes. Critical scales are geographic scales where tiny scale changes cause substantial network property changes.

Natural integration with healthcare is possible. GIS analyses and displays spatially referenced data. It employs unique location-based data. The Florida hospital service area GIS-automated delineation research integrated the system. Since the Dartmouth Hospital Service Areas (HSAs) were developed three decades ago, significant research has examined geographic heterogeneity in U.S. health care for system effectiveness and policymaking. Applying ScLouvain and ScLeiden to network community detection (C. Wang & Wang, 2022).

Conclusion

This innovative study helps explain research trends in healthcare, social networks, telecommunications, economics, intelligence, and nature by examining the dataset used in the research context and community detection methods. The resources of the code also have been provided. As previously mentioned, this thematic review (TR) used two separate approaches when reviewing the 88 articles selected by this research. The quantitative component answers research question 1 by presenting ATLAS.ti 23 data numerically. While the second approach is the qualitative section and answer research question 2 for regarding the trends or themes of practical application in community detection that has been completed within the last seven years.

Six main themes were listed in this study as the trend patterns of community detection approaches for the various application domain in network structure. The trends of practical application in community detection shows that the descending themes that researchers used were (1) Healthcare, (2) Social Networks, (3) Telecommunication, (4) Economics, (5) Intelligent, and (6) Nature. Healthcare theme is a major area of interest within the field of community detection. And the lowest article produces from nature theme. These all fields are commonly used in community detection as a potential method to analyze and solve their problem when it is heterogeneous network. The nature theme is not a new field applying community detection, but less researcher explores.

The Louvain algorithm is commonly employed in recent studies to identify communities in network topology due to its speed, effectiveness, and simplicity, as shown by data collecting from various themes. Interestingly, as shown in the findings, we can see that the pattern varies the term of community detection depending on the field. Thus, this study has made a key contribution to the field by examining the available literature both quantitively and qualitatively, and then synthesizing that information for ease of comprehension. One recommendation is that since Leiden has outperformed Louvain since 2019, researchers can attempt using it for upcoming research.

Amazingly, China has the highest frequency of articles on publication. This review provides the interested researcher with an up-to-date and self-contained view of the existing data, the community detection used, and with the links to state-of-the-art algorithms. As a result, the outcome helps learners in network research by providing them with a short overview of the

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

goals of community detection across different domains. We can propose that in the future, community detection research on the field's natural subject be expanded upon.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by Faculty Publication Fund (FTKEK) and Centre for Research and Innovation Management (CRIM), Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Malacca (UTeM).

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest regarding the publication of this paper.

References

- Abal Abas, Z., Norizan, M. N., Zainal Abidin, Z., Abdul Rahman, A. F. N., Rahmalan, H., Ahmed Tharbe, I. H., Wan Fakhruddin, W. F. W., Mohd Zaki, N. H., & Ahmad Sobri, S. (2022). Modeling Physical Interaction and Understanding Peer Group Learning Dynamics: Graph Analytics Approach Perspective. *Mathematics*, 10(9), 1430. https://doi.org/10.3390/math10091430
- Abas, Z. A., Fadzli, A., Abdul, N., Pramudya, G., Wee, S. Y., Kasmin, F., Yusof, N., Abidin, Z. Z., & Jaya, H. T. (2020). *Analytics : A Review of Current Trends, Future Application and Challenges*. 9(I).
- Abbe, E., Baccelli, F., & Sankararaman, A. (2021). Community detection on Euclidean random graphs. *Information and Inference: A Journal of the IMA*, *10*(1), 109–160. https://doi.org/10.1093/imaiai/iaaa009
- Agapito, G., Milano, M., & Cannataro, M. (2022). Parallel Network Analysis and Communities Detection (PANC) Pipeline for the Analysis and Visualization of COVID-19 Data. *Parallel Processing Letters*, *32*(01n02). https://doi.org/10.1142/S0129626421420020
- Ahmadian, S., Rostami, M., Jalali, S. M. J., Oussalah, M., & Farrahi, V. (2022). Healthy Food Recommendation Using a Time-Aware Community Detection Approach and Reliability Measurement. *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems*, 15(1), 105. https://doi.org/10.1007/s44196-022-00168-4
- Akbar, S., & Saritha, S. K. (2021). Quantum inspired community detection for analysis of biodiversity change driven by land-use conversion and climate change. *Scientific Reports*, 11(1), 14332. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-93122-x
- Akbar, Z., Liu, J., & Latif, Z. (2021). Mining social applications network from business perspective using modularity maximization for community detection. *Social Network Analysis and Mining*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13278-021-00798-0
- Al-Mukhtar, A. F., & Al-shamery, E. S. (2019). Community detection of political blogs network based on structure-attribute graph clustering model. *International Journal of Electrical and Computer Engineering* (*IJECE*), 9(3), 2121. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijece.v9i3.pp2121-2130
- Al-sharoa, E., Al-khassaweneh, M., & Aviyente, S. (2019). Tensor Based Temporal and Multilayer Community Detection for Studying Brain Dynamics During Resting State fMRI. *IEEE Transactions on Biomedical Engineering*, 66(3), 695–709. https://doi.org/10.1109/TBME.2018.2854676
- Alcácer, V., & Cruz-Machado, V. (2019). Scanning the Industry 4.0: A Literature Review on Technologies for Manufacturing Systems. *Engineering Science and Technology, an International Journal, 22*(3), 899–919. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jestch.2019.01.006
- Alcayde, A., G. Montoya, F., Baños, R., Perea-Moreno, A.-J., & Manzano-Agugliaro, F. (2018).

Analysis of Research Topics and Scientific Collaborations in Renewable Energy UsingCommunityDetection.Sustainability,10(12),https://doi.org/10.3390/su10124510

- Alduaiji, N., Datta, A., & Li, J. (2018). Influence Propagation Model for Clique-Based Community Detection in Social Networks. *IEEE Transactions on Computational Social Systems*, 5(2), 563–575. https://doi.org/10.1109/TCSS.2018.2831694
- Basanta, C. D. L. A. C., Bazzi, M., Hijazi, M., Bessant, C., & Cutillas, P. R. (2023). Community detection in empirical kinase networks identifies new potential members of signalling pathways. *PLOS Computational Biology*, *19*(6), e1010459. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1010459
- Belli, D., Chessa, S., Foschini, L., & Girolami, M. (2020). The rhythm of the crowd: Properties of evolutionary community detection algorithms for mobile edge selection. *Pervasive and Mobile Computing*, *67*, 101231. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pmcj.2020.101231
- Bhar, A., Gierse, L. C., Meene, A., Wang, H., Karte, C., Schwaiger, T., Schröder, C., Mettenleiter, T. C., Urich, T., Riedel, K., & Kaderali, L. (2022). Application of a maximal-clique based community detection algorithm to gut microbiome data reveals driver microbes during influenza A virus infection. *Frontiers in Microbiology*, 13. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2022.979320
- Bi, X., Qiu, T., Qu, W., Zhao, L., Zhou, X., & Wu, D. O. (2021). Dynamically Transient Social Community Detection for Mobile Social Networks. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 8(3), 1282–1293. https://doi.org/10.1109/JIOT.2020.3001309
- Bialek, W., Cavagna, A., Giardina, I., Mora, T., Silvestri, E., Viale, M., & Walczak, A. M. (2012). Statistical mechanics for natural flocks of birds. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 109(13), 4786–4791. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1118633109
- Cao, J., Liu, W., Cao, B., Wang, P., Li, S., Liu, B., & Iqbal, M. (2019). Social Relationships and Temp-Spatial Behaviors Based Community Discovery to Improve Cyber Security Practices. *IEE Access*, 7, 105973–105986. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2931937
- Capponi, A., Fiandrino, C., Kantarci, B., Foschini, L., Kliazovich, D., & Bouvry, P. (2019). A Survey on Mobile Crowdsensing Systems: Challenges, Solutions, and Opportunities. *IEEE Communications Surveys and Tutorials*, *21*(3), 2419–2465. https://doi.org/10.1109/COMST.2019.2914030
- Ceron, W., Santos, L. B. L. L., Neto, G. D., Quiles, M. G., & Candido, O. A. (2020). Community Detection in Very High-Resolution Meteorological Networks. *IEEE Geoscience and Remote Sensing Letters*, 17(11), 2007–2010. https://doi.org/10.1109/LGRS.2019.2955508
- Chatterjee, S., & Sanjeev, B. S. (2023). Community detection in Epstein-Barr virus associated carcinomas and role of tyrosine kinase in etiological mechanisms for oncogenesis. *Microbial Pathogenesis*, 180(May), 106115. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.micpath.2023.106115
- Chessa, A., D'Urso, P., De Giovanni, L., Vitale, V., & Gebbia, A. (2023). Complex networks for community detection of basketball players. *Annals of Operations Research*, 325(1), 363–389. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10479-022-04647-x
- Chi, Y., Song, X., Zhou, D., Hino, K., & Tseng, B. L. (2007). Evolutionary spectral clustering by incorporating temporal smoothness. *Proceedings of the 13th ACM SIGKDD International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining*, 153–162.

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

https://doi.org/10.1145/1281192.1281212

- Chien, I. E., Lin, C.-Y. C. Y., & Wang, I.-H. H. (2019). On the Minimax Misclassification Ratio of Hypergraph Community Detection. *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, *65*(12), 8095–8118. https://doi.org/10.1109/TIT.2019.2928301
- Choudhary, C., Singh, I., & Kumar, M. (2023). Community detection algorithms for recommendation systems: techniques and metrics. *Computing*, *105*(2), 417–453. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00607-022-01131-z
- Choudhury, T., Arunachalam, R., Khanna, A., Jasinska, E., Bolshev, V., Panchenko, V., & Leonowicz, Z. (2022). A Social Network Analysis Approach to COVID-19 Community Detection Techniques. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, *19*(7). https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19073791
- Chunaev, P. (2020). Community detection in node-attributed social networks: A survey. *Computer Science Review*, *37*, 100286. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosrev.2020.100286
- Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2013). Teaching thematic analysis: Overcoming challenges and developing strategies for effective learning. *The Psychologist, 26*(2), 120–123. http://eprints.uwe.ac.uk/21155/3/Teaching thematic analysis Research Repository version.pdf
- Cotelo, J. M., Ortega, F. J., Troyano, J. A., Enriquez, F., & Cruz, F. L. (2020). Known by Who We Follow: A Biclustering Application to Community Detection. *IEEE Access*, *8*, 192218– 192228. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2020.3032015
- Daher, A., Coupechoux, M., Godlewski, P., Ngouat, P., & Minot, P. (2020). A Dynamic Clustering Algorithm for Multi-Point Transmissions in Mission-Critical Communications.
 IEEE Transactions on Wireless Communications, 19(7), 4934–4946.
 https://doi.org/10.1109/TWC.2020.2988382
- Dakiche, N., Benbouzid-Si Tayeb, F., Slimani, Y., & Benatchba, K. (2019). Tracking community evolution in social networks: A survey. *Information Processing & Management*, *56*(3), 1084–1102. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ipm.2018.03.005
- Damgacioglu, H., Celik, E., & Celik, N. (2020). Intra-Cluster Distance Minimization in DNA Methylation Analysis Using an Advanced Tabu-Based Iterative kk-Medoids Clustering Algorithm (T-CLUST). *IEEE/ACM Transactions on Computational Biology and Bioinformatics*, 17(4), 1241–1252. https://doi.org/10.1109/TCBB.2018.2886006
- De Luca, M., Fasolino, A. R., Ferraro, A., Moscato, V., Sperlí, G., & Tramontana, P. (2023). A community detection approach based on network representation learning for repository mining. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 231(September 2022), 120597. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2023.120597
- Delmas, E., Besson, M., Brice, M. H., Burkle, L. A., Dalla Riva, G. V., Fortin, M. J., Gravel, D., Guimarães, P. R., Hembry, D. H., Newman, E. A., Olesen, J. M., Pires, M. M., Yeakel, J. D., & Poisot, T. (2019). Analysing ecological networks of species interactions. *Biological Reviews*, 94(1), 16–36. https://doi.org/10.1111/brv.12433
- Desai, V. D., Fazelpour, F., Handwerger, A. L., & Daniels, K. E. (2023). Forecasting landslides using community detection on geophysical satellite data. *Physical Review E*, *108*(1), 014901. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.108.014901
- Dey, A. K., Tian, Y., & Gel, Y. R. (2022). Community detection in complex networks: From statistical foundations to data science applications. *WIREs Computational Statistics*, 14(2), 1–27. https://doi.org/10.1002/wics.1566
- Ding, R., Fu, J., Du, Y., Du, L., Zhou, T., Zhang, Y., Shen, S., Zhu, Y., & Chen, S. (2022). Structural Evolution and Community Detection of China Rail Transit Route Network. *Sustainability*,

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

14(19), 12342. https://doi.org/10.3390/su141912342

- Doluca, O., & Oğuz, K. (2021). APAL: Adjacency Propagation Algorithm for overlapping community detection in biological networks. *Information Sciences*, *579*, 574–590. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ins.2021.08.031
- Elhishi, S., Abu-Elkheir, M., & Abou Elfetouh, A. (2019). Perspectives on the evolution of online communities. *Behaviour & Information Technology*, 38(6), 592–608. https://doi.org/10.1080/0144929X.2018.1546901
- Essaid, M., & Ju, H. (2022). Deep Learning-Based Community Detection Approach on Bitcoin Network. *Systems*, *10*(6), 203. https://doi.org/10.3390/systems10060203
- Evans, J. C., Lindholm, A. K., & König, B. (2022). Family dynamics reveal that female house mice preferentially breed in their maternal community. *Behavioral Ecology*, *33*(1), 222–232. https://doi.org/10.1093/beheco/arab128
- Fernandes, A., Gonçalves, P. C. T., Campos, P., & Delgado, C. (2019a). Centrality and community detection: a co-marketing multilayer network. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 34(8), 1749–1762. https://doi.org/10.1108/JBIM-11-2017-0266
- Fernandes, A., Gonçalves, P. C. T. T., Campos, P., & Delgado, C. (2019b). Centrality and community detection: a co-marketing multilayer network. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 34(8), 1749–1762. https://doi.org/10.1108/JBIM-11-2017-0266
- Folino, F., & Pizzuti, C. (2014). An Evolutionary Multiobjective Approach for Community Discovery in Dynamic Networks. *IEEE Transactions on Knowledge and Data Engineering*, 26(8), 1838–1852. https://doi.org/10.1109/TKDE.2013.131
- Fortunato, S. (2010). Community detection in graphs. *Physics Reports*, 486(3–5), 75–174. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physrep.2009.11.002
- Fortunato, S., & Hric, D. (2016). Community detection in networks: A user guide. *Physics Reports*, *659*, 1–44. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physrep.2016.09.002
- Gaber, A., Abdelbaki, N., & Arafa, T. (2023). Community Detection Applications in Mobile Networks: Towards Data-Driven Design for Next Generation Cellular Networks. *Journal* of Communications and Information Networks, 8(2), 155–163. https://doi.org/10.23919/JCIN.2023.10173731

Gao, J. (2021). Tree structures are employed by pigeons as leadership structures to ock. 0–8. https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-1000239/v1

- Grant, W. P., & Ahnert, S. E. (2019). Modular decomposition of protein structure using community detection. *Journal of Complex Networks*, 7(1), 101–113. https://doi.org/10.1093/comnet/cny014
- Grassi, R., Bartesaghi, P., Benati, S., & Clemente, G. P. (2021). Multi-Attribute Community Detection in International Trade Network. *Networks and Spatial Economics*, *21*(3), 707– 733. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11067-021-09547-4
- Gu, K., Liu, D., & Wang, K. (2019). Social Community Detection Scheme Based on Social-Aware
 in Mobile Social Networks. *IEEE Access*, 7, 173407–173418.
 https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2956149
- Guo, Y., Yang, L., Hao, S., & Gao, J. (2019). Dynamic identification of urban traffic congestion warning communities in heterogeneous networks. *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and Its Applications*, *522*, 98–111. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2019.01.139
- Gupta, P., & Sharma, K. (2017). Review paper on various clustering schemes. 2017 IEEE International Conference on Smart Technologies and Management for Computing, Communication, Controls, Energy and Materials (ICSTM), 37(August), 44–48. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICSTM.2017.8089125

- Haghbayan, S. A., Geroliminis, N., & Akbarzadeh, M. (2021). Community detection in large scale congested urban road networks. *PLOS ONE*, *16*(11), e0260201. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0260201
- Hairol Anuar, S. H., Abal Abas, Z., Md Yunos, N., Mukhtar, M. F., Setiadi, T., & Shibghatullah,
 A. S. (2024). Identifying Communities with Modularity Metric Using Louvain and Leiden
 Algorithms. *Pertanika Journal of Science and Technology*, 32(3), 1285–1300.
 https://doi.org/10.47836/pjst.32.3.16
- Hairol Anuar, S. H., Abas, Z. A., Yunos, N. M., Mohd Zaki, N. H., Hashim, N. A., Mokhtar, M. F., Asmai, S. A., Abidin, Z. Z., & Nizam, A. F. (2021). Comparison between Louvain and Leiden Algorithm for Network Structure: A Review. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 2129(1), 012028. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/2129/1/012028
- Han, X., Huangpeng, Q., Duan, X., Gao, Q., & Yin, Y. (2022). Intentional controlled islanding based on dynamic community detection for power grid. *IET Generation, Transmission & Distribution*, *16*(21), 4258–4272. https://doi.org/10.1049/gtd2.12591
- Han, Z., Mo, R., Yang, H., & Hao, L. (2018). Module partition for mechanical CAD assembly model based on multi-source correlation information and community detection. *Journal* of Advanced Mechanical Design, Systems, and Manufacturing, 12(1), JAMDSM0023– JAMDSM0023. https://doi.org/10.1299/jamdsm.2018jamdsm0023
- Heinz, B., & Henkel, J. (2012). Balancing wind energy and participating in electricity markets with a fuel cell population. *Energy*, 48(1), 188–195. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2012.07.002
- Huang, L., Yang, Y., Gao, H., Zhao, X., & Du, Z. (2018). Comparing Community Detection Algorithms in Transport Networks via Points of Interest. *IEEE Access*, *6*, 29729–29738. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2018.2841321
- Irsyad, A., & Rakhmawati, N. A. (2019). Community detection in twitter based on tweets similarities in indonesian using cosine similarity and louvain algorithms. *Register: Jurnal Ilmiah Teknologi Sistem Informasi, 6*(1), 22. https://doi.org/10.26594/register.v6i1.1595
- Javed, M. A., Younis, M. S., Latif, S., Qadir, J., & Baig, A. (2018). Community detection in networks: A multidisciplinary review. *Journal of Network and Computer Applications*, *108*(January), 87–111. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jnca.2018.02.011
- Javed, S., Mahmood, A., Werghi, N., Benes, K., & Rajpoot, N. (2020). Multiplex Cellular Communities in Multi-Gigapixel Colorectal Cancer Histology Images for Tissue Phenotyping. *IEEE Transactions on Image Processing*, 29, 9204–9219. https://doi.org/10.1109/TIP.2020.3023795
- Jiang, C., Wan, J., & Abbas, H. (2021). An Edge Computing Node Deployment Method Based on Improved k -Means Clustering Algorithm for Smart Manufacturing. *IEEE Systems Journal*, 15(2), 2230–2240. https://doi.org/10.1109/JSYST.2020.2986649
- Jiang, L., Shi, L., Liu, L., Yao, J., Yuan, B., & Zheng, Y. (2019). An Efficient Evolutionary User Interest Community Discovery Model in Dynamic Social Networks for Internet of People. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*, 6(6), 9226–9236. https://doi.org/10.1109/JIOT.2019.2893625
- Jiang, Z., Chen, X., Dong, B., Zhang, J., Gong, J., Yan, H., Zhang, Z., Ma, J., & Yu, P. S. (2020). Trajectory-Based Community Detection. *IEEE Transactions on Circuits and Systems II: Express Briefs*, 67(6), 1139–1143. https://doi.org/10.1109/TCSII.2019.2933337
- Jin, C., Jin, R., Chen, K., & Dou, Y. (2018). A Community Detection Approach to Cleaning Extremely Large Face Database. *Computational Intelligence and Neuroscience*, 2018, 1– 10. https://doi.org/10.1155/2018/4512473

- Jin, D., Li, R., & Xu, J. (2020). Multiscale Community Detection in Functional Brain Networks Constructed Using Dynamic Time Warping. *IEEE Transactions on Neural Systems and Rehabilitation Engineering*, 28(1), 52–61. https://doi.org/10.1109/TNSRE.2019.2948055
- Kabir, K., Hassan, L., Rajabi, Z., Akhter, N., & Shehu, A. (2019). Graph-Based Community Detection for Decoy Selection in Template-Free Protein Structure Prediction. *Molecules*, 24(5), 854. https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules24050854
- Kadkhoda Mohammadmosaferi, K., & Naderi, H. (2020). Evolution of communities in dynamic social networks: An efficient map-based approach. *Expert Systems with Applications*, *147*, 113221. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2020.113221
- Kannan, S. N., Mannathazhathu, S. E., & Raghavan, R. (2022). A novel compression based community detection approach using hybrid honey badger African vulture optimization for online social networks. *Concurrency and Computation: Practice and Experience*, 34(23). https://doi.org/10.1002/cpe.7205
- Karaaslanli, A., Ortiz-Bouza, M., Munia, T. T. K., & Aviyente, S. (2023). Community detection in multi-frequency EEG networks. *Scientific Reports*, *13*(1), 8114. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-023-35232-2
- Karatas, A., & Sahin, S. (2018). Application Areas of Community Detection: A Review. 2018 International Congress on Big Data, Deep Learning and Fighting Cyber Terrorism (IBIGDELFT), ii, 65–70. https://doi.org/10.1109/IBIGDELFT.2018.8625349
- Karyotis, V., Tsitseklis, K., Sotiropoulos, K., & Papavassiliou, S. (2018). Big Data Clustering via Community Detection and Hyperbolic Network Embedding in IoT Applications. *Sensors*, *18*(4), 1205. https://doi.org/10.3390/s18041205
- Kramer, J., Boone, L., Clifford, T., Bruce, J., & Matta, J. (2020). Analysis of Medical Data Using Community Detection on Inferred Networks. *IEEE Journal of Biomedical and Health Informatics*, 24(11), 3136–3143. https://doi.org/10.1109/JBHI.2020.3003827
- Lancichinetti, A., & Fortunato, S. (2009). Community detection algorithms: A comparative analysis. *Physical Review E*, *80*(5), 056117. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.80.056117
- Li, J., Li, X., Gao, Y., Yuan, J., & Fang, B. (2018). Dynamic Trustworthiness Overlapping Community Discovery in Mobile Internet of Things. *IEEE Access*, *6*, 74579–74597. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2018.2884002
- Li, Q., Liu, Y., Zhu, J., Xiao, Y., Wu, H., Liu, X., Chen, Z., & Zhai, S. (2019). ANDERATION: A New Anti-Community Detection Algorithm and its Application to Explore Incompatibility of Traditional Chinese Medicine. *IEEE Access*, 7, 113975–113987. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2934227
- Li, S., Zhao, C., Li, Q., Huang, J., Zhao, D., & Zhu, P. (2023). BotFinder: a novel framework for social bots detection in online social networks based on graph embedding and community detection. World Wide Web, 26(4), 1793–1809. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11280-022-01114-2
- Li, Z., Li, Y., Lu, W., & Huang, J. (2020). Crowdsourcing Logistics Pricing Optimization Model Based on DBSCAN Clustering Algorithm. *IEEE Access*, *8*, 1–1. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2020.2995063
- Lijcklama à Nijeholt, D. (2020). Control for Cooperative Autonomous Driving Inspired by Bird Flocking Behavior.
- Lin, D., & Wang, Q. (2019). An Energy-Efficient Clustering Algorithm Combined Game Theory and Dual-Cluster-Head Mechanism for WSNs. *IEEE Access*, 7, 49894–49905. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2911190
- Liu, X., Ding, N., Fiumara, G., De Meo, P., & Ficara, A. (2022). Dynamic Community Discovery

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

Method Based on Phylogenetic Planted Partition in Temporal Networks. *Applied Sciences*, *12*(8), 3795. https://doi.org/10.3390/app12083795

- Liu, X., & Qiu, L. (2019). Bird Flocking Inspired Control Strategy for Multi-UAV Collective Motion. 1, 1–7. http://arxiv.org/abs/1912.00168
- Lu, Z., & Dong, Z. (2023). A Gravitation-Based Hierarchical Community Detection Algorithm for Structuring Supply Chain Network. *International Journal of Computational Intelligence Systems*, *16*(1), 110. https://doi.org/10.1007/s44196-023-00290-x
- Malekshahi Rad, M., Rahmani, A. M., Sahafi, A., & Qader, N. N. (2023). Community detection and service discovery on Social Internet of Things. *International Journal of Communication Systems*, *36*(11). https://doi.org/10.1002/dac.5501
- Mark Needham, A. E. H. (2021). Graph algorithms Practical examples in Apache Spark and Neo4j. In *O'reilly*. Neo4j.
- Meena, P., Pawar, M., & Pandey, A. (2021). A Survey on Community Detection Algorithm and Its Applications. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education*, *12*(6), 4807– 4815.
- Milano, M., & Cannataro, M. (2020). Statistical and Network-Based Analysis of Italian COVID-19 Data: Communities Detection and Temporal Evolution. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 17(12), 4182. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17124182
- Mnea, A., & Zairul, M. (2023). Evaluating the Impact of Housing Interior Design on Elderly Independence and Activity: A Thematic Review. *Buildings*, *13*(4), 1099. https://doi.org/10.3390/buildings13041099
- Mohd Zairul. (2021). A thematic Review on Industrialised Building System (IBS) Publications from 2015-2019: Analysis of Patterns and Trends for Future Studies of IBS in Malaysia. *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 29(1), 635–652. https://doi.org/10.47836/pjssh.29.1.35
- Montes-Orozco, E., Mora-Gutiérrez, R. A., De-Los-Cobos-Silva, S. G., Bernal-Jaquez, R., Rincón-García, E. A., Gutiérrez-Andrade, M. A., & Lara-Velázquez, P. (2023). Communities Detection in Multiplex Networks Using Optimization: Study Case—Employment in Mexico during the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Complexity*, 2023, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/9011738
- Moradi, S., Mohasefi, J. B., & Mahdipour, E. (2021). MSN-CDF: New community detection framework to improve routing in mobile social networks. *International Journal of Communication Systems*, 34(18). https://doi.org/10.1002/dac.4989
- Moscato, V., & Sperlì, G. (2022). Community detection over feature-rich information networks: An eHealth case study. *Information Systems*, *109*, 102092. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.is.2022.102092
- Mueller, J. M., Pritschet, L., Santander, T., Taylor, C. M., Grafton, S. T., Jacobs, E. G., & Carlson, J. M. (2021). Dynamic community detection reveals transient reorganization of functional brain networks across a female menstrual cycle. *Network Neuroscience*, 5(1), 125–144. https://doi.org/10.1162/netn_a_00169
- Mukhtar, M. F., Abal Abas, Z., Baharuddin, A. S., Norizan, M. N., Fakhruddin, W. F. W. W., Minato, W., Rasib, A. H. A., Abidin, Z. Z., Rahman, A. F. N. A., & Anuar, S. H. H. (2023). Integrating local and global information to identify influential nodes in complex networks. *Scientific Reports*, *13*(1), 11411. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-023-37570-7
- Mukhtar, M. F., Abas, Z. A., Rasib, A. H. A., Anuar, S. H. H., Zaki, N. H. M., Abidin, Z. Z., Asmai,

S. A., & Rahman, A. F. N. A. (2023). Graph analytics' centrality measurement in supply chain. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 060001. https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0148751

- Mukhtar, M. F., Abas, Z. A., Rasib, A. H. A., Anuar, S. H. H., Zaki, N. H. M., Rahman, A. F. N. A., Abidin, Z. Z., & Shibghatullah, A. S. (2023). Hybrid Global Structure Model for Unraveling Influential Nodes in Complex Networks. *International Journal of Advanced Computer Science* and *Applications*, 14(6), 724–730. https://doi.org/10.14569/IJACSA.2023.0140677
- Naik, D., Ramesh, D., Gandomi, A. H., & Babu Gorojanam, N. (2022). Parallel and distributed paradigms for community detection in social networks: A methodological review. *Expert Systems with Applications, 187*(October 2020), 115956. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2021.115956
- Nallusamy, K., & Easwarakumar, K. S. (2023). Classifying schizophrenic and controls from fMRI data using graph theoretic framework and community detection. *Network Modeling Analysis in Health Informatics and Bioinformatics*, 12(1), 19. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13721-023-00415-4
- Nicolini, C., Bordier, C., & Bifone, A. (2017a). Community detection in weighted brain connectivity networks beyond the resolution limit. *NeuroImage*, *146*(October 2016), 28–39. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2016.11.026
- Nicolini, C., Bordier, C., & Bifone, A. (2017b). Community detection in weighted brain connectivity networks beyond the resolution limit. *NeuroImage*, *146*, 28–39. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2016.11.026
- Ou, Q., Jin, Y. Di, Zhou, T., Wang, B. H., & Yin, B. Q. (2007). Power-law strength-degree correlation from resource-allocation dynamics on weighted networks. *Physical Review E Statistical, Nonlinear, and Soft Matter Physics, 75*(2), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.75.021102
- Park, J.-H., & Kwon, H.-Y. (2022). Cyberattack detection model using community detection and text analysis on social media. *ICT Express*, *8*(4), 499–506. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icte.2021.12.003
- Park, J. H., & Kwon, H. Y. (2022). Cyberattack detection model using community detection and text analysis on social media. *ICT Express*, *8*(4), 499–506. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icte.2021.12.003
- Peeples, M. A., & J. Bischoff, R. (2023). Archaeological networks, community detection, and critical scales of interaction in the U.S. Southwest/Mexican Northwest. *Journal of Anthropological Archaeology*, 70(March), 101511. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaa.2023.101511
- Pereira, L. R., Lopes, R. J., & Louçã, J. (2021). Community identity in a temporal network: A taxonomy proposal. *Ecological Complexity*, 45(December 2020), 100904. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecocom.2020.100904
- Qi, Q., & Cao, J. (2023). METHODS: A meta-path-based method for heterogeneous community detection in the open source software ecosystem. *Information and Software Technology*, *162*(November 2022), 107271. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.infsof.2023.107271
- Rahiminejad, S., Maurya, M. R., & Subramaniam, S. (2019). Topological and functional comparison of community detection algorithms in biological networks. *BMC Bioinformatics*, 20(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12859-019-2746-0
- Reddy, V., Kolli, N., & Balakrishnan, N. (2021). Malware detection and classification using community detection and social network analysis. *Journal of Computer Virology and Hacking Techniques*, 17(4), 333–346. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11416-021-00387-x

- Rostami, M., Farrahi, V., Ahmadian, S., Mohammad Jafar Jalali, S., & Oussalah, M. (2023). A novel healthy and time-aware food recommender system using attributed community detection. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 221(November 2022), 119719. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2023.119719
- Saggese, F., Moretti, M., & Abrardo, A. (2020). A Quasi-Optimal Clustering Algorithm for MIMO-NOMA Downlink Systems. *IEEE Wireless Communications Letters*, *9*(2), 152–156. https://doi.org/10.1109/LWC.2019.2946548
- Samsudin, N. S., Mohammad, M. Z., Khalil, N., Nadzri, N. D., & Izam Che Ibrahim, C. K. (2022). A thematic review on Prevention through design (PtD) concept application in the construction industry of developing countries. *Safety Science*, *148*(July 2021), 105640. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssci.2021.105640
- Sangaiah, A. K., Rezaei, S., Javadpour, A., & Zhang, W. (2023). Explainable AI in big data intelligence of community detection for digitalization e-healthcare services. *Applied Soft Computing*, *136*, 110119. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2023.110119
- Shahruddin, S., Zairul, M., & Haron, A. T. (2020). Redefining the territory and competency of architectural practitioners within a BIM-based environment: a systematic review. *Architectural Engineering and Design Management*, 0(0), 1–35. https://doi.org/10.1080/17452007.2020.1768506
- Shrifan, N. H. M. M., Jawad, G. N., Isa, N. A. M., & Akbar, M. F. (2021). Microwave Nondestructive Testing for Defect Detection in Composites Based on K-Means Clustering Algorithm. *IEEE Access*, *9*, 4820–4828. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2020.3048147
- Singhal, A., Cao, S., Churas, C., Pratt, D., Fortunato, S., Zheng, F., & Ideker, T. (2020). Multiscale community detection in Cytoscape. *PLOS Computational Biology*, 16(10), e1008239. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1008239
- Su, X., Xue, S., Liu, F., Wu, J., Yang, J., Zhou, C., Hu, W., Paris, C., Nepal, S., Jin, D., Sheng, Q. Z., & Yu, P. S. (2024). A Comprehensive Survey on Community Detection With Deep Learning. *IEEE Transactions on Neural Networks and Learning Systems*, Xx, 1–21. https://doi.org/10.1109/TNNLS.2021.3137396
- Subbian, K., Aggarwal, C., & Srivastava, J. (2016). Mining influencers using information flows in social streams. *ACM Transactions on Knowledge Discovery from Data*, 10(3). https://doi.org/10.1145/2815625
- Talib, M. S., Hassan, A., Alamery, T., Abas, Z. A., Mohammed, A. A.-J. J., Ibrahim, A. J., & Abdullah, N. I. (2020). A center-based stable evolving clustering algorithm with grid partitioning and extended mobility features for VANETs. *IEEE Access*, *8*, 169908–169921. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2020.3020510
- Torene, S., Follmann, A., Teague, T., Chang, P., & Howald, B. (2022). Automated Hashtag Hierarchy Generation Using Community Detection and the Shannon Diversity Index, with Applications to Twitter and Parler. *International Journal of Semantic Computing*, *16*(04), 473–496. https://doi.org/10.1142/S1793351X22500052
- Wang, C., & Wang, F. (2022). GIS-automated delineation of hospital service areas in Florida: from Dartmouth method to network community detection methods. *Annals of GIS*, 28(2), 93–109. https://doi.org/10.1080/19475683.2022.2026470
- Wang, J., & Paschalidis, I. C. (2017). Botnet Detection Based on Anomaly and Community Detection. *IEEE Transactions on Control of Network Systems*, 4(2), 392–404. https://doi.org/10.1109/TCNS.2016.2532804
- Wang, J., Zhou, C., Rong, J., Liu, S., & Wang, Y. (2022). Community-detection-based spatial range identification for assessing bilateral jobs-housing balance: The case of Beijing.

Sustainable Cities and Society, 87(September), 104179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2022.104179

- Wang, T., Guo, J., Shan, Y., Zhang, Y., Peng, B., & Wu, Z. (2023). A knowledge graph–GCN– community detection integrated model for large-scale stock price prediction. *Applied Soft Computing*, *145*, 110595. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2023.110595
- White, S., & Smyth, P. (2005). A spectral clustering approach to finding communities in graphs. *Proceedings of the 2005 SIAM International Conference on Data Mining, SDM 2005,* 274–285. https://doi.org/10.1137/1.9781611972757.25
- Wu, J., Wang, Y., Shafiee, S., & Zhang, D. (2021). Discovery of associated consumer demands: Construction of a co-demanded product network with community detection. *Expert Systems with Applications*, *178*, 115038. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2021.115038
- Wu, S. X., Wu, Z., Chen, S., Li, G., & Zhang, S. (2021). Community Detection in Blockchain Social Networks. *Journal of Communications and Information Networks*, 6(1), 59–71. https://doi.org/10.23919/JCIN.2021.9387705
- Wu, W., Zhang, H., Zhang, S., & Witlox, F. (2019). Community Detection in Airline Networks: An Empirical Analysis of American vs. Southwest Airlines. *Journal of Advanced Transportation*, 2019, 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1155/2019/3032015
- Xie, L., Cui, J., Qin, Y., & Qiu, L. (2022). Analysis of deformation characteristics of reverse slope under the influence of reservoir water based on community detection. *Environmental Earth Sciences*, 81(4), 110. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12665-022-10252-9
- Xue, C., Wu, S., Zhang, Q., & Shao, F. (2019a). An incremental group-specific framework based on community detection for cold start recommendation. *IEEE Access*, 7, 112363–112374. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2935090
- Xue, C., Wu, S., Zhang, Q., & Shao, F. (2019b). An Incremental Group-Specific Framework Based on Community Detection for Cold Start Recommendation. *IEEE Access*, 7, 112363– 112374. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2935090
- Xueshuo, X., Jiming, W., Junyi, Y., Yaozheng, F., Ye, L., Tao, L., & Guiling, W. (2021). AWAP: Adaptive weighted attribute propagation enhanced community detection model for bitcoin de-anonymization. *Applied Soft Computing*, 109, 107507. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2021.107507
- Yan, Y., & Yang, Y. (2023). Community detection for New York stock market by SCORE-CCD. Computational Statistics, 38(3), 1255–1282. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00180-022-01245-0
- Yang, B., Huang, X., Cheng, W., Huang, T., & Li, X. (2022). Discrete bacterial foraging optimization for community detection in networks. *Future Generation Computer Systems*, 128, 192–204. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.future.2021.10.015
- Yang, H., & Le, M. (2021). High-Order Community Detection in the Air Transport Industry: A Comparative Analysis among 10 Major International Airlines. *Applied Sciences*, 11(20), 9378. https://doi.org/10.3390/app11209378
- Yang, Y., Sun, Y., Wang, Q., Liu, F., & Zhu, L. (2022). Fast Power Grid Partition for Voltage Control With Balanced-Depth-Based Community Detection Algorithm. *IEEE Transactions* on Power Systems, 37(2), 1612–1622. https://doi.org/10.1109/TPWRS.2021.3107847
- Yaqoob, A. F., & Al-Sarray, B. (2020). Community detection under stochastic block model likelihood optimization via tabu search –Fuzzy C-mean method for social network data. *Iraqi Journal of Science*, *61*(10), 2695–2704. https://doi.org/10.24996/ijs.2020.61.10.27
- Zairul, M. (2022). Opening the pandora's box of issues in the industrialised building system (ibs) in malaysia: A thematic review. *Journal of Applied Science and Engineering (Taiwan)*,

25(2), 297-310. https://doi.org/10.6180/jase.202204_25(2).0006

- Zairul, M., Azli, M., & Azlan, A. (2023). Defying tradition or maintaining the status quo? Moving towards a new hybrid architecture studio education to support blended learning post-COVID-19. International Jouranl of Architectural Research: Archnet-IJAR. https://doi.org/10.1108/ARCH-11-2022-0251
- Zairul, M., Mohd Zairul, & Zairul, M. (2020). A thematic review on student-centred learning in the studio education. *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 7(2), 504–511. https://doi.org/10.31838/jcr.07.02.95
- Zairul, M., & Zaremohzzabieh, Z. (2023). Thematic Trends in Industry 4.0 Revolution Potential towards Sustainability in the Construction Industry. *Sustainability*, *15*(9), 7720. https://doi.org/10.3390/su15097720
- Zakaria, A., & Isa, N. M. (2022). THEMATIC REVIEW ON ISLAMIC DESIGN QUALITY IN. 7(27), 417–429. https://doi.org/10.35631/JTHEM.727033.This
- Zhang, C., Zheng, B., & Tsung, F. (2023). Multi-view metro station clustering based on passenger flows: a functional data-edged network community detection approach. *Data Mining and Knowledge Discovery*, *37*(3), 1154–1208. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10618-023-00916-w
- Zhang, Q., Tan, V. Y. F. F., & Suh, C. (2021). Community Detection and Matrix Completion with Social and Item Similarity Graphs. *IEEE Transactions on Signal Processing*, *69*, 917–931. https://doi.org/10.1109/TSP.2021.3052033
- Zhang, S., Zhang, Y., Zhou, M., & Peng, L. (2022). Community detection based on similarities of communication behavior in IP networks. *Journal of Ambient Intelligence and Humanized Computing*, 13(3), 1451–1461. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12652-020-02681w
- Zhang, W., Zhang, R., Shang, R., Li, J., & Jiao, L. (2019). Application of natural computation inspired method in community detection. *Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and Its Applications*, *515*, 130–150. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2018.09.186
- Zhang, Y., Liu, Y., Zhu, J., Zhai, S., Jin, R., & Wen, C. (2020). A Semantic Analysis and Community Detection-Based Artificial Intelligence Model for Core Herb Discovery from the Literature: Taking Chronic Glomerulonephritis Treatment as a Case Study. *Computational and Mathematical Methods in Medicine*, 2020, 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1155/2020/1862168
- Zhang, Y., Pan, R., Wang, H., & Su, H. (2023). Community detection in attributed collaboration network for statisticians. *Stat*, *12*(1). https://doi.org/10.1002/sta4.507
- Zhang, Y., Wu, B., Ning, N., Song, C., & Lv, J. (2019). Dynamic Topical Community Detection in Social Network: A Generative Model Approach. *IEEE Access*, 7, 74528–74541. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2921824
- Zhao, Y., Chen, B. Y., Gao, F., & Zhu, X. (2023). Dynamic community detection considering daily rhythms of human mobility. *Travel Behaviour and Society*, *31*(December 2022), 209–222. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tbs.2022.12.009
- Zhou, Z., Chen, B., Chen, S., Lin, M., Chen, Y., Jin, S., Chen, W., & Zhang, Y. (2020). Applications of Network Pharmacology in Traditional Chinese Medicine Research. *Evidence-Based Complementary* and *Alternative Medicine*, 2020, 1–7. https://doi.org/10.1155/2020/1646905
- Zhu, Y., Liu, J., & Cong, F. (2023). Dynamic Community Detection for Brain Functional Networks During Music Listening With Block Component Analysis. *IEEE Transactions on Neural Systems and Rehabilitation Engineering*, 31(Xx), 2438–2447.

Vol. 14, No. 10, 2024, E-ISSN: 2222-6990 © 2024

https://doi.org/10.1109/TNSRE.2023.3277509

- Zhuo, L., Chen, Y., Song, B., Liu, Y., & Su, Y. (2022). A model for predicting ncRNA–protein interactions based on graph neural networks and community detection. *Methods*, 207(September 2022), 74–80. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ymeth.2022.09.001
- Zu, J., Hu, G., Yan, J., & Tang, S. (2021). A community detection based approach for Service Function Chain online placement in data center network. *Computer Communications*, 169, 168–178. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.comcom.2021.01.014